

# **Humanitarian Intervention**

**An Introduction**

**Aidan Hehir**

palgrave  
macmillan

# Contents

<i>List of boxes</i>	xii
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xiii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xiv

<b>Introduction: Humanitarian Intervention in Contemporary International Relations</b>	<b>1</b>
The contemporary debate	1
<i>The end of history</i>	2
<i>The rise of the 'international community'</i>	3
<i>Globalization and the communication revolution</i>	5
Using this book	7

## **Part I Concepts and Conceptions**

<b>1 What is 'Humanitarian Intervention'?</b>	<b>11</b>
'Humanitarian intervention', 'humanitarian action' and 'military action'	12
Features of humanitarian intervention	16
<i>The status of the parties involved</i>	16
<i>The question of consent</i>	18
<i>The means</i>	18
<i>The motives</i>	19
<i>The issue of legality</i>	19
Conclusion	20
Questions	21
Further reading	21
Useful websites	21
<b>2 The Just War Tradition</b>	<b>22</b>
The central tenets	23
The evolution of the Just War tradition	25
Contemporary relevance	32
<i>Is the tradition universally applicable?</i>	34
<i>The tradition is inherently statist</i>	34
<i>Easily abused/who decides?</i>	36
<i>Does the Just War tradition have any real utility?</i>	37
Conclusion	38
Questions	39
Further reading	39

<b>3</b>	<b>The Sovereign State</b>	<b>41</b>
	The evolution of the sovereign state	41
	<i>War, religion and the modern state</i>	44
	<i>Westphalia and the nation-state</i>	45
	<i>The UN Charter</i>	47
	Organized hypocrisy?	48
	Challenging the sovereign state in the contemporary era	51
	<i>The rise of human rights</i>	51
	<i>Defending the sovereign state</i>	52
	Conclusion	57
	Questions	58
	Further reading	59
<b>4</b>	<b>Theoretical Perspectives</b>	<b>60</b>
	Realism	61
	Marxism/critical theory	64
	Liberalism	67
	The English School	70
	Cosmopolitanism	73
	Post-structuralism	75
	Conclusion	78
	Questions	79
	Further reading	79

## **Part II Controversies**

<b>5</b>	<b>Legality and Legitimacy</b>	<b>83</b>
	The evolution of international law and the legal status of humanitarian intervention	83
	<i>The evolution of international law</i>	84
	<i>The legal status of humanitarian intervention</i>	86
	<i>Human rights law</i>	94
	‘Illegal but legitimate’?	96
	The need for legal reform	99
	<i>The feasibility of reform</i>	99
	<i>Potential legal reform</i>	100
	<i>Political will or legal obstacles?</i>	101
	Conclusion	102
	Questions	103
	Further reading	104
<b>6</b>	<b>Sovereignty as Responsibility</b>	<b>105</b>
	State responsibility	105
	<i>Traditional approaches to state responsibility</i>	106
	<i>State responsibility and the UN Charter</i>	107

	<i>The rise of human security</i>	109
	<i>Political developments in the 1990s</i>	111
	The responsibility to protect	113
	<i>Key tenets</i>	113
	<i>International reception and the 2005 World Summit</i>	117
	Challenging the responsibility to protect	120
	<i>Specific failings within R2P</i>	120
	<i>A Western idea</i>	121
	<i>Will lead to increased war and instability</i>	122
	<i>[It's their] responsibility to protect</i>	123
	<i>Does not address the key problem</i>	124
	Conclusion	125
	Questions	126
	Further reading	126
7	<b>Who Decides?</b>	128
	Legitimacy, authority, power and rights	129
	<i>Legitimacy</i>	129
	<i>Authority and power</i>	132
	<i>Right or duty?</i>	134
	The UN Security Council	135
	<i>Nature of the Security Council's powers</i>	135
	<i>International perception</i>	137
	<i>A source of order, not justice</i>	139
	Alternative authorities	141
	<i>International morality</i>	141
	<i>Liberal hierarchy thesis</i>	143
	<i>Reform of the Security Council</i>	144
	Conclusion	147
	Questions	148
	Further reading	148
8	<b>Motives and Means</b>	149
	Motives	149
	<i>The humanitarian imperative</i>	150
	<i>In defence of interests</i>	151
	<i>'He who invokes humanity wants to cheat'</i>	154
	Means	156
	<i>'Bombing for humanity'</i>	157
	<i>Force protection</i>	158
	<i>'War is hell'</i>	160
	Conclusion	162
	Questions	163
	Further reading	163

### Part III Cases

9	'Humanitarian Intervention in History'	167
	Humanitarian intervention: trends and changes	168
	<i>The state and the evolution of humanitarian intervention</i>	168
	<i>Humanitarian intervention in historical context</i>	171
	Conclusion: assessing the record	176
	Questions	177
	Further reading	177
10	Rwanda	179
	Nature of the crisis	179
	<i>The evolution of the crisis</i>	180
	<i>Explaining the genocide</i>	183
	International response	186
	<i>International reaction</i>	186
	<i>Could more have been done?</i>	188
	Impact on the debate	193
	<i>Never again!</i>	194
	<i>The need for UN reform</i>	195
	<i>Critiquing intervention</i>	197
	Conclusion	199
	Questions	200
	Further reading	200
11	Kosovo	201
	Nature of the crisis	201
	International response	204
	<i>1989–98: distracted superpowers</i>	204
	<i>October 1998–March 1999: diplomatic failure</i>	205
	<i>24 March 1999–10 June 1999: intervention</i>	207
	Impact on the debate	211
	<i>A war fought for values</i>	211
	<i>'The new military humanism'</i>	212
	<i>International law after Kosovo</i>	213
	<i>Force protection and international humanitarian law</i>	216
	Conclusion	218
	Questions	219
	Further reading	219
12	Iraq	221
	Nature of the crisis	222
	International response	224
	<i>The Bush doctrine and Iraq</i>	224
	<i>Operation Iraqi Freedom</i>	226
	<i>Lies?</i>	227

Impact on the debate	228
<i>The abuse of humanitarian intervention</i>	229
<i>The role of international law</i>	231
<i>The utility of the Just War criteria</i>	235
Conclusion	238
Questions	240
Further reading	240
<b>13 Darfur</b>	<b>241</b>
Nature of the crisis	241
International response	243
2003–05	243
2005–08	245
Impact on the debate	246
<i>Back to Rwanda?</i>	247
<i>R2P RIP?</i>	249
<i>The limits of global civil society?</i>	252
Conclusion	255
Questions	256
Further reading	256
<b>Conclusion The Future of Humanitarian Intervention?</b>	<b>258</b>
Three scenarios	258
<i>In defence of the status quo</i>	259
<i>The need for legal reform</i>	261
<i>Beyond current international law</i>	262
Conclusion	264
<i>Bibliography</i>	267
<i>Index</i>	294

# List of Boxes

1.1	Some key journals on humanitarian intervention	8
1.2	Some key authors on humanitarian intervention	8
1.1	Médecins Sans Frontières	14
1.2	Definitions of humanitarian intervention	17
2.1	The Just War criteria	24
2.2	Key texts in the Just War tradition	25
2.3	The doctrine of double effect	29
3.1	Key dates in the evolution of the modern state	42
3.2	The 1933 Montevideo Convention	47
3.3	<i>Declaration on World Peace and Cooperation</i> , 1955 Bandung Conference	53
4.1	Shared theoretical characteristics of Carr's <i>The Twenty Years Crisis</i> (2001) and Morgenthau's <i>Politics Among Nations</i> (1954)	60
5.1	Key Articles of the UN Charter related to humanitarian intervention	87
5.2	<i>Uniting for Peace</i> : General Assembly Resolution 377, 3 November 1950	89
5.3	Five basic criteria of legitimacy	101
6.1	Global civil society	111
6.2	Paragraphs 138 and 139 of the World Summit <i>Outcome Document</i>	119
7.1	Two models for reforming the UN Security Council	138
8.1	'Doctrine of the International Community': Speech by UK Prime Minister Tony Blair, 24 April 1999	152
8.2	Presidential Directive 25 (PDD-25), 1994: 'The Clinton Administration's Policy on Reforming Multilateral Peace Operations'	160
8.3	'the violence and the lethality and the destruction . . .'	161
9.1	The Melian dialogue	167
9.2	A chronology of humanitarian intervention: 1827–1939	169
9.3	A chronology of humanitarian intervention since the Second World War	170
9.4	Six 'worrying developments arising from the practice of intervention since 1991'	175
10.1	The horror	184
10.2	5,000 troops . . . 500,000 lives?	189
11.1	The rise of the KLA	203
11.2	The Rambouillet Accords	207
11.3	NATO credibility?	210
12.1	'WMDs? It's a slam dunk!'	228
12.2	Operation Iraqi Freedom as legal	236
13.1	Sudan and the ICC	246
13.2	Would military intervention have been effective?	252