

# EU Law and Private International Law

The Interrelationship in Contractual Obligations

*By*

Jan-Jaap Kuipers

MARTINUS  

---

NIJHOFF  

---

PUBLISHERS

LEIDEN • BOSTON  
2012

## CONTENTS

Acknowledgements .....	xi
1. Introduction: EU Private International Law.....	1
1.1 Private International Law at a Turning Point.....	2
1.2 The Structure of the Book.....	4
1.3 The Communautarisation of Private International Law .....	6
1.3.1 Legal Basis .....	8
1.3.2 Maastricht, Amsterdam and Nice .....	12
1.3.3 Union Instruments .....	14
1.3.4 A New Legal Basis in the Lisbon Treaty .....	15
1.3.5 External Competences .....	16
1.3.6 Regulation 662/2009 .....	19
1.4 Conflict of Laws Rules in Sectoral Instruments .....	21
1.5 Influence of Primary Union Law upon the Conflict of Law Rules .....	23
1.5.1 The Compatibility of Connecting Factors with the TFEU.....	25
1.6 The Method of Interpretation .....	28
1.6.1 The Method of Interpretation Relating to Rome I .....	30
1.7 European Public Policy.....	32
2. Rome I Regulation: Party Autonomy as its Cornerstone.....	35
2.1 A Birds-Eye View on the Development of Private International Law .....	35
2.1.1 Rome Convention and Rome I Regulation .....	39
2.1.2 The Content of the Common Rules .....	41
2.1.3 Party Autonomy.....	44
2.1.4 Party Autonomy in Rome I .....	47
2.1.5 The Success of Party Autonomy.....	48
2.2 The Function and Operation of Overriding Mandatory Provisions.....	54
2.2.1 The Origins of Overriding Mandatory Provisions.....	56
2.2.2 The Rome Convention .....	59
2.2.3 Acceptance of Overriding Mandatory Provisions.....	61

2.3	What are Overriding Mandatory Provisions?.....	63
2.3.1	Mandatory vs Overriding Mandatory Provisions .....	63
2.3.2	Ordre Public vs Overriding Mandatory Provisions.....	65
2.3.3	Overriding Mandatory Provisions vs Unilateral Conflict of Laws Rules .....	67
2.3.4	Definition of Overriding Mandatory Provisions.....	68
2.3.5	Crucial for Safeguarding the Political, Social or Economic Organisation of the State.....	70
2.3.6	Union Law .....	72
2.3.7	Conditions for Application .....	76
2.4	Foreign Overriding Mandatory Provisions.....	78
2.4.1	The Scope of the Applicable Law.....	79
2.4.2	The Rome Convention .....	81
2.4.3	Article 9 (3) Rome I: A Solution to a Political Problem .....	85
2.4.4	Discretion or General Obligation to Apply Overriding Mandatory Provisions of Other Member States.....	89
2.5	Party Autonomy, Protective Connecting Factors and Overriding Mandatory Provisions .....	93
2.5.1	Distinguishing Between First and Second Generation Overriding Mandatory Provisions .....	93
2.5.2	The Position of the ECJ.....	97
2.5.3	Public or Private Interest in Article 9 (1) Rome I?.....	99
2.5.4	Consumers.....	100
2.5.5	Article 5 Rome Convention .....	101
2.5.6	Article 6 Rome I.....	102
2.5.7	The Residual Function of Overriding Mandatory Provisions .....	106
2.5.8	Employees.....	108
2.6	Special Connecting Factors.....	113
2.6.1	Contracts of Carriage.....	113
2.6.2	Insurance Contracts .....	118
2.7	Intermediate Conclusions.....	121
3.	Overriding Mandatory Provisions: The National Perspective.....	125
3.1.	France.....	125
3.1.1	Classification .....	128
3.1.2	Self Limitation.....	133

3.1.3 Foreign Overriding Mandatory Provisions.....	133
3.2 Germany.....	136
3.2.1 Classification.....	143
3.2.2 Self Limitation.....	146
3.2.3 Foreign Overriding Mandatory Provisions.....	147
3.3 The Netherlands.....	149
3.3.1 Classification.....	154
3.3.2 Self Limitation.....	156
3.3.3 Foreign Overriding Mandatory Provisions.....	157
3.4 The United Kingdom.....	161
3.4.1 Classification.....	165
3.4.2 Self Limitation.....	167
3.4.3 Foreign Overriding Mandatory Provisions.....	168
3.5 Comparative Conclusions .....	171
3.5.1 The Necessity for a Preliminary Reference.....	173
4. The Scope of Secondary Union Law: A Matter for Rome I?.....	177
4.1 Private International Law in Secondary Union Law Instruments.....	181
4.1.1 Data Protection Directive.....	183
4.1.2 Return of Cultural Objects Directive.....	186
4.1.3 Timeshare Directive.....	186
4.1.4 Unfair Contract Terms Directive.....	187
4.1.5 Relationship to the Conflict of Laws Process.....	189
4.2 An Autonomous Approach in the Consumer Acquis?.....	192
4.3 Autonomous Determination of the International Scope of Application of Secondary Law.....	197
4.3.1 Ingmar as Authority for an Autonomous Approach .....	199
4.3.2 An Autonomous Approach via Overriding Mandatory Provisions.....	202
4.3.3 An Autonomous Approach via (implicit) Unilateral Conflict of Law Rules.....	204
4.4 Ingmar – A Judgment Open for Revision?.....	208
4.5 The Legislative History of art. 23 Rome I Regulation.....	210
4.5.1 Transformation into Rome I: The Wider Perspective.....	212
4.6 Contracts Involving a Link with a Third Country .....	214
4.6.1 Americanisation or Unfamiliarity with Conflict of Laws? .....	217

4.6.2 A Possible Solution to the 'Gran Canaria Problem' .....	219
4.7 Unilateral Conflict of Law Rules in Secondary Law Reconsidered.....	220
4.7.1 Exclusion of Private Autonomy .....	224
4.8 Interim Conclusions.....	225
4.9 An Autonomous Approach in Labour Law? .....	228
4.9.1 The TUPE Directive .....	232
4.9.2 The Worker Participation General Framework Directive.....	234
4.9.3 Ordre Public.....	235
4.9.4 Posted Workers Directive .....	236
4.10 Unilateral Conflict of Law Rules in Insurance Contracts and Contracts of Carriage.....	238
4.10.1 The Denied Boarding Regulation.....	240
4.10.2 The Cabotage Transport Regulation .....	241
4.11 Conclusions .....	242
5. The Harmonisation of Contract Law by the Union.....	245
5.1 The Harmonisation of Contract Law .....	246
5.2 The Issue of Competence.....	250
5.2.1 Optional Instrument .....	253
5.2.2 Redundancy of Private International Law.....	256
5.3 The Feasibility of Common Rules .....	258
5.3.1 Legal Innovation and Competition for the Best Legal System .....	259
5.3.2 Varying Local Preferences.....	262
5.4 Heterogeneous and Homogeneous Legal Products .....	265
5.4.1 Homogeneous and Heterogeneous – Efficiency and Welfare Distribution.....	267
5.5 Reintroducing Conflict of Laws.....	269
5.6 What Role for Private International Law? .....	272
6. Free Movement and the Determination of the Applicable Law.....	275
6.1 Private Parties and the Free Movement Provisions.....	275
6.1.1 Justification.....	280
6.2 Free Movement and Contract Law.....	283
6.2.1 The Absence of a Favor Offerentis.....	285

6.3	Separating 'Public' from 'Private'.....	288
6.3.1	Is Mutual Recognition Appropriate in Contract Law? .....	290
6.3.2	Mutual Recognition versus Vested Rights.....	290
6.4	Company Law .....	291
6.4.1	Real Seat Doctrine under Pressure? .....	293
6.4.2	Cartesio .....	294
6.5	Surname Law.....	297
6.5.1	The Recognition of Rights Acquired under the Laws of another Member State.....	299
6.6	Vested Rights.....	303
6.6.1	Vested Rights versus Mutual Recognition.....	304
6.6.2	The Rebirth of Vested Rights.....	306
6.6.3	Vested Rights: A Better Insight to ECJ Case-Law? .....	307
6.6.4	Vested Rights Beyond Company and Surname law? .....	308
6.6.5	The Duty to Recognise Originates in Union Law .....	310
6.6.6	Legitimate Divergence of National Connecting Factors .....	312
6.6.7	Legitimate Divergence between Potentially Applicable National Laws .....	312
6.6.8	No Vested Rights Doctrine in Contract Law .....	313
6.7	The Free Movement and Private Autonomy .....	313
6.7.1	The Possibility of Choosing the Applicable Law .....	314
6.7.2	The Scope of Alsthom Atlantique.....	314
6.8	Specific Rules of Contract Law and the Fundamental Freedoms .....	317
6.8.1	How to Distinguish between Rules of Administrative Authorisations and Overriding Mandatory Provisions? .....	318
6.8.2	Free Movement and Protective Connecting Factors.....	320
6.9	Justification of a Restriction .....	321
6.9.1	Legitimate Aim .....	322
6.9.2	Suitability .....	326
6.9.3	Necessity .....	327
6.10	The E-Commerce Directive .....	329
6.10.1	Should Article 1 (4) be Ignored? .....	330

6.10.2 The Harmonised Field as Overriding  
Mandatory Provisions ..... 333

6.10.3 eDate Advertising ..... 333

6.10.4 The Directive may Affect Private law, but not  
Conflict of Laws ..... 334

6.11 Conclusions ..... 337

Bibliography ..... 339

Index ..... 367