

Constitutional Dilemmas

*Conflicts of Fundamental Legal Rights in
Europe and the USA*

LORENZO ZUCCA

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

Introduction

ix

PART I: THE THEORY OF CONFLICTS OF FUNDAMENTAL LEGAL RIGHTS

1. Law, Morality, and Conflicts of Fundamental Legal Rights	3
1. The Dilemma	3
2. The Structure of FLRs' Norms: Rules v Principles	7
3. Weighing Principles in Competition: Harmony or Conflict?	12
4. Conflicts of FLRs: From Morality to Law	23
5. Conclusion	25
2. The Concept of Fundamental Legal Rights	27
1. FLRs and Analysis	27
2. A Preliminary Problem: Reductionism	27
3. The Structure and Point of Rights	29
4. The Scope (or Content) of FLRs	42
5. The External Dimension or the Function(s) of FLRs	45
6. FLRs: A Stipulative Definition	47
3. The Anatomy of Conflicts of Fundamental Legal Rights	49
1. Introduction	49
2. <i>Lato Sensu</i> and Spurious Conflicts of FLRs	49
3. The Core of Conflicts of FLRs	52
4. Theories of Rights, Normative Inconsistencies, and Incommensurability	55
5. Beyond Absolute or Prima Facie FLRs	60
6. A Typology of Conflicts of FLRs	64
4. A Framework to Deal with Conflicts of Fundamental Legal Rights	67
1. Why a Framework?	67
2. Conflicts and the Constitution	68
3. Interpretation and Conflicts of FLRs	74
4. Deference and Conflicts of FLRs	79

5. Balancing and Conflicts of FLRs	84
6. The Rule of Conflict as the Ultimate Rule of Law	90

PART II: THE PRACTICE OF CONFLICTS OF FUNDAMENTAL LEGAL RIGHTS

Introduction	97
5. The Fundamental Legal Right to Privacy	99
1. Privacy: An Ambiguous Concept	99
2. The Structure of the FLR to Privacy	101
3. The Legal Protection of the FLR to Privacy	107
4. Conflicts and the FLR to Privacy	112
6. The Fundamental Legal Right to Informational Privacy v The Fundamental Legal Right to Free Press	114
1. Introduction	114
2. Situating the Conflict	115
3. Solving the Conflict?	131
7. Mortal Conflicts of Fundamental Legal Rights—The Fundamental Legal Right to Life v The Fundamental Legal Right to Decisional Privacy	142
1. Introduction	142
2. Physician-assisted Suicide Around the World	145
3. The Anatomy of a FLRs Conflict	148
4. Moral and Legal Conflicts	156
5. Whose Tragedy Is It?	160
6. Present Solutions: How do Courts Solve the Conflict?	162
7. Accepting or Imposing Sacrifices	166
8. Conclusion	168
<i>Bibliography</i>	171
<i>Index</i>	179