

# CIVIL PROCEDURE

THIRD EDITION

*by*

THOMAS D. ROWE, JR.

Elvin R. Latty Professor of Law Emeritus  
Duke University School of Law

SUZANNA SHERRY

Herman O. Loewenstein Professor of Law  
Vanderbilt University Law School

JAY TIDMARSH

Diane and M.O. Miller, II Research Professor of Law  
Notre Dame Law School

FOUNDATION PRESS

2012

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE TO THE THIRD EDITION .....	v
PREFACE TO THE SECOND EDITION .....	vii
PREFACE TO THE FIRST EDITION .....	ix
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS .....	xi
SUMMARY OF CONTENTS .....	xiii
TABLE OF CONTENTS .....	xix
TABLE OF CASES .....	xxxi
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES .....	xlili

---

### CHAPTER ONE: AN INTRODUCTION TO CIVIL PROCEDURE ..... 1

Sec.

<b>A. The Design of a Procedural System .....</b>	<b>2</b>
Subcommittee on Long Range Planning, <i>A Self-Study of Federal</i>	
<i>Judicial Rulemaking</i> .....	3
Robert G. Bone, <i>The Process of Making Process: Court Rule-</i>	
<i>making, Democratic Legitimacy, and Procedural Efficacy</i> .....	3
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	5
Stephan Landsman, <i>Readings on Adversarial Justice: The</i>	
<i>American Approach to Adjudication</i> .....	6
John H. Langbein, <i>The German Advantage in Civil Procedure</i> ....	8
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	10
<b>B. A Brief History of the American Procedural System .....</b>	<b>12</b>
1. English Antecedents .....	12
2. American Antecedents .....	16
3. The Modern American System .....	17
<b>C. An Overview of the American Judicial System .....</b>	<b>18</b>
1. Dual System of Courts .....	18
2. Source of Law .....	21
3. Processing the Lawsuit .....	21
4. Finality .....	23
5. Challenging the Standard Litigation Paradigm .....	23
<b>D. American Civil Procedure in Comparative Perspective ...</b>	<b>24</b>
<b>E. The Social Significance of Civil Dispute Resolution .....</b>	<b>25</b>

<b>CHAPTER TWO: PLEADING</b> .....	28
Sec.	
<b>A. Perspectives on Pleading</b> .....	28
Charles E. Clark, <i>Handbook of the Law of Code Pleading</i> .....	29
Christopher M. Fairman, <i>Heightened Pleading</i> .....	30
Richard A. Epstein, <i>Of Pleading and Discovery: Reflections on</i> <i>Twombly and Iqbal with Special Reference to Antitrust</i> .....	30
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	31
<b>B. The Complaint</b> .....	32
1. A Model (?) Complaint .....	33
2. The Sufficiency of the Complaint .....	34
<i>Conley v. Gibson</i> .....	34
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	36
<i>Swierkiewicz v. Sorema N.A.</i> .....	37
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	41
<i>Bell Atlantic Corp. v. Twombly</i> .....	43
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	50
<i>Ashcroft v. Iqbal</i> .....	53
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	62
3. Filing and Serving the Complaint .....	67
<i>Rio Properties, Inc. v. Rio International Interlink</i> .....	69
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	74
<b>C. Responding to the Complaint</b> .....	76
1. Rule 12 Motions .....	76
2. The Answer .....	79
<i>Milton v. General Dynamics Ordnance and Tactical Systems,</i> <i>Inc.</i> .....	79
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	80
<i>Racick v. Dominion Law Associates</i> .....	83
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	85
<b>D. Amending the Pleadings</b> .....	87
<i>Williams v. Citigroup Inc.</i> .....	87
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	90
<i>Tran v. Alphonse Hotel Corp.</i> .....	92
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	94
<b>E. Policing Pleadings and Motions</b> .....	97
<i>Patsy's Brand, Inc. v. I.O.B. Realty, Inc.</i> .....	97
<i>In re Pennie &amp; Edmonds LLP</i> .....	102
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	104
<i>Frantz v. United States Powerlifting Federation</i> .....	108
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	111

---

**CHAPTER THREE: DISCOVERY** ..... 113

Sec.

<b>A. Perspectives on Discovery</b> .....	114
Julius Byron Levine, <i>Discovery</i> .....	114
Geoffrey C. Hazard, Jr., <i>Discovery and the Role of the Judge in</i> <i>Civil Law Jurisdictions</i> .....	114
Stephen N. Subrin, <i>Discovery in Global Perspective: Are We Nuts?</i>	115
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	117
<b>B. The Mechanics of Discovery</b> .....	119
1. Party-Initiated Discovery Devices .....	120
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	121
2. Required Initial Disclosure .....	123
3. Supplementing Discovery and Disclosure Answers .....	124
<b>C. The Scope of and Limits on Discovery</b> .....	125
1. Relevance and Proportionality .....	127
<i>In re Cooper Tire &amp; Rubber Co.</i> .....	127
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	132
<i>W.E. Aubuchon Co. v. BeneFirst, LLC</i> .....	134
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	139
2. Privilege and Work Product .....	144
<i>Hickman v. Taylor</i> .....	144
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	153
<i>Republic of Ecuador v. Bjorkman</i> .....	156
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	160
<b>D. Handling Discovery Disputes: Herein of Discovery</b>	
<b>Sanctions</b> .....	163
1. Motions to Compel .....	164
<i>National Hockey League v. Metropolitan Hockey Club, Inc.</i> ..	164
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	167
2. Motions for Protective Orders .....	170
<i>Phillips v. General Motors Corp.</i> .....	170
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	172
3. Certifications in the Discovery Process .....	174
4. Other Sanctions .....	175

---

**CHAPTER FOUR: CASE MANAGEMENT, SETTLEMENT, AND  
ALTERNATIVE DISPUTE RESOLUTION** ..... 176

Sec.

<b>A. Perspectives on Case Management, Settlement, and     Alternative Dispute Resolution</b> .....	178
---	-----

## Sec.

**A. Perspectives on Case Management, Settlement, and  
Alternative Dispute Resolution — Continued**

William W Schwarzer, <i>The Federal Rules, the Adversary Process, and Discovery Reform</i> . . . . .	178
Judith Resnik, <i>Managerial Judges</i> . . . . .	180
Owen M. Fiss, <i>Against Settlement</i> . . . . .	181
<i>Notes and Questions</i> . . . . .	184

**B. Case Management** . . . . . 187

1. The Scheduling Order . . . . .	188
<i>Tower Ventures, Inc. v. City of Westfield</i> . . . . .	188
<i>Notes and Questions</i> . . . . .	191
2. Some Basic Case-Management Techniques . . . . .	193
<i>Manual for Complex Litigation, Fourth</i> . . . . .	193
<i>Acuna v. Brown &amp; Root Inc.</i> . . . . .	194
<i>Ocean Atlantic Woodland Corp. v. DRH Cambridge     Homes, Inc.</i> . . . . .	196
<i>Notes and Questions</i> . . . . .	197
3. Final Disclosures and the Final Pretrial Order . . . . .	199
<i>R.M.R. v. Muscogee County School District</i> . . . . .	199
<i>Notes and Questions</i> . . . . .	202

**C. Settlement and Alternative Dispute Resolution** . . . . . 203

1. An Overview . . . . .	204
Leonard L. Riskin et al., <i>Dispute Resolution and Lawyers</i> . . . . .	204
<i>Notes</i> . . . . .	208
2. Settlement . . . . .	209
<i>Marek v. Chesny</i> . . . . .	210
<i>Notes and Questions</i> . . . . .	215
3. Using ADR Techniques in Litigation . . . . .	217
<i>In re Atlantic Pipe Corp.</i> . . . . .	217
<i>Notes and Questions</i> . . . . .	224
4. Arbitration, Unconscionability, and Preemption . . . . .	225
<i>AT&amp;T Mobility LLC v. Concepcion</i> . . . . .	225
<i>Notes and Questions</i> . . . . .	232

---

**CHAPTER FIVE: JUDGE AND JURY** . . . . . 236

## Sec.

**A. Perspectives on Jury Trial** . . . . . 238

Lawrence M. Friedman, <i>Some Notes on the Civil Jury in Historical Perspective</i> . . . . .	238
<i>Notes and Questions</i> . . . . .	240

Sec.

<b>B. Summary Judgment</b> .....	241
<i>Celotex Corp. v. Catrett</i> .....	242
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	246
<i>Scott v. Harris</i> .....	249
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	253
<b>C. Jury Trial</b> .....	256
1. The Right to Trial by Jury in Federal Civil Cases .....	256
<i>Chauffeurs, Teamsters and Helpers, Local No. 391 v. Terry</i> ..	257
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	263
<i>Markman v. Westview Instruments, Inc.</i> .....	266
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	271
2. Selecting a Jury .....	274
<i>Edmonson v. Leesville Concrete Co.</i> .....	274
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	280
3. Motion for Judgment as a Matter of Law .....	281
<i>Reeves v. Sanderson Plumbing Products, Inc.</i> .....	281
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	288
4. Jury Instructions, Special Verdicts, and General Verdicts with Jury Interrogatories .....	290
5. Renewed Motion for Judgment as a Matter of Law and Motion for a New Trial .....	292
a. Renewed Motion for Judgment as a Matter of Law .....	292
i. Timing .....	292
ii. Grounds .....	292
iii. Limits on Renewed Motion .....	292
b. New Trial .....	293
i. Timing .....	293
ii. Grounds .....	293
iii. Limits on Motion for New Trial .....	294
c. Constitutional Considerations .....	294
d. Relationship Between Judgment as a Matter of Law and New Trial .....	294
<i>Unitherm Food Systems, Inc. v. Swift-Eckrich, Inc.</i> .....	295
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	298
<b>D. Factfinding in Trials Without a Jury</b> .....	301
1. Selecting the Factfinder: The Advisory Jury and Special Masters .....	301
2. Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law .....	302
3. Motions to Terminate Trial and Post-Trial Motions .....	302

## Sec.

<b>E. Relief from a Judgment or Order</b> .....	304
<i>Ackermann v. United States</i> .....	304
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	308

---

**CHAPTER SIX: APPEALS** ..... 311

## Sec.

<b>A. The Structure and Functions of Appellate Courts</b> .....	311
1. Structure of Appellate-Court Systems .....	311
2. Correcting Error, Settling Conflicts, and Articulating the Law .....	313
<b>B. Basic Concepts</b> .....	315
1. Appealability .....	315
2. Reviewability .....	319
3. Standard of Review .....	319

---

**CHAPTER SEVEN: JUDGMENTS** ..... 322

## Sec.

<b>A. Perspectives on Judgments</b> .....	323
American Law Institute, <i>Restatement (Second) of Judgments</i> ...	323
<i>Notes</i> .....	328
<b>B. Claim Preclusion</b> .....	330
American Law Institute, <i>Restatement (Second) of Judgments</i> ...	330
<i>Notes</i> .....	330
<i>Rush v. City of Maple Heights</i> .....	332
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	337
<b>C. Issue Preclusion</b> .....	338
American Law Institute, <i>Restatement (Second) of Judgments</i> ...	338
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	339
<i>Parklane Hosiery Co. v. Shore</i> .....	342
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	347
<b>D. Interjurisdictional Preclusion</b> .....	351
<i>Questions</i> .....	353
<b>E. Law of the Case and Stare Decisis</b> .....	354
1. Law of the Case .....	354
2. Stare Decisis .....	355

**CHAPTER EIGHT: JOINDER OF CLAIMS AND PARTIES . . . . . 357**

Sec.

**A. Perspectives on Joinder . . . . . 358**Abram Chayes, *The Role of the Judge in Public Law**Litigation* . . . . . 358Lon L. Fuller, *The Forms and Limits of Adjudication* . . . . . 359*Notes and Questions* . . . . . 360**B. A Primer on Jurisdiction . . . . . 361****C. Claim Joinder . . . . . 363**

1. Asserting Multiple Claims Against the Defendant . . . . . 364

2. Asserting Multiple Defenses Against the Plaintiff . . . . . 365

3. Asserting Claims Against the Plaintiff . . . . . 366

*Painter v. Harvey* . . . . . 366*Notes and Questions* . . . . . 370**D. Party Joinder . . . . . 373**

1. Permissive Party Joinder . . . . . 373

a. Joining Additional Plaintiffs and Defendants . . . . . 374

*Alexander v. Fulton County* . . . . . 374*Notes and Questions* . . . . . 377

b. Impleading Third-Party Defendants . . . . . 379

*Lehman v. Revolution Portfolio LLC* . . . . . 380*Notes and Questions* . . . . . 383

c. Asserting Additional Claims . . . . . 385

*Luyster v. Textron, Inc.* . . . . . 385*Notes and Questions* . . . . . 389

2. Required Joinder Under Rule 19 . . . . . 390

*Makah Indian Tribe v. Verity* . . . . . 391*Notes and Questions* . . . . . 395

3. Intervention . . . . . 398

*Grutter v. Bollinger* . . . . . 398*Notes and Questions* . . . . . 403

4. Other Joinder Rules . . . . . 406

a. Interpleader . . . . . 406

b. Class Actions . . . . . 407

**CHAPTER NINE: PERSONAL JURISDICTION AND VENUE . . . . . 409**

Sec.

**A. Perspectives on Personal Jurisdiction . . . . . 410**



## Sec.

**A. Perspectives on Personal Jurisdiction — Continued**

Wendy Collins Perdue, <i>Personal Jurisdiction and the Beetle in the Box</i> .....	410
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	415

**B. From Presence to Contacts** ..... 416

<i>Pennoyer v. Neff</i> .....	417
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	420
<i>International Shoe Co. v. Washington</i> .....	422
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	426
<i>Shaffer v. Heitner</i> .....	427
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	434

**C. Applying Minimum Contacts** ..... 436

1. The First Step: Statutes or Court Rules as the Authority for Exercising Personal Jurisdiction .....	436
2. The Second Step: Constitutional Authority and Minimum-Contacts Analysis .....	437
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	440
<i>World-Wide Volkswagen Corp. v. Woodson</i> .....	441
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	449
<i>J. McIntyre Machinery, Ltd. v. Nicastro</i> .....	455
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	469
<i>Zippo Manufacturing Co. v. Zippo Dot Com, Inc.</i> .....	471
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	476

**D. Beyond Minimum Contacts: Other Bases for Jurisdiction** ..... 478

1. General Jurisdiction .....	478
<i>Goodyear Dunlop Tires Operations, S.A. v. Brown</i> .....	478
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	483
2. “Presence”: Service in the Forum State .....	485
<i>Burnham v. Superior Court</i> .....	485
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	497
3. Consent and Waiver .....	499
<i>Carnival Cruise Lines, Inc. v. Shute</i> .....	499
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	504

**E. The Requirement of Notice** ..... 505

<i>Mullane v. Central Hanover Bank &amp; Trust Co.</i> .....	505
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	512

**F. Personal Jurisdiction in Federal Court** ..... 513**G. Venue** ..... 515

1. Original Venue .....	515
2. Change of Venue .....	517

Sec.

**G. Venue — Continued**

<i>Piper Aircraft Co. v. Reyno</i> .....	519
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	525

**CHAPTER TEN: SUBJECT MATTER JURISDICTION** ..... 526

Sec.

**A. Perspectives on Subject Matter Jurisdiction** ..... 526

Donald L. Doernberg, <i>There's No Reason for It; It's Just Our Policy: Why the Well-Pleaded Complaint Rule Sabotages the Purposes of Federal Question Jurisdiction</i> .....	527
Burt Neuborne, <i>The Myth of Parity</i> .....	529
Larry Kramer, <i>Diversity Jurisdiction</i> .....	531
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	533

**B. Federal-Question Jurisdiction** ..... 534

1. The "Well-Pleaded Complaint" Rule .....	534
<i>Louisville &amp; Nashville Railroad Co. v. Mottley</i> .....	534
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	536
2. Sufficiency of the Federal Question .....	539
<i>Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals Inc. v. Thompson</i> .....	540
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	547
<i>Grable &amp; Sons Metal Products, Inc. v. Darue Engineering &amp; Manufacturing</i> .....	548
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	552

**C. Diversity Jurisdiction** ..... 554

1. Diversity of Citizenship .....	554
a. The Complete Diversity Rule .....	555
b. Determining Citizenship .....	555
<i>Sheehan v. Gustafson</i> .....	555
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	557
<i>Hertz Corp. v. Friend</i> .....	560
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	566
2. Amount in Controversy .....	568
<i>JTH Tax, Inc. v. Frashier</i> .....	568
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	570

**D. Supplemental Jurisdiction** ..... 572

<i>United Mine Workers of America v. Gibbs</i> .....	572
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	574
<i>Exxon Mobil Corp. v. Allapattah Services, Inc.</i> .....	579
<i>Notes and Questions</i> .....	587

**E. Removal Jurisdiction and Procedure** ..... 589

---

 Sec.

**E. Removal Jurisdiction and Procedure — Continued**

<i>Spencer v. U.S. District Court for the Northern District of California</i> . . . . .	589
<i>Notes and Questions</i> . . . . .	591

---

**CHAPTER ELEVEN: STATE LAW IN FEDERAL COURTS**

<b>(THE <i>ERIE</i> DOCTRINE)</b> . . . . .	595
---	-----

Sec.

<b>A. Perspectives on <i>Erie</i></b> . . . . .	595
Rules of Decision Act . . . . .	596
<i>Swift v. Tyson</i> . . . . .	596
<i>Erie Railroad Co. v. Tompkins</i> . . . . .	598
Edward A. Purcell, Jr., <i>Brandeis and the Progressive Constitution</i> . . . . .	603
<i>Notes and Questions</i> . . . . .	605
<b>B. Developing and Applying <i>Erie</i> in the Procedural Context</b> .	607
<i>Guaranty Trust Co. of New York v. York</i> . . . . .	607
<i>Ragan v. Merchants Transfer &amp; Warehouse Co.</i> . . . . .	609
<i>Notes and Questions</i> . . . . .	611
<i>Hanna v. Plumer</i> . . . . .	615
<i>Notes and Questions</i> . . . . .	621
<i>Walker v. Armco Steel Corp.</i> . . . . .	624
<i>Notes and Questions</i> . . . . .	628
<i>Gasperini v. Center for Humanities, Inc.</i> . . . . .	630
<i>Notes and Questions</i> . . . . .	633
<i>Shady Grove Orthopedic Associates, P.A. v. Allstate Insurance Co.</i> .	634
<i>Notes and Questions</i> . . . . .	642
<b>C. Ascertaining the Content of State Law</b> . . . . .	643
<i>Webber v. Sobba</i> . . . . .	644
<i>Notes and Questions</i> . . . . .	647

---

**CHAPTER TWELVE: CLASS ACTIONS** . . . . . 651

Sec.

<b>A. Perspectives on Class Actions</b> . . . . .	652
David L. Shapiro, <i>Class Actions: The Class as Party and Client</i> .	652
<i>Notes and Questions</i> . . . . .	655
<b>B. Class Actions: The Basics</b> . . . . .	656
1. Requirements of Class Representation: Rule 23(a) . . . . .	657
2. Types of Class Actions: Rule 23(b) . . . . .	659
3. Applying Rules 23(a) and (b) . . . . .	662

Sec.

**B. Class Actions: The Basics— Continued**

<i>Haley v. Medtronic, Inc.</i> . . . . .	662
<i>Notes and Questions</i> . . . . .	669
<i>Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. v. Dukes</i> . . . . .	670
<i>Notes</i> . . . . .	677

**C. Procedural Doctrines Reconsidered . . . . . 679**

1. Personal Jurisdiction . . . . .	679
<i>Phillips Petroleum Co. v. Shutts</i> . . . . .	679
<i>Notes and Questions</i> . . . . .	684
2. Subject Matter Jurisdiction . . . . .	686
<i>Preston v. Tenet Healthsystem Memorial Medical Center, Inc.</i> . . . . .	688
<i>Notes and Questions</i> . . . . .	696
3. Preclusion . . . . .	698
<i>Stephenson v. Dow Chemical Co.</i> . . . . .	699
<i>Notes and Questions</i> . . . . .	703
4. <i>Erie</i> . . . . .	705
<i>In re Rhone-Poulenc Rorer, Inc.</i> . . . . .	706
<i>Shady Grove Orthopedic Associates, P.A. v. Allstate Insurance Co.</i> . . . . .	707
<i>Notes and Questions</i> . . . . .	707
5. Trial . . . . .	709

**D. Settlement Class Actions: Resolving Widespread Disputes**

<b>Without Adversary Litigation</b> . . . . .	712
<i>Amchem Products, Inc. v. Windsor</i> . . . . .	712
<i>Notes and Questions</i> . . . . .	720

---

<b>INDEX</b> . . . . .	725
------------------------	-----