

The International Law of Development-Induced Displacement

DISSERTATION
of the University of St.Gallen,
Graduate School of Business Administration,
Economics, Law and Social Sciences (HSG)
to obtain the title of
Doctor of Law

submitted by

Rekha Oleschak
from
India

Approved on the application of

Prof. Dr. Juliane Kokott
and
Prof. Dr. Kerstin Odendahl

Dissertation no. 3471

NiedermannDruck AG, St.Gallen 2009

Table of Contents

Table of Contents	i
Abbreviations and Acronyms	v
Abstract	viii
1 Introduction	2
1.1 Setting out the Problems	2
1.1.1 Objectives and Hypotheses	4
1.1.2 Fragmentation of International Law and its Relevance to Development-Induced Displacement	7
1.2 Toward a Definition of Development-Induced Displacement	9
1.2.1 Definition in Legal Theory	10
1.2.2 Definition of Development-Induced Displacement	10
1.2.2.1 Basis of the Definition	10
1.2.2.2 The Proposed Definition	14
1.3 Theoretical Framework and Methodology	14
1.3.1 Theoretical Framework	14
1.3.1.1 Positivism	14
1.3.1.2 The Relevance of Soft-Law	17
1.3.2 Methodology	18
1.3.3 Structure	18
2 Contextualising Development-Induced Displacement: The Non-legal Aspects	21
2.1 The Consequences of Development-Induced Displacement: A Sociological View	21
2.2 Failure of Resettlement Programmes	23
2.3 The Politics and Ethics of Development-Induced Displacement	25
2.4 Resistance to Development-Induced Displacement	29
2.5 Resistance to Resistance Movements: Nationalism	31
2.6 New Approaches to 'Development'	32
2.7 Trends in Infrastructure Development	33
2.8 Interim Observations	35
3 Development-Induced Displacement in India	36
3.1 Nature, Extent and Prevalence of Development-Induced Displacement	36
3.2 The Projects	37
3.2.1 Sardar Sarovar Project	37
3.2.1.1 The Political Battle	38
3.2.1.2 The Legal Battle	39

3.2.1.3	International Involvement	43
3.2.2	India Ecodevelopment Project: Nagarhole National Park	45
3.3	Legal Issues Relating to Development-Induced Displacement in India	49
3.3.1	Laws relating to Land Acquisition	49
3.3.2	The Right to Property	51
3.3.3	Rehabilitation Laws and Policies	52
3.3.4	Laws Relating to Indigenous Peoples	53
3.3.5	Environmental Legislation	55
3.4	Gaps in Protection: An Overview	57
4	The Displacement Regime	60
4.1	The International Refugee Regime	60
4.2	Internal Displacement Regime	61
4.2.1	The Guiding Principles on Internal Displacement	62
4.2.1.1	Legal Character of the Principles	62
4.2.1.2	Legal Norms Enumerated in the Guiding Principles	63
4.2.2	Applicability of the Guiding Principles to 'Development-Displacees'	65
4.3	Gaps in Protection for Development-Displacees in the Refugee /IDP regime	68
5	Displacement in the Humanitarian and International Criminal Law Regimes	69
5.1	Displacement in the Context of International Humanitarian and International Criminal Law	69
5.2	Development-Induced and the Prohibition of Genocide	70
5.2.1	Case Study: The Maya Achi Indians and the Chixoy Dam in Guatemala	75
5.2.2	Case-Study: The Marsh Arabs and the Drainage & Damming Programmes in Iraq	77
6	Displacement in the Context of Human Rights Law	80
6.1	General Framework of Human Rights in International Law	80
6.2	Human Rights Law Applicable in the Context of Development Projects	82
6.2.1	The Right to Self-Determination	83
6.2.1.1	The Rights of Peoples	84
6.2.1.2	The Scope of Self-Determination	86
6.2.1.3	Permanent Sovereignty over Natural Resources	88
6.2.2	The Right to Development	92
6.2.2.1	Development of the Right to Development	92
6.2.2.2	Scope of the Right to Development	95
6.2.2.3	Interim Findings: Conflict of Rights: Rights of the Displaced to Development versus the Right of the other Sections of the Society?	97
6.2.3	The Right to Life	99
6.2.4	Right to Freedom of Movement and Residence	101

6.2.4.1	Restrictions on the Freedom of Movement	102
6.2.4.2	Forced Relocations: A Violation of International Law?	104
6.2.5	Right to Property	106
6.2.6	Right to Housing and Forced Evictions	113
6.2.6.1	The Right to Adequate Housing	113
6.2.6.2	Forced Evictions	116
6.2.7	Poverty as a Violation of Human Rights	121
6.2.8	Indigenous Peoples	123
6.2.8.1	Indigenous Peoples in International Law	124
6.2.8.2	Indigenous Peoples and Development	127
6.2.8.3	Indigenous Peoples and Rights to Land	129
6.2.8.4	Interim Findings	132
6.2.9	A Right Not to be Displaced?	133
6.3	Gaps in Protection in the Human Rights Regime	134
6.3.1	State Responsibility for Human Rights Violations: Problems	135
6.3.2	Lack of Complaint Mechanisms	137
6.3.3	Problems with Progressive Implementation of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights and the 'Violations Approach'	138
7	International Environmental Law Regime	142
7.1	International Norms Relating to Environmental Protection	142
7.1.1	Applicability of International Environmental Law to Development Projects	142
7.1.1.1	Sustainable Development and Development-Induced Displacement	143
7.1.1.2	The Duty to Prevent, Reduce and Control Environmental Harm	146
7.1.1.3	The Precautionary Principle	147
7.1.1.4	The Duty to Assess Environmental Impacts	148
7.1.2	Interaction between Environmental Law and Human Rights: The Case of Development Projects	149
7.1.2.1	The Substantive Right: A Human Right to Environment	152
7.1.2.2	The Procedural Right: Right to Information and Participation	156
7.2	Gaps in Protection	160
8	The International Development Law Regime	162
8.1	Actors in International Development Law	162
8.1.1	Multilateral Development Banks (MDBs)	163
8.1.2	Export Credit Agencies and Investment Insurance Agencies (ECAs and IIAs)	163
8.1.3	Private Financial Institutions	164
8.1.4	Transnational Corporations and Other Business Enterprises	165
8.2	Substantive Law Concerning Development-Induced Displacement	166

8.2.1	Creation of International Law by International Institutions	166
8.2.1.1	The World Bank's 'Operational Standards'	168
8.2.1.2	Safeguard Policies	169
8.2.2	Other International Standards	172
8.2.2.1	The Equator Principles	172
8.2.2.2	OECD Guidelines for Multinational Enterprises	173
8.2.2.3	Human Rights Conditionality in Development Aid	175
8.2.3	Implementation of Standards: Grievance Redressal Mechanisms	176
8.2.3.1	The World Bank's Inspection Panel	176
8.2.3.2	OECD National Contact Points	179
8.2.3.3	IFC Compliance Advisor /Ombudsman	180
8.3	Gaps in Protection	180
8.3.1	Accountability of International Organisations	181
8.3.2	Accountability of Transnational Corporations and other Business Enterprises	194
9	Conclusions	197
9.1	A Rights-Based Approach to Development	199
9.2	Environmental Considerations	200
9.3	An Institutional Set Up	200
Annex - The Proposed "International Convention on Development-Induced Displacement"		201
Selected Bibliography		209
Index of Authorities		221
Curriculum Vitae		234