

EUROPEAN SOCIAL SECURITY LAW

Frans PENNINGS

Fifth edition



intersentia

Antwerp – Oxford – Portland

CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	v
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xix

PART I. COORDINATION

Chapter 1.

Introduction to the Concept of Coordination.	3
---	---

1.1. General	3
1.2. The Territoriality Principle	4
1.3. A Definition of Coordination	6
1.4. Tasks of a Coordination Instrument	7
1.4.1. Solving Conflicts of Law	8
1.4.2. Prohibition of Discrimination on the Basis of Nationality	9
1.4.3. Territorial Requirements for Acquiring Benefit Rights	10
1.4.4. Territorial Requirements for Payment of Benefit	10

Chapter 2.

The Institutional Context of Regulation 883/2004.	13
--	----

2.1. The Requirements for Deciding on a Coordination Regulation	13
2.2. The Court of Justice	14
2.3. The Legal Basis for the Coordination Regulation	15
2.4. Article 48 TFEU directly applied in Coordination Cases	17
2.5. A Very Short History of the Coordination Regulations	19
2.6. The Structure of Regulation 883/2004	21

Chapter 3.

The Conditions for Applicability of Regulation 883/2004.	25
---	----

3.1. Introduction	25
3.2. The Facts of the Case Must not be Restricted to One Member State	25
3.3. The Territorial Scope of Regulation 883/2004	27

Chapter 4.

The Personal Scope of Regulation 883/2004. 31

4.1.	Introduction	31
4.2.	An Historical Overview of the Personal Scope of Regulations 3 and 1408/71	32
4.3.	The Personal Scope of Regulation 883/2004.	35
4.3.1.	Introduction	35
4.3.2.	The Requirement of being Subject to the Legislation of a Member State	35
4.3.3.	The Nationality Condition	36
4.3.4.	Stateless Persons and Refugees.	38
4.4.	Third Country Nationals are covered by a Separate Regulation	39
4.5.	Members of the Family and Survivors	42

Chapter 5.

The Material Scope of Regulation 883/2004. 47

5.1.	Introduction	47
5.2.	The Term Legislation and the Exclusion of Contractual Schemes	48
5.3.	The Classification of Benefits	50
5.3.1.	Introduction: A Limited Material Scope	50
5.3.2.	<i>The Criteria for Classifying Benefits.</i>	51
5.3.3.	The Coverage of Benefits which form Part of Schemes outside the Material Scope and the Coverage of Schemes containing Rules not related to Social Security Benefits	53
5.3.4.	Taxation and the Coordination Regulation	54
5.3.5.	Liability of Employers and the Scope of the Regulation	55
5.4.	Benefits for Victims of War or Its Consequences	56
5.5.	Social and Medical Assistance	57
5.6.	Special Non-Contributory Benefits	60
5.6.1.	The Provisions relevant to the Special Non-contributory Benefits	60
5.6.2.	The Interpretation of the Word 'Reside'.	61
5.6.3.	The Qualification as Special Non-contributory Benefit.	62
5.6.4.	Revision of the Annex as a Result of the Leclere Judgment	65
5.6.5.	Non-exportability of the Special Non-contributory Benefits and Free Movement	67

Chapter 6.

The Rules for Determining the Legislation Applicable.....	71
6.1. Introduction.....	71
6.2. The Main Characteristics of the Rules for Determining the Legislation Applicable	71
6.2.1. The State of Employment Principle	71
6.2.2. The Exclusive Effect of the Rules for Determining the Legislation Applicable	73
Introduction	73
The Right of Member States to Grant Benefit even if the Legislation applies of another Member State	75
6.2.3. The Binding Effect of the Rules for Determining the Legislation Applicable	78
The Case Law under Regulation 1408/71	78
The binding Effect and Regulation 883/2004	79
6.2.4. The Practical Effect Doctrine	80
6.2.5. The Inescapability of the Rules for determining the Legislation applicable.....	81
6.2.6. Special Rules for Determining the Legislation applicable for specific Benefits	82
6.3. The Legislation applicable for Persons working in one Member State only.....	82
6.4. The Legislation applicable for Persons who ceased working	83
6.4.1. The Case Law under Regulation 1408/71	84
The <i>Ten Holder, Daalmeijer</i> and <i>Kuusijärvi</i> Judgments.....	84
The <i>Van Pommerden-Bourgon diën</i> judgment.....	86
6.4.2. Regulation 883/2004 and Post-active Persons	87
6.5. The Applicable Rules for Unemployed Persons.....	88
6.6. The Applicable Rules for Non-active Persons	88
6.7. Persons Working Simultaneously in Two or More Member States.....	88
6.7.1. Working as an Employee in Two or More Member States	89
6.7.2. Working as a Self-employed Person in Two or More Member States	91
6.7.3. Working in one State as Employed Person and in the other as Self-employed	92
6.8. The Legislation Applicable to Civil Servants	94
6.9. The Rules applicable to Special Non-Contributory Benefits	94
6.10. The Coordination System for Compulsory and Voluntary Insurance... ..	95
6.11. Persons Working Outside the Territory of the EU	95
6.12. Transitional Rules	96

Chapter 7.

Posting	97
7.1. Posting of Employees	97
7.1.1. Conditions for Posting	97
The Employee is sent to work on that Employer's Behalf	98
The Employer normally carries out his Activities in the sending State	99
The Employee is subject to the Legislation of the sending State	100
The Employee is not sent to replace another Person	101
The Employee is not sent for more than 24 Months	102
7.1.2. Posting by an Agency for Temporary Work	103
7.1.3. Posting and Social Dumping	103
7.2. Posting of Self-employed Persons	104
The Case Law under Regulation 1408/71	104
Conditions for Posting as Self-employed Person under Regulation 883/2004	106
7.3. The Relevance of a Posting Certificate	107
7.4. The Small Border Line between Posting and Working Simultaneously in Two Countries	109
7.5. Agreements on the Basis of Article 16	110

Chapter 8.

The Non-discrimination and Assimilation Provisions of Regulation

883/2004	111
8.1. Introduction	111
8.2. Article 4 of Regulation 883/2004	112
8.3. Assimilation of Receipt of Benefit, Events and Facts (Article 5)	116
8.4. Waiving of Residence Conditions (Article 7)	117
8.5. Aggregation of Periods (Article 6)	118
8.6. The General Rules against Overlapping	118

Chapter 9.

The Non-discrimination Provision of Regulation 1612/68

9.1. Introduction	121
9.2. The Personal Scope	122
9.2.1. Workers	122
Job Seekers and former Workers	124
9.2.2. Members of the Family	125
9.3. The Material Scope	126
9.4. The Non-Discrimination Provision	127

Objective Justifications related to Degree of Integration in the Work State: the Geven Judgment	128
9.5. The Relationship between Regulation 883/2004 and Regulation 1612/68	130
Chapter 10.	
Non-discrimination and Free Movement Provisions of the Treaty	133
10.1. General	133
10.2. Article 45 TFEU: Prohibiting Discrimination on the Ground of Nationality	133
10.3. Article 45 TFEU: Obstacles to Free Movement are not allowed	135
The <i>Hendrix</i> Judgment.....	136
10.4. Article 49 TFEU and Equal Treatment of the Self-employed.....	139
10.5. Article 21: European Citizenship	139
The <i>Martínez Sala</i> judgment	140
The <i>Grzelczyk</i> and <i>Trojani</i> Judgments	142
The <i>Bidar</i> and <i>Föster</i> Judgments	143
European Citizenship and Free Movement: the <i>Tas-Hagen</i> Judgment ..	145
10.6. Overview of the Relation between Regulation 883/2004, Regulation 1612/68 and Article 18 TFEU	146
Chapter 11.	
Sickness Benefits	149
11.1. The Meaning of the Term Sickness Benefit.....	149
11.2. The Distinction between Benefits in Cash and Benefits in Kind.....	151
11.3. Benefits in Cash.....	152
11.3.1. Aggregation Rules.....	152
11.3.2. Benefits in Cash are exportable	152
11.3.3. Claiming and Supervision Procedures.....	153
11.4. Benefits in Kind for Persons not residing in the Competent State	156
11.4.1. Persons not residing in the Competent State	156
Persons not residing in the competent State are entitled to Benefits in State of Residence.....	156
Persons not residing in the Competent State are also entitled to Benefits in the Competent State	157
11.4.2. Members of the Family of Frontier Workers	157
11.4.3. Retired Frontier Workers	159
11.4.4. The Relation between Independent and Derivative Rights....	160
11.4.5. Pensioners and Members of Their Family.....	160

	The Pensioner receives one or more Pensions and is not entitled to Benefits in Kind under the Legislation of the State of Residence	161
	Summary	162
	If the Right to Benefits in Kind is not subject to Conditions of Insurance or Employment	162
	Pensioners who go for Planned Care to the competent State..	162
	If Family Members do not Reside in the same Country as the Pensioner	163
11.4.6.	Levying Contributions on Pensioners	163
11.4.7.	Coordination of Care Insurance Benefits in Case of Overlapping of Benefits in Kind and Benefits in Cash.....	164
11.5.	Stay outside the Competent State: Benefits which become Necessary..	164
11.6.	Planned Care	166
11.6.1.	Planned Care and Authorisation.....	166
	The Criterion of the Possibility to obtain Health Care within undue Delay	168
11.6.2.	Obtaining Planned Care without Authorisation on the Basis of the Treaty	168
	The <i>Kohll</i> and <i>Decker</i> Case Law.....	168
	Applicability to Hospitals	170
	Undue Delay.....	172
	Confirmation of the Case law on Non-hospital Care.....	172
	Level of Reimbursement and Travel and Accommodation Costs.....	173
	Summary.....	174
11.6.3.	The Draft Directive on Patients' Rights in Cross-border Healthcare.....	176
	Reimbursement under the Directive	177
	Hospital Care and Non-Hospital Care.....	178
11.7.	Reimbursement Rules	178
 Chapter 12.		
Old-Age and Survivor's Pensions		179
12.1.	Introduction	179
12.2.	Aggregation of Periods	180
12.3.	Calculation of the Amount of Benefits	182
12.3.1.	Calculation of the Independent Benefit.....	182
12.3.2.	The Pro-Rata Benefit	182
	The Theoretical Amount	182
	The Pro-Rata Benefit	183
12.3.3.	Comparison of the Independent and Pro-Rata Benefits	184

12.4.	The History of the Community Rules to Prevent Overlapping: the <i>Petroni</i> Case Law	185
12.5.	The Present Rules to Prevent Overlapping	186
12.5.1.	Introduction	186
12.5.2.	General Principles	187
12.5.3.	Overlapping of Benefits of the Same Kind	187
12.5.4.	Overlapping of Benefits of a Different Kind	188
12.6.	Recalculation of Benefits	189
12.7.	Removing Effects of Differing National Schemes	190
12.8.	Periods Completed before the Coming into Force of the Regulation ..	192
12.9.	The Relationship between International Conventions and the Regulation	192
12.10.	The Coordination of Supplementary Pensions	193
12.10.1.	General	193
12.10.2.	Directive 98/49 on Safeguarding the Supplementary Pension Rights of Employed and Self-employed Persons moving within the Community	194
12.10.3.	Proposal for a Directive on Improving the Portability of Supplementary Pension Rights	195
12.10.4.	Conclusion	197

Chapter 13.

Invalidity Pensions

13.1.	Introduction	199
13.2.	Aggregation Rules	201
13.3.	A Person has been exclusively Subject to Type A Schemes	201
13.4.	A Person Has Been Subject to at Least One Type B Scheme	202
13.4.1.	Determining the Incapacity for Work	203
13.4.2.	Fiction of Insurance	204
13.4.3.	The Calculation of the Amount	204
13.5.	Recalculation of Benefits	208
13.6.	Transition of Invalidity Benefits to Old-Age Benefits	208
13.7.	The Problem of Differences in Waiting Periods	209
13.8.	Benefits for Accidents at Work and Occupational Diseases	210
13.9.	Special Non-contributory Benefits for Invalidity	212

Chapter 14.

Family Benefits

14.1.	Introduction	215
14.2.	Which Benefit Level: That of the State of Employment or Residence? ..	216
14.3.	Competent State and Overruling of Residence Requirements	218

14.4.	Priority Rules	219
14.4.1.	Introduction	219
	The Relationship between the Rules for Determining the Legislation applicable and the Export Rules	221
14.4.2.	Differential Supplements	222
 Chapter 15.		
	Unemployment Benefits	225
15.1.	The Term Unemployment Benefits	225
15.2.	Overview of the System of Coordination of Unemployment Benefits ..	228
15.3.	The Unemployed Person resides in the Competent State	229
	The Claimant must have lastly completed Periods of Insurance or Periods of Work in Accordance with the Provisions of the Legislation under which the Benefits are claimed	232
15.4.	Frontier workers	234
15.4.1.	Introduction	234
15.4.2.	The Definition of Frontier Workers	234
15.4.3.	The Wholly Unemployed Frontier Workers	235
	Is the Wholly Unemployed Frontier Workers' Rule consistent with the Treaty?	235
15.4.4.	Partially Unemployed Frontier Workers	238
15.4.5.	The Frontier Worker Moves to the State of Last Employment ..	240
15.5.	Persons Other than Frontier Workers Who Do Not Reside in the Competent State	241
15.5.1.	The Criteria for Qualification as Non-frontier Worker	241
15.5.2.	The Applicable Unemployment Benefits Scheme for Non- frontier workers	242
15.6.	Atypical Frontier Workers	244
15.6.1.	The <i>Miethe</i> Judgment	244
15.6.2.	Is the <i>Miethe</i> Judgment still Relevant under Regulation 883/2004?	245
15.6.3.	The Proposal for Modernisation	248
15.7.	Reimbursement Rules	248
15.8.	The Calculation of Unemployment Benefit	249
15.9.	Export of Unemployment Benefits	251
15.9.1.	The Conditions for Export	251
15.9.2.	The Powers to Extend the Export Period	252
15.9.3.	The Loss of Remaining Benefit Rights in Case of a late Return ..	253
15.9.4.	The Present Rules	254
15.9.5.	Frontier Workers and Export of Benefit	255

Chapter 16.**The Relation between Regulation 883/2004 and Bilateral Treaties. 257**

- 16.1. Introduction 257
- 16.2. Infringement on Social Security Advantages Acquired on the Basis
of International Treaties 258

Chapter 17.**EU Agreements with Third Countries containing Coordination Provisions 263**

- 17.1. The Euro-Mediterranean Association Agreements 263
- 17.2. Decision 3/80 of the Association Council EC-Turkey 265

Chapter 18.**Some Conclusions on the Development of Coordination Law 269**

- 18.1. The Impact of the Coordination Regulation 269
- 18.2. Simplification and Modernisation 270
- 18.3. Conclusions 274

Chapter 19.**A Brief Overview of Non-EU Coordination Instruments 275**

- 19.1. Conventions of the International Labour Organisation 275
- 19.2. Conventions of the Council of Europe 276

PART II. SOCIAL POLICY**Chapter 20.****Social Policy Instruments of the European Union 281**

- 20.1. General: the Powers of the EU to take Social Policy Initiatives 281
- 20.2. The Subsidiarity Principle 282
- 20.3. The Instruments of Title X to take Social Policy Measures 284
- 20.4. The Open Method of Coordination 285

Chapter 21.**Equal Pay for Men and Women: Article 157 TFEU 291**

- 21.1. Introduction 291
- 21.2. Article 157 and Occupational Pensions 295
- 21.3. Limitation of the Temporal Effect of the *Barber* Judgment 297

21.4.	Limitation in Time in the Case of Widowers' Pensions and Age Discrimination.....	299
21.5.	Retroactive Effect in Other Cases of Unequal Treatment.....	301
21.6.	The Meaning of the Term 'Pay'	303
 Chapter 22.		
Equal Treatment of Men and Women in Statutory Social Security:		
	Directive 79/7.....	305
22.1.	Introduction.....	305
22.2.	The Personal Scope of Directive 79/7.....	306
22.3.	The Material Scope of Directive 79/7.....	311
22.4.	The Relationship of Directive 79/7 to Article 157 TFEU.....	313
22.5.	The Equal Treatment Rule of Directive 79/7	314
22.5.1.	Introduction.....	314
22.5.2.	The Direct Effect of Directive 79/7	314
22.5.3.	Prohibition of the Effects of a Former Discriminatory Rule ..	316
22.5.4.	Procedural Limitations for Realising Equal Treatment	320
22.5.5.	Indirect Discrimination.....	322
22.5.6.	The Article 7 Exception	328
22.6.	Conclusion	331
 Chapter 23.		
Equal Treatment of Men and Women: The Other Directives		
333		
23.1.	Directive 86/378	333
23.1.1.	Introduction.....	333
23.1.2.	The Personal Scope of Directive 86/378	333
23.1.3.	The Material Scope of Directive 86/378.....	334
23.1.4.	The Principle of Equal Treatment	334
23.1.5.	The Exceptions to the Principle of Equal Treatment	337
23.2.	Directive 86/613: Equal Treatment of the Self-employed.....	337
23.2.1.	Introduction.....	337
23.2.2.	The Personal Scope of Directive 86/613	338
23.2.3.	The Material Scope of Directive 86/613.....	338
23.2.4.	The Principle of Equal Treatment	338
23.3.	Proposal for a Directive Completing the Principle of Equal Treatment	339
23.3.1.	Introduction.....	339
23.3.2.	The Personal Scope of the Draft Directive	339
23.3.3.	The Material Scope of the Draft Directive.....	339
23.3.4.	The Principle of Equal Treatment.....	340

Chapter 24.

Towards a Social Europe?	343
<i>Table of Cases</i>	347
<i>Bibliography</i>	357
<i>Index on Cases</i>	371
<i>Subject Index</i>	377