

ESSENTIALS OF  
CANADIAN LAW

# CONSTITUTIONAL LAW

THIRD EDITION

**PATRICK J. MONAHAN**

Dean and Professor of Law  
Osgoode Hall Law School, York University

# DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

FOREWORD xvii

PREFACE xix

PART ONE:

INTRODUCTION 1

CHAPTER 1:

AN INTRODUCTION TO THE STUDY OF THE  
CANADIAN CONSTITUTION 3

A. The Constitution Defined 3

B. Canada's Entrenched Constitution 4

C. Key Characteristics of the Canadian Constitution 10

- 1) Canada Is a Federal State 10
- 2) Canada Is a Constitutional Monarchy 12
- 3) The Canadian Constitution Guarantees Individual and Group Rights 14
- 4) Political Power Is Concentrated Rather Than Separated 17
- 5) The Canadian Constitution Has Become Somewhat Less Flexible Since 1982 18

D. Judicial Review 22

E. The Plan of the Book 24

Further Readings 28

PART TWO:

THE FRAMEWORK AND INSTITUTIONS OF  
GOVERNMENT 29

CHAPTER 2:

CANADA'S CONSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT  
BEFORE 1867 31

A. Representative and Responsible Government 31

B. Representative Government 32

- 1) Aboriginal Government 32
- 2) French Civil Law 32
- 3) The Supremacy of Parliament in English Law 33
- 4) Representative Political Institutions in the Colonies 34
- 5) The *Royal Proclamation of 1763* 35
- 6) The *Quebec Act, 1774* 36
- 7) The *Constitutional Act, 1791* 38

C. Responsible Government 41

- 1) Lord Durham's Report 41
- 2) The *Union Act, 1840* 43
- 3) From Responsible Government to Cabinet Government 47

D. The Constitutional Negotiations of 1864–67 49

Further Readings 52

CHAPTER 3:

THE CONSTITUTION ACT, 1867: EXECUTIVE AND  
LEGISLATIVE POWER 53

A. Introduction 53

B. The *Constitution Act, 1867*, Is Entrenched 54

C. A Constitution "Similar in Principle" 55

D. Executive Power in the *Constitution Act, 1867* 56

- 1) The Queen and the Governor General 56
- 2) The Crown 57
- 3) The Powers of the Crown 58
- 4) The Queen's Privy Council for Canada 61
- 5) The Prime Minister and the Formation of the Cabinet 64
- 6) Responsible Government 66
  - a) Governor's Duty to Follow Advice 66
  - b) Appointment of the Prime Minister 66

c)	Defeat of a Government	69
d)	The King–Byng Incident	73
e)	Refusal to Accept Unconstitutional Advice?	74
7)	Lieutenant Governors of the Provinces	77
<b>E.</b>	<b>Legislative Power</b>	<b>79</b>
1)	Legislative Power in Canada	79
2)	Approval of the Governor General and the Lieutenant Governor	80
3)	Parliamentary Supremacy and the Rule of Law	81
4)	The Senate	83
a)	The Senate and the House of Commons Are Co-equal in Law	83
b)	Functions of the Senate	84
5)	The House of Commons	87
6)	The Legislative Process	89
7)	Proroguing and Dissolving Parliament	92
<b>F.</b>	<b>No Separation of Powers Between the Executive and the Legislature</b>	<b>93</b>
<b>G.</b>	<b>Executive and Legislative Power at the Provincial Level</b>	<b>95</b>
	<b>Further Readings</b>	<b>96</b>

#### CHAPTER 4:

### THE CONSTITUTION ACT, 1867: FEDERALISM AND JUDICIAL POWER 97

<b>A.</b>	<b>Federalism Defined</b>	<b>97</b>
<b>B.</b>	<b>Canada as a Federal State</b>	<b>99</b>
<b>C.</b>	<b>Federal Distribution of Legislative Powers</b>	<b>101</b>
1)	Division of Powers in Sections 91–93	101
2)	Overlap of Federal and Provincial Powers	104
3)	General Federal Legislative Power: POGG	105
4)	Enumerated Powers in Sections 91 and 92	108
a)	Federal Enumerated Powers	108
b)	Provincial Enumerated Powers	110
c)	Judicial Interpretation: Role Reversal	111
5)	Concurrent Powers	112
6)	Judicial Characterization of Laws in Federalism Cases	114
a)	The Pith and Substance Doctrine	114
b)	The Ancillary Doctrine	118
c)	Inter-jurisdictional Immunity	120
d)	Paramountcy	123
<b>D.</b>	<b>Judicial Power in the Canadian Constitution</b>	<b>126</b>
1)	The Structure of the Courts	126
a)	The Supreme Court of Canada	126

- b) Superior and Provincial Courts 131
- c) Federal Courts 132
- 2) The Independence of the Judiciary and the Rule of Law 133
- 3) Sections 96 to 100 of the *Constitution Act, 1867* 134
- 4) Judicial Review Constitutionally Guaranteed 137
- 5) Section 96 and Administrative Tribunals 141
- 6) The Rule of Law and Crown Immunity 143

**E. Division of Revenues, Assets, and Debts in 1867 144**

**Further Readings 148**

**PART THREE:**

**CONSTITUTIONAL CHANGE 151**

**CHAPTER 5:**

**CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT, 1867–1982 153**

**A. Amendment of the *British North America Act, 1867*, by the British Parliament 153**

**B. Powers of Amendment in the *BNA Act* 154**

- 1) Amendments by the British Cabinet: Admission of New Provinces 155
- 2) Amendments by the Canadian Parliament 156
  - a) Creation of New Provinces 156
  - b) Changes to the Senate and the House of Commons 158
  - c) Section 91(1) Power of Amendment 158
- 3) Provincial Power to Amend “The Constitution of the Province” 161
- 4) Constitutional Conventions Limiting Westminster’s Authority 162

**C. The Search for a Domestic Amending Formula 164**

- 1) Early Federal Predominance 164
- 2) A Convention Requiring Provincial Consent Emerges 165
- 3) Constitutional Negotiations in the 1960s and 1970s 167
- 4) The Patriation Round 169

**D. The *Canada Act, 1982* 173**

**Further Readings 175**

**CHAPTER 6:**

**CONSTITUTIONAL CHANGE SINCE 1982 176**

**A. Amendments to the Constitution of Canada 176**

**B. Legislative Versus Executive Amendment 182**

C. The Role of Referendums	186
D. The General Amending Formula: Section 38	188
1) The Scope and Application of Section 38	188
2) Opting Out and Compensation	189
3) Timing and Initiation of Amendments	192
E. Application of General Procedure in Special Cases	192
F. Unanimity Procedures	197
G. The Special Arrangements Procedure	199
H. Unilateral Federal Procedure	202
I. Unilateral Provincial Procedure	204
J. Senate Approval	204
K. Regional Veto Legislation	205
L. The <i>Meech Lake Accord</i>	207
M. The <i>Charlottetown Accord</i>	211
N. The 1995 Quebec Referendum and its Aftermath	214
O. The <i>Quebec Secession Reference</i>	215
1) The Reference Questions	215
2) Question One: The Canadian Constitution and Secession	216
3) Question Two: Secession under International Law	219
P. The Clarity Act	222
1) The Terms of the Legislation	222
2) An Assessment	225
Further Readings	228

#### PART FOUR:

### THE COURTS AND CANADIAN FEDERALISM 229

#### CHAPTER 7:

### THE COURTS AND CANADIAN FEDERALISM: FROM WATERTIGHT COMPARTMENTS TO SHARED RESPONSIBILITY 231

A. Introduction	231
B. The JCPC's Watertight Compartments View	233
C. The JCPC and POGG	235

- 1) A Promising Beginning: The *Russell* Case and the Pith and Substance Doctrine 235
- 2) The *Hodge* Case and the Aspect Doctrine 237
- 3) POGG as a Residual Power 238
- 4) POGG as an Emergency Power 240

**D. The JCPC and Trade and Commerce 244**

**E. The Watertight Compartments Spring Leaks: The Modern Era 247**

- 1) Contemporary Problems Are Untidy and Expensive 248
- 2) The Obsolescence of the Categories in Sections 91 and 92 249
- 3) A Return to Watertight Compartments? 251

**Further Readings 252**

CHAPTER 8:

**PEACE, ORDER, AND GOOD GOVERNMENT 253**

**A. Scope of the Peace, Order, and Good Government Power 253**

**B. The Emergency Branch 254**

**C. POGG as a Purely Residual Power 259**

**D. The National Concern Branch 261**

- 1) Introduction 261
- 2) The Beetz–Lederman Thesis 264
- 3) Newness 266
- 4) Distinctiveness 267
- 5) The Provincial Inability Test 268

**E. Matters of Interprovincial Concern or Significance 271**

**Further Readings 276**

CHAPTER 9:

**TRADE AND COMMERCE 278**

**A. Introduction 278**

**B. International and Interprovincial Trade 279**

- 1) The Scope of Federal and Provincial Authority 279
- 2) Ability to Regulate Local Trade as an Incident of International or Interprovincial Trade 281

**C. General Regulation of Trade Affecting the Whole Dominion 291**

**D. Implementation of International Trade Agreements 298**

- 1) Treaty Execution versus Treaty Implementation 299
- 2) The *Labour Conventions* Case 299

3) Application of <i>Labour Conventions</i> to Trade Agreements	300
a) Parliament's Power over International Trade	301
b) Parliament's Power over the General Regulation of Trade	303
E. The Canadian Economic Union and the Constitution	304
1) The <i>Morguard</i> and <i>Hunt</i> Cases	304
2) Parliament's Power to Enhance the Economic Union	307
Further Readings	310
CHAPTER 10:	
PROPERTY AND CIVIL RIGHTS IN THE PROVINCE	312
A. Defining Property and Civil Rights	312
B. The Natural Resource Decisions of the 1970s	319
C. The Meaning of "Within the Province"	325
Further Readings	332
CHAPTER 11:	
CRIMINAL LAW	333
A. Introduction	333
B. Federal Criminal Law Power	334
C. Provincial Power To Enact Penal Laws	345
D. Administration of Justice in the Province	354
Further Readings	355
CHAPTER 12:	
THE CONSTITUTION AND TRANSPORTATION	356
A. Introduction	356
B. Basic Division of Responsibilities over Transportation	357
C. Jurisdiction over Works and Undertakings	358
1) Works and Undertakings Defined	359
2) Undivided Jurisdiction over Particular Undertakings	359
3) Interprovincial Works and Undertakings	361
4) Integration of Local and Interprovincial Undertakings	364
5) Jurisdiction over Internet-Related Undertakings	367
6) Works Declared for the General Advantage of Canada	370
D. Peace, Order, and Good Government	372
E. Other Sources of Federal Authority	374



- F. **Regulatory Framework** 376
  - 1) Air Transportation 376
  - 2) Marine Transportation 377
  - 3) Rail Transportation 378
  - 4) Motor Vehicle Transportation 379

G. **Transportation Obligations** 380

**Further Readings** 381

PART FIVE:

**THE *CHARTER* AND ABORIGINAL RIGHTS** 383

CHAPTER 13:

**THE CANADIAN *CHARTER OF RIGHTS AND FREEDOMS*** 385

- A. **The Enactment of the *Charter*** 385
- B. **Courts and Legislatures** 393
- C. **The *Charter*: An Overview** 404
  - 1) *The Charter* Defined 404
  - 2) Application of the *Charter* 405
  - 3) Guarantee of and Limitations on Rights: Section 1 410
  - 4) The Override 417
  - 5) Substantive *Charter* Rights 421
    - a) Fundamental Freedoms 421
    - b) Democratic Rights 424
    - c) Mobility Rights 425
    - d) Legal Rights 426
    - e) Equality Rights 428
    - f) Language Rights 435

D. **Conclusion** 437

**Further Readings** 437

CHAPTER 14:

**ABORIGINAL PEOPLES AND THE CANADIAN CONSTITUTION** 439

- A. **The Nature of Aboriginal Rights** 439
  - 1) Rights Existing at Common Law 439
  - 2) Treaty Rights 447
- B. **Constitutional Status of Aboriginal Rights Prior to 1982** 452

1) Introduction	452
2) Federal Legislative Power	452
3) Provincial Legislative Power	456
a) Provincial Laws of General Application	456
b) Provincial Laws Affecting "Indian-ness" and Section 88 of the <i>Indian Act</i>	458
<b>C. Constitutional Status of Aboriginal Rights Since 1982</b>	<b>460</b>
1) Section 35	460
a) Section 35 Framework: The <i>Sparrow</i> Test	461
b) Rights to Self-Government	466
c) Duty to Consult and Accommodate Aboriginal Rights	472
2) The <i>Charter</i> and Aboriginal Peoples	473
3) Constitutional Change and Aboriginal Peoples	474
<b>Further Readings</b>	<b>476</b>
 <b>PART SIX:</b>	
<b>CONCLUSION</b>	<b>477</b>
 <b>CHAPTER 15:</b>	
<b>THE CANADIAN CONSTITUTION IN THE TWENTY-FIRST CENTURY</b>	<b>479</b>
<b>A. A Third Sovereignty Referendum?</b>	<b>479</b>
<b>B. Reform to Central Institutions: The Excessive Power of the Executive Branch</b>	<b>485</b>
<b>C. Canada in the Twenty-First Century</b>	<b>487</b>
<b>Further Readings</b>	<b>488</b>
 <b>GLOSSARY OF TERMS</b>	 <b>489</b>
 <b>CONSTITUTION ACTS 1867 TO 1982</b>	 <b>497</b>
 <b>TABLE OF CASES</b>	 <b>581</b>
 <b>INDEX</b>	 <b>595</b>
 <b>ABOUT THE AUTHOR</b>	 <b>613</b>