

CASES AND MATERIALS

# INSURANCE LAW AND REGULATION

FIFTH EDITION

*by*

KENNETH S. ABRAHAM

David and Mary Harrison Distinguished Professor of Law  
University of Virginia

FOUNDATION PRESS  
2010



THOMSON REUTERS™

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| PREFACE TO THE FIFTH EDITION .....  | v   |
| TABLE OF CASES .....  | xix |
| <b>CHAPTER ONE Introduction</b> .....   | 1   |
| A. The History and Functions of Insurance.....  | 1   |
| B. The Problem of Imperfect Information .....   | 5   |
| 1. Breach of Warranty.....  | 8   |
| <i>Vlastos v. Sumitomo Marine &amp; Fire Insurance Company</i> .....                                | 8   |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 13  |
| 2. The Transformation of Warranty Law: The Modern Law of<br>Misrepresentation and Concealment.....  | 15  |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 19  |
| <i>Neill v. Nationwide Mutual Fire Insurance Company</i> .....                                      | 20  |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 23  |
| <i>MacKenzie v. Prudential Insurance Company of America</i> .....                                   | 26  |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 28  |
| <b>CHAPTER TWO Insurance Contract Formation and Mean-<br/>ing</b> .....                             | 31  |
| A. The Role of Standardized Forms.....  | 31  |
| 1. The Policy Standardization Process.....  | 31  |
| 2. Construing Ambiguities Against the Insurer.....  | 37  |
| <i>Vargas v. Insurance Company of North America</i> .....   | 38  |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 41  |
| 3. Interpreting Binders .....   | 43  |
| <i>World Trade Center Properties, L.L.C. v. Hartford Fire Insur-<br/>        ance Company</i> ..... | 43  |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 50  |
| 4. Honoring the Reasonable Expectations of the Insured .....  | 51  |
| <i>Atwood v. Hartford Accident &amp; Indemnity Co.</i> .....  | 52  |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 54  |
| <i>Atwater Creamery Company v. Western National Mutual Insur-<br/>        ance Company</i> .....    | 57  |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 62  |
| B. The Role of Intermediaries .....   | 64  |
| 1. The Authority of the Agent .....   | 65  |
| <i>Elmer Tallant Agency, Inc. v. Bailey Wood Products, Inc.</i> .....                               | 66  |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 70  |
| 2. Waiver and Estoppel .....  | 70  |
| <i>Roseth v. St. Paul Property &amp; Liability Insurance Company</i> .....                          | 71  |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 73  |
| 3. Group Insurance and ERISA .....  | 75  |
| C. Public Policy Restrictions on Contract Terms.....  | 78  |
| 1. The Requirement of an Insurable Interest.....  | 78  |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| C. Public Policy Restrictions on Contract Terms—Continued  |     |
| <i>Richard C. Gossett and Margaret D. Gossett v. Farmers Insurance Company of Washington</i> ..... | 78  |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 83  |
| <i>Ryan v. Tickle</i> .....  | 86  |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 90  |
| <i>Mayo v. Hartford Life Insurance Company</i> .....   | 93  |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 97  |
| 2. Other Public Policies .....   | 98  |
| <i>Hartford Casualty Insurance Company v. Powell</i> .....   | 98  |
| <i>First Bank (N.A.)—Billings v. Transamerica Insurance Company</i> .....                          | 101 |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 105 |
| <i>Strickland v. Gulf Life Insurance Company</i> .....   | 107 |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 112 |
| <b>CHAPTER THREE Insurance Regulation</b> .....  | 114 |
| A. The Allocation of Regulatory Powers .....   | 114 |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 117 |
| B. The State Regulatory Response .....   | 118 |
| 1. The First Virtue of Insurance: Regulation to Assure Solvency ...                                | 122 |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 132 |
| 2. Rate Regulation .....   | 133 |
| <i>Commissioner of Insurance v. North Carolina Rate Bureau</i> .....                               | 137 |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 141 |
| 3. “Unfairly Discriminatory” Rates .....   | 144 |
| <i>Allstate Insurance Company v. Schmidt</i> .....   | 146 |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 151 |
| 4. Other State Regulation: The Contingent–Commission Controversy .....                             | 156 |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 157 |
| C. Residual Federal Regulation .....   | 158 |
| 1. What Constitutes the “Business of Insurance”? .....   | 159 |
| <i>Union Labor Life Insurance Co. v. Pireno</i> .....  | 159 |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 168 |
| 2. What Constitutes “Regulation” by the States? .....  | 169 |
| 3. What Constitutes “Boycott, Coercion, Or Intimidation”? .....                                    | 170 |
| <i>St. Paul Fire &amp; Marine Insurance Co. v. Barry</i> .....                                     | 171 |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 176 |
| <i>Hartford Fire Insurance Company v. California</i> .....   | 177 |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 187 |
| D. The Future of Reform .....  | 189 |
| 1. Repeal of the Insurance Industry’s Antitrust Exemption .....                                    | 189 |
| 2. Federalization of Regulation .....  | 190 |
| <b>CHAPTER FOUR Fire and Property Insurance</b> .....  | 192 |
| A. Sample Homeowners Policy .....  | 192 |
| B. Trigger and Occurrence Issues .....   | 219 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| B. Trigger and Occurrence Issues—Continued  |     |
| <i>Port Authority of New York and New Jersey v. Affiliated FM Insurance Company</i> ..... | 220 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 225 |
| C. Business Interruption Coverage .....   | 226 |
| <i>Duane Reade, Inc. v. St. Paul Fire &amp; Marine Insurance Company</i> .....            | 226 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 231 |
| D. Exclusions .....   | 232 |
| 1. The Problem of Intrinsic Loss .....  | 233 |
| <i>Chute v. North River Insurance Company</i> .....                                       | 233 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 235 |
| <i>Rosen v. State Farm General Insurance Company</i> .....                                | 236 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 240 |
| 2. The Problem of Causation .....   | 241 |
| <i>State Farm Fire and Casualty Company v. Bongen</i> .....                               | 241 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 244 |
| <i>Liristis v. American Family Mutual Insurance Company</i> .....                         | 246 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 251 |
| <i>Broussard v. State Farm Fire and Casualty Company</i> .....                            | 251 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 256 |
| 3. The Problem of Increased Risk .....  | 259 |
| <i>Dynasty, Inc. v. Princeton Insurance Company</i> .....                                 | 259 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 265 |
| E. The Measure of Recovery .....  | 266 |
| <i>Zochert v. National Farmers Union Property &amp; Casualty Company</i> .....            | 267 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 270 |
| F. Subrogation .....  | 274 |
| <i>Great Northern Oil Company v. St. Paul Fire and Marine Insurance Company</i> .....     | 276 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 280 |
| G. Limited Interests .....  | 282 |
| 1. Mortgages .....  | 282 |
| <i>Northwest Farm Bureau Insurance Company v. Althausen</i> .....                         | 282 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 284 |
| 2. Leaseholds .....   | 285 |
| <i>Alaska Insurance Company v. RCA Alaska Communications, Inc.</i> .....                  | 285 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 289 |
| 3. Real Estate Sales .....  | 290 |
| <i>Paramount Fire Insurance Company v. Aetna Casualty and Surety Company</i> .....        | 292 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 297 |
| 4. Other Limited Interests .....  | 298 |
| <i>Home Insurance Company v. Adler</i> .....  | 298 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 301 |
| <i>Folger Coffee Company, Inc. v. Great American Insurance Company</i> .....              | 302 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 305 |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| <b>CHAPTER FIVE Life, Health, and Disability Insurance</b> .....           | <b>306</b> |
| A. Life Insurance .....  | 306        |
| 1. Sample Term Life Insurance Policy .....                                 | 307        |
| 2. The Application .....   | 327        |
| <i>Gaunt v. John Hancock Mutual Life Insurance Company</i> .....           | 327        |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 331        |
| 3. Change of Beneficiary and Assignment .....                              | 333        |
| <i>Engelman v. Connecticut General Life Insurance Company</i> .....        | 334        |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 339        |
| <i>Grigsby v. Russell</i> .....  | 340        |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 342        |
| 4. Limitations On Recovery By Beneficiaries .....                          | 345        |
| <i>State Mutual Life Assurance Company of America v. Hampton</i> ..        | 345        |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 351        |
| 5. Limitations of Risk .....   | 352        |
| <i>Silverstein v. Metropolitan Life Insurance Company</i> .....            | 352        |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 354        |
| 6. Incontestability .....  | 355        |
| <i>Amex Life Assurance Company v. Superior Court</i> .....                 | 356        |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 360        |
| 7. Negligence Actions Against the Insurer .....                            | 361        |
| <i>Mauroner v. Massachusetts Indemnity and Life Insurance Com-</i>         |            |
| <i>pany</i> .....  | 361        |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 366        |
| B. Health Insurance .....  | 367        |
| 1. Health Insurance Reform .....   | 367        |
| <i>Congressional Research Service, Health Care Reform: An Intro-</i>       |            |
| <i>duction</i> .....   | 368        |
| 2. Access to Care .....  | 376        |
| a. Pre-Existing Condition Limitations .....                                | 377        |
| <i>Lawson ex rel. Lawson v. Fortis Insurance Company</i> .....             | 378        |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 384        |
| b. ERISA, Coverage Denials, and Changes In Coverage .....                  | 384        |
| <i>Aetna Health, Inc. v. Davila</i> .....                                  | 386        |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 393        |
| <i>McGann v. H &amp; H Music Company</i> .....                             | 394        |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 400        |
| 3. Cost Containment .....  | 404        |
| a. Managed Care .....  | 404        |
| b. Medically Necessary Services .....                                      | 406        |
| <i>Fuja v. Benefit Trust Life Insurance Company</i> .....                  | 406        |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 411        |
| c. Coordination of Coverage .....  | 413        |
| <i>Harris Corporation v. Humana Health Insurance Company</i>               |            |
| <i>of Florida, Inc.</i> .....  | 414        |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 421        |
| <i>Associated Hospital Service of Philadelphia v. Pustilnik</i> .....      | 422        |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 425        |
| C. Disability Insurance .....  | 429        |
| <i>Mossa v. Provident Life and Casualty Insurance Company</i> .....        | 430        |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 435        |
| <i>Heller v. The Equitable Life Assurance Society of the United States</i> |            |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 437        |
|  | 441        |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| D. Liability for Bad-Faith Breach .....                            | 442 |
| <i>Silberg v. California Life Insurance Company</i> .....          | 442 |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 451 |
| <i>Pilot Life Insurance Company v. Dedeaux</i> .....               | 454 |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 461 |
| <b>CHAPTER SIX Liability Insurance</b> .....                       | 463 |
| A. Commercial General Liability Insurance .....                    | 463 |
| 1. Sample CGL Policy .....   | 464 |
| 2. The Insuring Agreement .....                                    | 482 |
| a. The Meaning of “Damages” and “Property Damage” .....            | 482 |
| <i>A.Y. McDonald Industries, Inc. v. Insurance Company of</i>      |     |
| <i>North America</i> .....   | 483 |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 491 |
| <i>F &amp; H Construction v. ITT Hartford Insurance Company of</i> |     |
| <i>the Midwest</i> .....   | 494 |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 501 |
| b. The Trigger and Allocation of Coverage .....                    | 502 |
| <i>American Home Products Corporation v. Liberty Mutual</i>        |     |
| <i>Insurance Company</i> .....                                     | 502 |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 511 |
| <i>In re Silicone Implant Insurance Coverage Litigation</i> .....  | 513 |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 521 |
| c. The Number of Occurrences .....                                 | 524 |
| <i>Metropolitan Life Insurance Company v. Aetna Casualty &amp;</i> |     |
| <i>Surety Company</i> .....  | 524 |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 530 |
| 3. Exclusions and Conditions .....                                 | 532 |
| a. Expected or Intended Harm .....                                 | 533 |
| <i>Stonewall Insurance Company v. Asbestos Claims Manage-</i>      |     |
| <i>ment Corporation</i> .....                                      | 533 |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 538 |
| <i>Unigard Mutual Insurance Company v. Argonaut Insurance</i>      |     |
| <i>Company</i> .....   | 540 |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 543 |
| b. The Owned-Property Exclusion .....                              | 546 |
| <i>Hakim v. Massachusetts Insurers’ Insolvency Fund</i> .....      | 546 |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 551 |
| c. The Business Risk Exclusions .....                              | 552 |
| <i>Weedo v. Stone-E-Brick, Inc.</i> .....                          | 552 |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 562 |
| d. The Pollution Exclusion .....                                   | 564 |
| <i>American States Insurance Co. v. Koloms</i> .....               | 564 |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 573 |
| e. Notice Conditions .....   | 575 |
| <i>Mighty Midgets, Inc. v. Centennial Insurance Company</i> .....  | 575 |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 579 |
| <i>West Bay Exploration v. AIG Specialty Agencies</i> .....        | 581 |
| Notes and Questions .....  | 586 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| B. Directors & Officers and Professional Liability Insurance under<br>Claims-Made Policies .....        | 588 |
| <i>Alstrin v. St. Paul Mercury Insurance Company</i> .....  | 601 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 608 |
| <i>Owens Corning v. National Union Fire Insurance Company of<br/>Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania</i> .....     | 609 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 613 |
| <i>Thoracic Cardiovascular Associates, Ltd. v. St. Paul Fire and<br/>Marine Insurance Company</i> ..... | 614 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 621 |
| <b>CHAPTER SEVEN Liability Insurance: Defense and Settle-<br/>ment</b> .....                            | 624 |
| A. The Duty to Defend and the Consequences of Breach .....  | 624 |
| 1. The Scope of the Duty .....  | 625 |
| <i>Beckwith Machinery Company v. Travelers Indemnity Company</i> .....                                  | 625 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 631 |
| 2. "Mixed" Claims and Conflicts of Interest .....   | 635 |
| <i>Gray v. Zurich Insurance Company</i> .....   | 635 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 640 |
| <i>Shoshone First Bank v. Pacific Employers Insurance Company</i> .....                                 | 643 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 648 |
| <i>Parsons v. Continental National American Group</i> .....   | 650 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 656 |
| B. Settlement .....   | 659 |
| <i>Crisci v. Security Insurance Company of New Haven, Connecticut</i> ..                                | 659 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 664 |
| C. Relations Between Primary and Excess Insurers .....  | 668 |
| 1. The Duty to Settle .....   | 668 |
| <i>Commercial Union Assurance Companies v. Safeway Stores,<br/>Inc.</i> .....                           | 668 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 673 |
| 2. Drop-Down Liability .....  | 675 |
| <i>Mission National Insurance Company v. Duke Transportation<br/>Company</i> .....                      | 675 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 680 |
| <b>CHAPTER EIGHT Automobile Insurance</b> .....   | 682 |
| A. Sample Personal Automobile Insurance Policy .....  | 683 |
| B. Liability Insurance .....  | 697 |
| 1. The Scope of Compulsory Insurance Requirements .....   | 697 |
| <i>St. Paul Fire &amp; Marine Insurance Company v. Smith</i> .....                                      | 697 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 702 |
| 2. The Omnibus Clause .....   | 704 |
| <i>Curtis v. State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Company</i> ....                                    | 704 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 711 |
| 3. "Use" of the Vehicle .....   | 712 |
| <i>Farm Bureau Mutual Insurance Company v. Evans</i> .....  | 712 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 715 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| B. Liability Insurance—Continued  |     |
| 4. Notice and Cooperation Conditions .....  | 716 |
| <i>State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Company v. Davies</i> ...                                       | 716 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 722 |
| <i>Miller v. Shugart</i> .....  | 723 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 729 |
| 5. Other Insurance Clauses.....   | 730 |
| <i>Carriers Insurance Company v. American Policyholders' Insurance Company</i> .....                      | 730 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 736 |
| C. Collision and Comprehensive Coverage.....  | 737 |
| <i>Roth v. Amica Mutual Insurance Company</i> .....   | 738 |
| Notes and Questions.....  | 740 |
| <i>Allison v. Iowa Mutual Insurance Company</i> .....   | 741 |
| <i>Rodemich v. State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Company</i> ...                                     | 744 |
| Notes and Questions.....  | 746 |
| D. Uninsured Motorists Coverage .....   | 747 |
| <i>Allstate Insurance v. Boynton</i> .....  | 747 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 754 |
| <i>Simpson v. Farmers Insurance Company, Inc.</i> .....   | 755 |
| Notes and Questions.....  | 760 |
| <i>Taft v. Cerwonka</i> .....   | 761 |
| Notes and Questions.....  | 764 |
| E. Auto No-Fault .....  | 765 |
| <b>CHAPTER NINE The Secondary Market</b> .....  | 770 |
| A. Residual Market Mechanisms.....  | 770 |
| Notes and Questions.....  | 779 |
| B. Surplus and Excess Lines .....   | 780 |
| C. Reinsurance .....  | 781 |
| 1. The Duty of Utmost Good Faith .....  | 785 |
| <i>Allendale Mutual Insurance Company v. Excess Insurance Co. Limited</i> .....                           | 785 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 790 |
| 2. "Follow-The-Fortunes" Clauses.....   | 792 |
| <i>Travelers Casualty and Surety Company v. Certain Underwriters at Lloyd's of London</i> .....           | 792 |
| <i>Travelers Casualty &amp; Surety Company v. Gerling Global Reinsurance Corporation of America</i> ..... | 800 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 810 |
| 3. Insolvency Clauses .....   | 811 |
| <i>Ainsworth v. General Reinsurance Corporation</i> .....   | 811 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 815 |
| 4. Set-Offs In Insolvency.....  | 817 |
| <i>O'Connor v. Insurance Company of North America</i> .....   | 817 |
| Notes and Questions .....   | 823 |
| INDEX .....   | 825 |