

CIVIL PROCEDURE

SIXTH EDITION

By

GEOFFREY C. HAZARD, JR.

Thomas E. Miller Distinguished Professor,
Hastings College of the Law, University of California

JOHN LEUBSDORF

Professor of Law and Frederick Lacey Distinguished Scholar,
Rutgers University

DEBRA LYN BASSETT

Justice Marshall F. McComb Professor of Law,
Southwestern Law School

FOUNDATION PRESS
2011



THOMSON REUTERS™

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE	v
---------------	---

CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION

Sec.

1.1 Distinction Between Substance and Procedure; Functions of Procedure	1
1.2 The Adversary System	4
1.3 Lawyers in the Adversary System	8

A. HISTORICAL BACKGROUND OF ANGLO-AMERICAN LAW

1.4 Rise of King's Courts and Growth of Formulary System	12
1.5 Rise of Equity	16
1.6 Struggle Between Law and Equity and Subsequent Coexistence of the Systems	18
1.7 The American Codes and English Judicature Acts	21
1.8 Federal Rules of Civil Procedure	23
1.9 Beyond the Federal Rules	25

B. GENERAL ANALYSIS OF REMEDIES

1.10 Classic Distinction Between <i>In Rem</i> and <i>In Personam</i> Relief	28
1.11 Other Classifications of Relief	30
1.12 Declaratory Relief	32
1.13 Changing the Law	35
1.14 Institutional Decrees	38

C. AMERICAN COURT SYSTEMS

1.15 State Court Systems	40
1.16 Federal Court System	41

D. LIFE HISTORY OF A LAWSUIT

1.17 Commencement of Action; Summons and Complaint	43
1.18 Parties, Pleading, and Pretrial Procedures	44
1.19 Trial	44
1.20 Judgments	45
1.21 Appeals	47

E. ALLOCATING LITIGATION EXPENSES

1.22 Costs and Interest	48
1.23 Attorney Fees: The American Rule	49
1.24 Exceptions to the American Rule	51

TABLE OF CONTENTS

**CHAPTER 2. SUBJECT MATTER JURISDICTION AND
THE *ERIE* DOCTRINE**

Sec.		
2.1	Introduction	54
2.2	Allocation of Judicial Business Between State and Federal Courts: In General	55
A. FEDERAL SUBJECT MATTER JURISDICTION		
2.3	Diversity Jurisdiction	57
2.4	Arising Under (Federal Question) Jurisdiction	61
2.5	Supplemental Jurisdiction	65
2.6	Cases and Controversies	68
2.7	Proof of Jurisdiction	70
2.8	Removal	72
B. STATE SUBJECT MATTER JURISDICTION		
2.9	State Subject Matter Jurisdiction	75
C. JUDICIAL SELF-RESTRAINTS ON EXERCISING JURISDICTION		
2.10	Abstention	76
2.11	Sovereign Immunity	81
D. THE LAW APPLIED BY A COURT		
2.12	Introduction	85
2.13	Federal and State Law	86
2.14	<i>Erie Railroad v. Tompkins</i>	88
2.15	Choice of Law in Multistate Transactions	95
2.16	Choice of Law in Federal Court	97
2.17	Federal Court Jurisdiction in Perspective	99

CHAPTER 3. PERSONAL JURISDICTION AND VENUE

3.1	Introduction	101
A. PERSONAL JURISDICTION		
3.2	Federal Constitutional Limitations on State Court Authority ...	102
3.3	Territoriality and Due Process	105
3.4	<i>International Shoe</i> and Beyond	109
3.5	Long-Arm Statutes and Jurisdiction	113
3.6	Presence of Property and Persons	120
3.7	Agreements Concerning Jurisdiction	125
3.8	Enforcing the Judgment	128

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Sec.		
	B. NOTICE AND OBJECTION TO JURISDICTION	
3.9	Notice	131
3.10	Technical Requirements as to Notice	133
3.11	Objecting to Jurisdiction	134
3.12	Service of Process Limitations	137
	C. FEDERAL VENUE AND FORUM NON CONVENIENS	
3.13	Federal Venue Provisions.....	139
3.14	Change of Venue.....	141
3.15	Forum Non Conveniens	142
	D. STATE VENUE	
3.16	State Rules of Venue	145
	E. JUDICIAL SELF-RESTRAINTS ON EXERCISING JURISDICTION	
3.17	Immunity from Service.....	146
3.18	Cases Involving Force or Fraud.....	149
3.19	Infringement of Constitutionally Protected Activity	150
3.20	Local Action Rule.....	150
3.21	Perspectives	151
	CHAPTER 4. PLEADINGS: THE COMPLAINT	
4.1	Pleadings Defined.....	156
	A. COMPLAINTS AND RESPONSES	
4.2	Types of Pleadings.....	156
4.3	Complaint	157
4.4	Defensive Pleadings	157
4.5	Agenda for the Case.....	159
	B. HISTORY	
4.6	Common Law, Equity and Code Pleading.....	159
	C. STRUCTURE	
4.7	Format of a Complaint.....	161
4.8	Pleading Jurisdiction and Relief.....	163
4.9	Elements of Claim and Their Allocation	166
4.10	Fairness in Allocation.....	171
	D. “PLAUSIBLE PLEADINGS”: HOW MUCH DETAIL?	
4.11	Degree of Detail Under Code Pleading	172
4.12	Detail Under the Federal Rules.....	173
4.13	<i>Conley v. Gibson</i> Revisited: <i>Twombly</i> and <i>Iqbal</i>	179

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Sec.		
4.14	Pleading and Substantive Law	187
4.15	Litigation as Social Justice	188

E. ENFORCEMENT

4.16	Controlling Frivolous Pleading: Rule 11	190
------	---	-----

F. OTHER DEFENSES

4.17	Rule 12(b)(1)–(5) and (7)	197
------	---------------------------------	-----

CHAPTER 5. DEFENDANT'S RESPONSES TO THE COMPLAINT AND OTHER PLEADING PROBLEMS

A. OBJECTIONS TO THE COMPLAINT

5.1	Types of Objection	198
5.2	Simplifications in the Codes and Federal Rules	200
5.3	Objections Not Waived	205

B. THE ANSWER AND REPLY

5.4	Denials	206
5.5	Affirmative Defenses	207
5.6	Specific Instances of Affirmative Defense	210
5.7	Consequences of Failure to Plead Affirmatively an Affirmative Defense	213
5.8	Counterclaims, Cross-Claims, Interpleader	214
5.9	Plaintiff's Response to Answer	215
5.10	Summary Judgment	217

C. AMENDED PLEADINGS

5.11	The Doctrine of Variance	217
5.12	Amendment of Pleadings: In General	218
5.13	Amendment of Pleadings Before Trial	219
5.14	Amendments Offered at Trial	220
5.15	Amendments to Conform to Proof	221
5.16	Amendments and Statutes of Limitation	222
5.17	Supplemental Pleadings	226

CHAPTER 6. JOINDER OF CLAIMS

A. PERMISSIVE JOINDER OF CLAIMS

6.1	In General	228
6.2	Historical Policies	231
6.3	Joinder Under Original Codes	233
6.4	Modern Joinder When There Are No Multiple Parties	236

B. PERMISSIVE JOINDER OF PARTIES

6.5	Background at Common Law and in Equity	236
-----	--	-----

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Sec.		
6.6	Field Code Provisions	237
6.7	Modern Joinder Provisions	241
	C. MULTIPLE CLAIMS WITH MULTIPLE PARTIES	
6.8	Modern Party Joinder	244
	D. COUNTERCLAIMS	
6.9	Background	249
6.10	Early Code Counterclaims	251
6.11	Modern Provisions	252
6.12	Cross-Claims	254
6.13	Jurisdiction and Other Problems	255
	CHAPTER 7. PARTIES TO AN ACTION	
7.1	Introduction	262
	A. PARTY IDENTITY AND CAPACITY	
7.2	Nominal and Real Parties	263
7.3	Real Party in Interest	265
7.4	Assignee of Chose in Action	267
7.5	Partial Assignment and Subrogation	269
7.6	Holders of Different Interests in Property and Other Multiple Claimants	271
7.7	Capacity of Individuals, Corporations, Partnerships, and Un- incorporated Associations to Sue and Be Sued	273
7.8	Proper Parties Defendant	276
7.9	Liability Insurer as Defendant	279
7.10	Problems of Federal Jurisdiction	281
	B. REQUIRED PARTIES	
7.11	Definitions	283
7.12	Determining Who Is a Required Party	285
7.13	Weighing Various Factors	291
7.14	Suits to Review Administrative Action	295
	C. OTHER JOINDER DEVICES	
7.15	Introduction	295
7.16	Intervention	296
7.17	Impleader	302
7.18	Interpleader	306
	D. CLASS ACTIONS	
7.19	Introduction	309
7.20	Historical Background	311

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Sec.		
7.21	The Modern Class Action	315
7.22	Procedural Aspects of Class Actions	322
E. JOINDER PERSPECTIVES		
7.23	Joinder Policy	330
CHAPTER 8. DISCOVERY		
A. HISTORY AND SCOPE		
8.1	Modern Discovery	334
8.2	History	335
8.3	Basic Discovery Mechanisms	336
8.4	State Counterpart Discovery Rules	337
B. SCOPE, PRIVILEGES AND CONTROLS		
8.5	Scope, Privileges and Controls	338
8.6	Rule 26(b)(1) and Relevance	338
8.7	Privileged Matter: Attorney-Client Privilege	340
8.8	Work Product, Including Experts	341
8.9	<i>Upjohn Co. v. United States</i>	347
8.10	Broad Court Discretion	349
C. DISCOVERY TIMING		
8.11	Initial Disclosures	351
8.12	Discovery Plan	352
8.13	Pretrial Disclosures: Experts and Others	353
8.14	Supplemental Disclosures	354
8.15	Relationship to Summary Judgment	355
D. DISCOVERY METHODS		
8.16	Depositions	355
8.17	Interrogatories to Parties	359
8.18	Discovery of Documents and Things	361
8.19	Discovery of Electronic Documents	363
8.20	Physical Examination	366
8.21	Request for Admission	368
8.22	Transnational Discovery	370
E. PREVENTING DISCOVERY ABUSE		
8.23	Abuse and Its Remedies	372
CHAPTER 9. SUMMARY JUDGMENT		
9.1	Function of Summary Judgment	374
9.2	Relationship to Discovery	376
9.3	History of Summary Judgment	378

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Sec.		
9.4	Prediction of Evidence at Trial	379
9.5	How Far with Summary Judgment?	381
9.6	<i>Scott v. Harris</i>	383
9.7	Summary Judgment in Comparative Perspective	385
CHAPTER 10. PRETRIAL: JUDICIAL MANAGEMENT, INTERIM RELIEF, AND DISPOSITION		
10.1	Introduction: The Pretrial Stage	389
A. CASE MANAGEMENT		
10.2	The Rise of Judicial Management	390
10.3	Pretrial Conferences	391
10.4	Pretrial Order	394
10.5	Sanctions	395
B. PRELIMINARY RELIEF		
10.6	Preliminary Injunctions and Temporary Restraining Orders ..	404
10.7	Garnishment and Replevin	407
10.8	Attachment	408
C. DISPOSITION OF CASE WITHOUT TRIAL		
10.9	Default and Dismissal	409
10.10	Settlement	411
10.11	Alternative Dispute Resolution	417
10.12	Courts and Settlement	423
CHAPTER 11. THE TRIAL		
A. STRUCTURE OF A TRIAL		
11.1	Trial of Issues of Fact	428
11.2	Trial to Judge or Jury	431
11.3	Order of Presentation	432
11.4	Recusal of Judge	437
11.5	Standard of Proof	441
11.6	Trial to Judge Without Jury	442
B. BASIC CONCEPTS OF JURY TRIAL PROCEDURE		
11.7	Introducing the Jury	443
11.8	Historical Development of the Jury: From Witnesses to Arbiters of Fact	447
11.9	Substantive Error and Procedural Error	453
11.10	Legal System Norms and Citizen Norms	454
11.11	Procedural Errors in Jury Trial	457
11.12	Burden of Proof: Two Meanings	458
11.13	Risk of Nonpersuasion	458

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Sec.		
11.14	Measure of Persuasion in Civil Cases	459
11.15	Burden of Producing Evidence	460
11.16	Allocating Burdens of Proof	464
11.17	Presumptions	466
11.18	Distinction Between Law and Fact in Jury Trials	472
11.19	Sufficiency of the Evidence	478
	C. CONTROLLING THE JURY: PREVERDICT DEVICES	
11.20	Admission and Exclusion of Evidence	485
11.21	Directed Verdict, or Judgment as a Matter of Law	488
11.22	Instructions to the Jury	492
11.23	Special Verdicts and Interrogatories	498
	D. CONTROLLING THE JURY: POSTVERDICT DEVICES	
11.24	New Trial: In General	502
11.25	New Trial for Judicial Error	503
11.26	New Trial for Prejudicial Occurrence	504
11.27	New Trial for Jury Misconduct	506
11.28	New Trial for Verdict Against Weight of Evidence	511
11.29	New Trial for Excessive or Inadequate Verdict	514
11.30	Judgment Notwithstanding Verdict, or Judgment as a Matter of Law	523
	CHAPTER 12. RIGHT TO A JURY TRIAL	
	A. THE CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHT	
12.1	In General	529
12.2	Historical Test	532
12.3	Modern Application of Historical Test	539
	B. JURY TRIAL PROBLEMS OF UNIFIED PROCEDURE	
12.4	Choice of Mode of Trial at Common Law	541
12.5	Provisions for Mode of Trial in Merged Systems	543
12.6	Civil Actions That Are Counterparts of Former Law Actions or Equity Suits	547
12.7	Classification of New Claims as Legal or Equitable	548
12.8	Complaint Having Legal and Equitable Claims	552
12.9	Equitable Defense to a Legal Claim	559
12.10	Complaint Presenting Equitable Issues and Counterclaim Presenting Legal Issues	561
12.11	Declaratory Judgment	563
12.12	Alternatives to Historical Test	566
12.13	Jury Size	570
12.14	Jury Composition	571

TABLE OF CONTENTS

**CHAPTER 13. SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC ASPECTS OF
CIVIL LITIGATION**

Sec.

13.1	Introduction.....	580
13.2	Litigation as Coercion.....	581
13.3	Cost of Litigation.....	585
13.4	Factors of Uncertainty.....	589
13.5	Lawsuit as Quest for Justice.....	596
13.6	Civil Justice as a Political Program.....	599
13.7	Policy Goals Competing with Judicial "Efficiency".....	602

CHAPTER 14. JUDGMENTS

A. PRECLUSION GENERALLY

14.1	Introduction.....	605
14.2	Policy Considerations.....	607
14.3	Definitions and Distinctions.....	609
14.4	Requirement of Finality.....	611
14.5	Law of the Case Doctrine.....	613
14.6	Stare Decisis.....	614

B. PRECLUSION BETWEEN SAME PARTIES

14.7	Parties.....	615
14.8	Claim Preclusion.....	617
14.9	Dimensions of Single Claim or Cause of Action.....	619
14.10	Tort Cases.....	622
14.11	Contract Cases.....	625
14.12	Alternative Bases of Recovery for Single Injury.....	626
14.13	Legal and Equitable Theories and Remedies.....	627
14.14	Unavailability of Remedy or Theory of Recovery in First Action.....	627
14.15	Defenses and Counterclaims.....	631
14.16	Judgment on the Merits.....	634
14.17	Issue Preclusion: In General.....	635
14.18	Matter or Point Must Have Been Litigated.....	636
14.19	Matter or Point Must Have Been Determined.....	638
14.19	Matter or Point Must Have Been Determined.....	639
14.20	Determination Must Have Been Necessary to Result.....	640
14.21	Questions of Law.....	642
14.22	Judicial Estoppel.....	644

C. PRECLUSION INVOLVING NONPARTIES

14.23	Due Process.....	645
14.24	Transformational Effect of Judgment.....	646
14.25	Mutuality Rule.....	647

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Sec.		
14.26	Exceptions to One-Way Issue Preclusion	651
14.27	Preclusion Resulting from Representation	653
14.28	Representative Parties	656
14.29	Class Actions	657
14.30	Substantive Relationships Resulting in Preclusion	662
14.31	Ameliorating Rigors of Preclusion.....	667
14.32	Equitable Preclusion.....	670
 CHAPTER 15. POST-TRIAL ATTACKS ON JUDGMENTS		
15.1	Introduction.....	672
 A. POST-TRIAL MOTIONS		
15.2	Postverdict Motions	675
15.3	Postjudgment Motions in Cases Tried to a Judge.....	676
 B. APPEAL		
15.4	Final Judgment Rule	677
15.5	Attorney's Fee Awards.....	685
15.6	Parties	689
15.7	Jurisdiction of Appeal.....	691
15.8	Procedure	693
15.9	Scope of Review	697
 C. INTERLOCUTORY APPELLATE REVIEW		
15.10	Introduction	706
15.11	Discretionary Interlocutory Appeal	707
15.12	Orders Appealable as of Right	708
15.13	Extraordinary Writ Review.....	710
 D. EXTRAORDINARY RELIEF FROM JUDGMENT		
15.14	Introduction	712
15.15	Rule 60(b) Relief	713
15.16	Independent Suit	721
15.17	Attacking a Void Judgment.....	722
TABLE OF CASES		725
INDEX		773