

# The Right to Health in International Law

JOHN TOBIN

OXFORD  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# *Contents*

<i>Table of Cases</i>	xiv
<i>Table of Treaties</i>	xvi
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xviii
 Introduction	 1
I Clarifying expectations	6
II Constructing a meaning for the right to health	8
A The history of the right to health	8
B The conceptual foundations of the right to health	9
C The need for a persuasive methodology	10
D The meaning of health	11
E The obligation of states to recognize the right to health	11
 1 Charting the History of the Right to Health	 14
I Introduction	14
II From invisible to inalienable: the recognition of the right to health	16
III The origins of the right to health	19
A The need to navigate the dangers of excessive liberalism and collectivism	 19
B The nexus between war, rights, health, and peace	23
C The WHO and the right to the highest attainable standard of health	 27
D The adoption of the UDHR and its aftermath—a common enemy unites then the Cold War divides	 30
E Using history to understand the meaning of the right to health	33
IV The role of public health in delivering the right to health	34
A The ancient commitment to collective action to protect health	34
B The reality of mixed motivations underlying collective health measures	 35
C The rise and fall of the Enlightenment	36
D State expansion and the Industrial Revolution—towards an instrumentalist vision of public health	 37
E The rebirth of rights and the struggle for justice	38
F Transforming national differences into an international commitment	 39
V Conclusion: looking into and beyond the history of the right to health	 41

2	The Right to Health—Its Conceptual Foundations	44
I	Introduction	44
II	The preliminary question: the need to interrogate the conceptual foundations of the right to health?	47
III	The conceptual foundations of the right to health	49
A	Looking for foundations in incompletely theorized agreements	49
B	The idea of a human right to health	50
C	Grounding rights in interests	52
D	A social interest theory of rights	54
E	Dignity as both coterminous and foundational	56
F	Beyond individualism	57
G	Dynamic but not arbitrary	59
IV	Dealing with the detractors: a defence of the right to health	60
A	The libertarian objection	60
B	The status objection	63
C	The formulation objection	65
D	The relativist challenge	67
E	The resource allocation dilemma	69
V	Conclusion—an imperfect but good justification	73
3	A Methodology to Produce a Meaning for the Right to Health	75
I	Introduction	75
II	The act of interpretation: from intentionalism to persuasion	78
III	Defining the interpretative community—moving beyond states towards a communitarian model	81
IV	Seeking to persuade by constructive engagement	86
A	Providing a transparent account of the interpretative process	86
B	The features required for constructive engagement	88
V	Conclusion—towards a common understanding	118
4	The Meaning of the Highest Attainable Standard of Health	121
I	Introduction	121
II	The scope of the interest in which the right to health is grounded	123
A	The distinct nature of the international formulation	123
B	The meaning of health	125
C	Moving beyond a biomedical definition of health	126
D	The danger associated with inflating the right to health	130
III	The freedoms associated with health	132
A	The right to sexual and reproductive freedom—an adolescent perspective	133
B	Freedom from medical experimentation	144
C	Freedom from non-consensual medical treatment	144

IV The qualitative nature of the entitlements under the right to health	158
A Availability	159
B Accessibility	167
V Conclusion—a socially manageable meaning of health	173
5 The Obligation to Recognize the Right to Health by All	
Appropriate Means	175
I Introduction	175
II The obligation to ‘take steps’	177
III The meaning of ‘all appropriate means’	178
A A margin of discretion	178
B Legislative measures	179
C Using the tripartite typology to identify ‘other appropriate measures’	185
D Using the work of the human rights treaty monitoring bodies to develop an understanding as to the nature of ‘appropriate measures’	197
IV Conclusion—moving towards a sufficiently specified account of the measures required to secure the right to health	224
6 The Progressive Obligation to Realize the Right to Health	225
I Introduction	225
II The meaning of ‘maximum available resources’	226
A Towards a dynamic understanding of available resources	226
B Developing social resources	230
C Seeking international co-operation as a source of resources	231
III The progressive nature of a state’s obligations and the process for prioritization	232
A The need for a dialogue	232
B Addressing the resource allocation dilemma	235
IV The concept of minimum core obligations	238
A Genesis and inflation	238
B In search of a principled basis for minimum core obligations	241
C In search of a practical content for the minimum core obligations under the right to health	243
V Conclusion—progressive as a pragmatic and principled process	252
7 Specific Measures Required to Secure the Right to Health	254
I Introduction	254
II The obligation to diminish infant and child mortality	255
III The obligation to provide medical assistance and health care, especially primary health care	261
A Introduction	261
B The emphasis on primary health care	263

IV	The obligation to combat disease and malnutrition	267
	A Introduction	267
	B Disease prevention	269
V	The obligation to ensure occupational health and safety	286
VI	The obligation to provide pre-natal and post-natal health care for mothers	287
	A A progressive or immediate obligation	287
	B The meaning of 'appropriate' pre- and post-natal care	289
VII	The obligation to raise awareness and ensure access to information concerning health	291
	A Introduction	291
	B The information about health which all segments of society are entitled to receive	293
VIII	The obligation to develop preventive health care, guidance for parents, and family planning education and services	296
	A Introduction	296
	B The obligation to develop preventive health care	297
	C The obligation to develop guidance for parents	298
	D The obligation to develop family planning education and services	299
IX	Conclusion—deference with limits	301
8	The Obligation to Abolish Traditional Practices Harmful to Health	303
	I Introduction	303
	II The nature of a state's obligation—making progress towards effective abolition	305
	III The practices to be abolished: 'traditional practices prejudicial to the health of children'	306
	A Prejudice to health as a contested concept	306
	B The identification of those practices to be abolished	307
	IV Measures to abolish traditional practices prejudicial to a child's health	314
	A Case study: female genital cutting	314
	B The problem of classification	315
	C The nature and health consequences of the practice	316
	D The measures to be adopted by states	317
	V Conclusion—the need for a culturally sensitive approach	323
9	The International Obligation to Secure the Right to Health	325
	I Introduction	325
	II The nature and scope of the international obligation to co-operate	327
	A A vision of qualified solidarity	327
	B The obligation to promote and encourage co-operation under the CRC	329
	C A tripartite international obligation	331

III Case study: the impact of the international obligation to co-operate on access to medicines	351
A The dilemma: Intellectual property rights v access to medicines	351
B Can TRIPS be justified?	354
C Trade law and human rights—in search of system coherence	364
D TRIPS and access to medicines—adjusting and reviewing expectations	366
IV Conclusion	368
Conclusion	371
<i>Appendix</i>	376
<i>Select Bibliography</i>	381
<i>Index</i>	403

# Table of Cases

<i>Alex, Re</i> (2004) 180 FLR 89 (FamCt, Aust) . . . . .	149
<i>Alyne de Silva Pimental v Brazil</i> CEDAW/C/49/D/17/2008 (10 August 2011) . . . . .	222, 228, 289
<i>Asylum Case (Colombia v Peru)</i> [1950] ICJ Rep 266 (ICJ) . . . . .	91
<i>B (a Minor), Re</i> [1988] 1 AC 199 (HL, UK) . . . . .	153, 157
<i>Bellotti v Baird</i> , 443 US 622 (1979) (SC, USA) . . . . .	148
<i>Buck v Bell</i> , 274 US 200 (1927) (SC, USA) . . . . .	153
<i>Chan v Korean Airlines Ltd</i> , 490 US 122 (1989) (SC, USA) . . . . .	115
<i>City of Akron v Akron Center for Reproductive Health Inc</i> , 462 US 416 (1983) (SC, USA) . . . . .	148
<i>Consumer Education and Research Centre v Union of India</i> (1995) 1 SCR 626 (SC, India) . . . . .	187, 203
<i>D v United Kingdom</i> ECHR 1997–III (ECtHR) . . . . .	204
<i>DAS v Victorian Human Rights and Equal Opportunity Commission</i> (2009) 24 VR 415 (VSC, Aust) . . . . .	72, 183
<i>Drug Action Forum v Union of India</i> (1997) 6 SCC 609 (SC, India) . . . . .	203
<i>Effect of Reservations on the Entry into Force of the American Convention on Human Rights (Arts 74 and 75)</i> , Advisory Opinion OC-2/82 of 24 September 1982, Inter-Am Ct HR (Ser A) No 2 (1982) (Inter-Am Ct HR) . . . . .	92
<i>Eve, Re</i> [1986] 2 SCR 388 (SC, Canada) . . . . .	153, 156
<i>Exchange of Greek and Turkish Populations under the Lausanne Convention VI</i> [1925] PCIJ (ser B) No 10 . . . . .	177
<i>Francis Mullin v Administrator, Union of Delhi</i> (1981) 2 SCR 516 (SC, India) . . . . .	187, 203
<i>Gabčíkovo-Nagymaros Project (Hungary/Slovakia)</i> [1997] ICJ Rep 7 (ICJ) . . . . .	107
<i>General Secretary, West Pakistan Salt Miners Labour Union, Khewra, Jhelum v Director Industries and Mineral Development, Punjab Lahore</i> [1994] SCMR 2061 (SC, Pakistan) . . . . .	203
<i>Gillick v West Norfolk and Wisbech Area Health Authority</i> [1986] 1 AC 112 (HL, UK) . . . . .	139
<i>Government of the Republic of South Africa v Grootboom</i> [2001] 1 SA 46 (CC, Sth Afr) . . . . .	97, 240, 245
<i>Henao v The Netherlands</i> App No 13669/03 (ECtHR, 24 June 2003) (ECtHR) . . . . .	204
<i>International Centre for the Legal Protection of Human Rights 'Interights' v Croatia</i> , Decision No 45/2007 (30 March 2009) (European Committee of Social Rights) . . . . .	201
<i>Interpretation of Peace Treaties (Second Phase) (Advisory Opinion)</i> [1950] ICJ 221 (ICJ) . . . . .	91
<i>Ireland v United Kingdom</i> (1978) Series A no 25 (ECtHR) . . . . .	92
<i>Judgment No SU-225/98</i> (1998) (CC, Columbia) . . . . .	2, 205
<i>Judgment No SU-337/99</i> (1999) (CC, Columbia) . . . . .	147
<i>Judgment No T-551/99</i> (1999) (CC, Columbia) . . . . .	147
<i>Kjeldsen Busk Madsen and Pedersen v Denmark</i> (1976) Series A no 23 (ECtHR) . . . . .	142
<i>KNLH v Peru</i> , Communication No 1153/2003, UN Doc CCPR/C/85/1153/2003 (22 November 2005) (HRC) . . . . .	143, 164, 204
<i>Konrad v Germany</i> ECHR 2006–XIII (ECtHR) . . . . .	142
<i>Land Island and Maritime Frontier Dispute (El Salvador v Honduras) (Judgment)</i> [1992] ICJ Rep 351 (ICJ) . . . . .	90
<i>Legal Consequences for States of the Continued Presence of South Africa in Namibia (South West Africa) Notwithstanding Security Council Resolution 276 (Advisory Opinion)</i> [1971] ICJ Rep 16 (ICJ) . . . . .	104

<i>Legal Consequences of the Construction of a Wall in the Occupied Palestinian Territory (Advisory Opinion)</i> [2004] ICJ Rep 136 (ICJ) . . . . .	325
<i>Loizidou v Turkey</i> ECHR 1996–VI 2220 (ECtHR) . . . . .	93
<i>Maharjan v His Majesty of Government NKP</i> , 2053, vol 8, 627 (SC, Nepal) . . . . .	203
<i>Marion (No 2)</i> , Re (1992) 17 FamLR 336 (FamCt, Aust) . . . . .	153, 156
<i>Minister of Health v Treatment Action Campaign (No 2)</i> [2002] 5 SA 721 (CC, Sth Afr) . . . . .	2, 97, 99, 240
<i>Mohiuddin Farooque v Bangladesh</i> (1996) 48 DLR 438 (HC, Bangladesh) . . . . .	203
<i>Olga Tellis v Bombay Municipal Corporation</i> [1986] AIR SC 180 (SC, India) . . . . .	187
<i>Osman v United Kingdom</i> ECHR 1998–VIII 3124 (ECtHR) . . . . .	192
<i>P v P</i> (1994) 181 CLR 583 (HC, Aust) . . . . .	153
<i>Paschim Banga Khet Majoor Samity v State of West Bengal</i> (1996) 4 SCC 37 (SC, India) . . . . .	203
<i>Pharmaceutical Manufacturers' Association of South Africa v President of the Republic of South Africa</i> , Notice of Motion, Case Number 4183/98 (February 1998) (HC, Sth Afr) . . . . .	355
<i>Planned Parenthood v Danforth</i> , 428 US 52 (1976) (SC, USA) . . . . .	139
<i>R v Momcilovic</i> (2010) 25 VR 436 (VSCA, Aust) . . . . .	72, 183
<i>R v Oakes</i> [1986] 1 SCR 103 (SC, Canada) . . . . .	72, 182–3
<i>Restrictions to the Death Penalty (Arts 4(2) and 4(4) of the American Convention on Human Rights)</i> , Advisory Opinion OC-8/83 of 8 September 1983, Inter-Am Ct HR (Ser A) No 3 (1983) (Inter-Am Ct HR) . . . . .	92
<i>Rights of Nationals of the United States of America in Morocco (France v United States of America)</i> [1952] ICJ Rep 176 (ICJ) . . . . .	90
<i>Secretary, Department of Health and Community Services v JWB &amp; SMB (Marion's Case)</i> (1992) 175 CLR 218 (HC, Aust) . . . . .	148, 149, 153, 155
<i>Selmouni v France</i> (2000) 29 EHRR 403 (ECtHR) . . . . .	64, 75
<i>Skinner v Oklahoma</i> , 316 US 535 (1942) (SC, USA) . . . . .	153
<i>Social and Economic Rights Action Center and the Center for Economic and Social Rights v Nigeria</i> , Communication No 155/96 (27 October 2001) (African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights) . . . . .	185, 240
<i>Soobramoney v Minister for Health</i> [1998] 1 SA 765 (CC, Sth Afr) . . . . .	85, 102, 205–6, 218, 241
<i>South-West Africa Cases (Ethiopia v South Africa; Liberia v South Africa) (Joint Dissenting Opinion of Sir Percy Spender and Sir Gerald Fitzmaurice)</i> [1962] ICJ Rep 465 (ICJ) . . . . .	79
<i>Szijjarto v Hungary</i> , Communication No 4/2004, UN Doc CEDAW/C/36/D/4/2004 (14 August 2006) annex (CEDAW Committee) . . . . .	154, 163
<i>The Amiable Isabella</i> , 19 US (6 Wheat) 1 (1821) (SC, USA) . . . . .	115
<i>The Rainbow Warrior (New Zealand v France)</i> (1990) 82 ILR 449 (France–New Zealand Arbitration Tribunal) . . . . .	332
<i>The Right to Information on Consular Assistance in the Framework of the Guarantees of the Due Process of Law</i> , Advisory Opinion OC-16/99 of 1 October 1999, Inter-Am Ct HR (Ser A) No 16 (1999) (Inter-Am Ct HR) . . . . .	93
<i>Tyrer v United Kingdom</i> (1978) Series A no 26 (ECtHR) . . . . .	93
<i>Vincent Panikulangura v Union of India</i> (1987) 2 SCC 165 (SC, India) . . . . .	203
<i>Waite and Kennedy v Germany</i> App No 26083/94 (ECtHR, 18 February 1999) (ECtHR) . . . . .	338
<i>Wemhoff v Germany</i> (1968) Series A no 7 (ECtHR) . . . . .	93
<i>Yanomami v Brazil</i> , Resolution No 10/85, Case No 7615 (1985) (Inter-American Commission on Human Rights) . . . . .	202



# *Table of Treaties*

Additional Protocol to the American Convention on Human Rights in the Area of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (Protocol of San Salvador) (San Salvador, 17 November 1988, entered into force 16 November 1999, OAS Treaty Series No 69 (1988), 28 ILM 156) . . . . .	19, 123, 263, 265, 267, 292, 326, 356, 380
African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights (African Charter) (Banjul Charter) (Nairobi, 27 June 1981, entered into force 21 October 1986, 1520 UNTS 217) . . . . .	8, 19, 123, 262, 326, 379
African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child (Addis Ababa, 11 July 1990, entered into force 29 November 1999, OAU Doc CAB/LEG/24.9/49) . . . . .	19, 123, 256, 262, 263, 379
American Convention on Human Rights (Pact of San José, Costa Rica) (San José, 22 November 1969, entered into force 18 July 1978, 1144 UNTS 123) . . . . .	326
Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) (New York, 18 December 1979, entered into force 3 September 1981, 1249 UNTS 13) . . . . .	18, 60, 134, 137, 168, 185, 255, 262, 288-9, 291-2, 299, 300, 304, 377
Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD) (New York, 30 March 2007, entered into force 3 May 2008, UN Doc A/RES/61/106) . . . . .	18, 59, 109, 123-4, 154, 157, 161, 168, 169, 172, 215, 255, 262, 326, 377
Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) (New York, 20 November 1989, entered into force 2 September 1990, 1577 UNTS 3) . . . . .	7, 12, 18, 24, 56, 59, 66, 69, 83, 85, 95, 105, 112, 123, 131-2, 140, 144, 146-7, 176, 178-9, 186-9, 191, 194, 198, 204, 212, 214, 219, 224, 231, 242, 247-9, 254-6, 262-3, 267, 286, 288, 291-2, 293, 297, 299-300, 305-9, 325-30, 341, 347-8, 376
European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (European Convention on Human Rights) (Rome, 4 November 1950, entered into force 3 September 1953, 213 UNTS 221) . . . . .	75, 93, 142, 313, 356
European Social Charter (Turin, 18 October 1961, entered into force 26 February 1965, 529 UNTS 89) . . . . .	19, 123, 202, 255, 267, 291-2, 379
International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (CERD) (New York, 21 December 1995, entered into force 4 January 1969, 660 UNTS 195) . . . . .	18, 168
International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families (CMWF) (New York, 18 December 1990, entered into force 14 March 2003, 2220 UNTS 3) . . . . .	18, 168, 255, 378
International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR) (New York, 16 December 1966, entered into force 23 March 1976, 999 UNTS 171) . . . . .	31, 72, 84, 106, 141, 144, 157, 162, 164-5, 175, 181, 188, 191, 215, 240, 286, 305
International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR) (New York, 16 December 1966, entered into force 3 January 1976, 993 UNTS 3) . . . . .	6, 12-13, 18, 24, 31-2, 51, 56, 58-60, 66, 72, 85, 95, 97, 105, 108-9, 112, 114, 123-6, 130-4, 144, 167, 175-81, 187, 194, 198-9, 204, 212, 215, 222, 224, 225, 237-49, 254-63, 267-8, 281, 286-92, 297, 301-2, 303-6, 325-30, 339-48, 356-70, 371

International Health Regulations . . . . .	343
Marrakesh Agreement Establishing the World Trade Organization (Marrakesh, 15 April 1994, entered into force 1 January 1995) 1867 UNTS 3) annex 1C (Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights). . . . .	352
Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (Optional Protocol to the ICESCR) (New York, 24 September 2009, UN Doc A/63/435) (not yet in force) . . . . .	179, 234–5, 340
Paris Convention for the Protection of Industrial Property (Paris, 20 March 1883, entered into force 26 April 1970, 828 UNTS 305) . . . . .	356
Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa (Maputo, 13 September 2000, entered into force 25 November 2005, OAU Doc CAB/LEG/66.6) . . . . .	134, 166, 318, 322
Protocol to the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (Paris, 20 March 1952, entered into force 18 May 1954, 213 UNTS 262) . .	141
Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (VCLT) (Vienna, 23 May 1969, entered into force 27 January 1980, 1155 UNTS 331). . . . .	76–7, 86–100, 104–8, 118–119, 177, 277, 240, 242, 373
WHO Framework Convention on Tobacco Control (Geneva, 21 May 2003, entered into force 27 February 2005, 2302 UNTS 166). . . . .	343