

This report contains the collective views of an international group of experts and does not necessarily represent the decisions or the stated policy of the United Nations Environment Programme, the International Labour Organization or the World Health Organization.

Environmental Health Criteria 240

PRINCIPLES AND METHODS FOR THE RISK ASSESSMENT OF CHEMICALS IN FOOD

A joint publication of the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations and the World Health Organization

Published under the joint sponsorship of the United Nations Environment Programme, the International Labour Organization and the World Health Organization, and produced within the framework of the Inter-Organization Programme for the Sound Management of Chemicals.



**Food and Agriculture
Organization of the
United Nations**



**World Health
Organization**

CONTENTS

ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH CRITERIA ON PRINCIPLES AND METHODS FOR THE RISK ASSESSMENT OF CHEMICALS IN FOOD

PREAMBLE	xix
PREFACE	xxxiii
ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS	xxxv
SUMMARY	xlili
1. INTRODUCTION	1-1
1.1 The need for updated guidance on risk assessment	1-1
1.2 Development of the monograph	1-2
1.3 Purpose, scope and outline of the monograph	1-3
1.3.1 Purpose	1-3
1.3.2 Scope	1-4
1.3.3 Outline	1-4
1.4 Historical background to the work of JECFA and JMPR	1-6
1.4.1 JECFA	1-6
1.4.2 JMPR	1-8
1.4.3 Relevant activities since the publication of EHC 70 and EHC 104	1-10
1.4.3.1 Evaluation of veterinary drug residues	1-11
1.4.3.2 Dietary exposure assessments	1-12
1.4.3.3 Assessment of acute toxicity	1-15
1.4.3.4 Evaluation of flavouring agents	1-16
1.5 Framework for identification, evaluation, development and incorporation of new principles and methods	1-17
1.6 References	1-17

2.	RISK ASSESSMENT AND ITS ROLE IN RISK ANALYSIS	2-1
2.1	Introduction	2-1
2.2	Definitions of hazard and risk	2-3
2.3	Role of risk assessment in risk analysis for food chemicals	2-4
2.4	The four steps of risk assessment for food chemicals	2-5
2.4.1	Hazard identification	2-6
2.4.2	Hazard characterization	2-7
2.4.3	Exposure assessment	2-7
2.4.4	Risk characterization	2-8
2.5	Interactions between risk assessment and risk management	2-9
2.5.1	Problem formulation	2-10
2.5.2	Priority setting for JECFA and JMPR	2-11
2.5.3	Periodic reviews and specific re-evaluations	2-12
2.6	References	2-14
3.	CHEMICAL CHARACTERIZATION, ANALYTICAL METHODS AND THE DEVELOPMENT OF SPECIFICATIONS	3-1
3.1	Introduction	3-1
3.2	Criteria for the review of analytical methods and required technical competence of testing laboratories	3-2
3.3	The significance of multilaboratory method trials and collaborative studies	3-4
3.4	Food additive specifications	3-5
3.4.1	General considerations	3-5
3.4.2	Formulation of specifications and information requirements	3-8
3.4.3	Stability and fate of additives in food	3-9
3.4.4	Analytical methods	3-10
3.5	Pesticide characterization	3-11
3.5.1	General considerations	3-11
3.5.2	Identity and purity	3-14
3.5.3	Stability	3-14
3.5.4	Physical and chemical properties	3-15

	3.5.5 Analytical methods	3-16
3.6	Veterinary drug residues	3-19
	3.6.1 General considerations	3-19
	3.6.2 Analytical methods	3-21
3.7	Contaminants	3-22
	3.7.1 General considerations	3-22
	3.7.2 Analytical methods	3-23
3.8	Substances consumed in large amounts	3-23
3.9	References	3-25
4.	HAZARD IDENTIFICATION AND CHARACTERIZATION: TOXICOLOGICAL AND HUMAN STUDIES	4-1
4.1	Introduction	4-5
	4.1.1 Nature of substances to be evaluated	4-5
	4.1.2 Knowledge requirements for substances to be tested and evaluated	4-6
	4.1.3 Role of structure–activity relationships and metabolic fate	4-7
	4.1.4 Integrating data on dietary exposure	4-8
	4.1.5 General approach to toxicity testing	4-8
	4.1.5.1 Role of in silico and in vitro studies	4-9
	4.1.5.2 Digestion and impact on gut flora	4-11
	4.1.5.3 Absorption, distribution, metabolism and excretion (ADME)	4-11
	4.1.5.4 Considerations in the selection of appropriate in vivo studies and relevant species (models)	4-12
	4.1.5.5 Types of animal studies and their role in safety assessment	4-13
	4.1.5.6 Role of human studies	4-17
4.2	Absorption, distribution, metabolism and excretion (including residues of toxicological concern)	4-18
	4.2.1 Introduction	4-18
	4.2.2 Absorption	4-20
	4.2.3 Distribution	4-23
	4.2.4 Metabolism	4-26

	4.2.5	Excretion	4-28
	4.2.6	Overall elimination from the body	4-29
	4.2.7	The role of toxicokinetic studies in the design of animal toxicity tests	4-30
	4.2.8	The role of toxicokinetic studies in the interpretation of data from animal toxicity studies	4-31
	4.2.9	Route-to-route extrapolation	4-37
4.3		General systemic toxicity	4-38
	4.3.1	Introduction	4-38
	4.3.2	Tests for general systemic toxicity	4-39
	4.3.3	Testing strategies	4-40
	4.3.4	Study design and data interpretation	4-40
		4.3.4.1 Good Laboratory Practice	4-40
		4.3.4.2 Test substance	4-40
		4.3.4.3 Species, number and sex	4-41
		4.3.4.4 Dose selection	4-42
		4.3.4.5 Administration of the test substance	4-42
	4.3.5	Observations and measurements	4-43
		4.3.5.1 Mortality	4-44
		4.3.5.2 Observations of test animals	4-44
		4.3.5.3 Body weight and feed intake data	4-44
		4.3.5.4 Ophthalmology	4-44
		4.3.5.5 Haematology	4-45
		4.3.5.6 Clinical chemistry	4-45
		4.3.5.7 Urinalyses	4-46
		4.3.5.8 Necropsy	4-47
		4.3.5.9 Organ weight	4-47
		4.3.5.10 Histological examination	4-47
		4.3.5.11 Neurotoxicity and immunotoxicity	4-48
		4.3.5.12 Reversibility	4-48
		4.3.5.13 Other considerations	4-48
4.4		Acute toxicity	4-49
	4.4.1	Introduction	4-49
	4.4.2	Guidance for a single-dose study	4-51
4.5		Genotoxicity	4-52
	4.5.1	Introduction	4-52
	4.5.2	Tests for genetic toxicity	4-53
		4.5.2.1 Test categories	4-53

	4.5.2.2	Commonly used tests	4-54
4.5.3		Testing strategy	4-54
4.5.4		Data assessment	4-56
	4.5.4.1	Cytogenetic assays in vivo and in vitro	4-57
	4.5.4.2	Germline and somatic cell in vivo cytogenetic assays	4-58
	4.5.4.3	In vivo gene mutation assays in germline cells	4-58
4.5.5		Genetic toxicity in relation to carcinogenicity	4-58
	4.5.5.1	Validation of genetic toxicity tests for the prediction of carcinogenicity	4-58
	4.5.5.2	Evidence of mode of action	4-60
4.5.6		Conclusions	4-62
4.6		Carcinogenicity	4-62
	4.6.1	Introduction	4-62
	4.6.2	Mechanisms of carcinogenicity and mode of action	4-62
	4.6.2.1	Genotoxic or DNA-reactive mechanisms	4-63
	4.6.2.2	Non-genotoxic mechanisms	4-63
4.6.3		Chronic bioassays for the identification and characterization of cancer risk	4-64
	4.6.3.1	Statistical methods	4-64
	4.6.3.2	Evaluation	4-65
	4.6.3.3	Interpretation	4-65
4.6.4		Alternative methods for carcinogenicity testing	4-65
	4.6.4.1	Initiation/promotion models	4-65
	4.6.4.2	Neonatal mouse model	4-66
	4.6.4.3	Transgenic mouse models	4-66
	4.6.4.4	Interpretation of the data from alternative methods	4-69
4.6.5		End-points in carcinogenicity studies	4-69
	4.6.5.1	Spontaneous neoplasms	4-69
	4.6.5.2	Pathological classification of neoplasms	4-70
	4.6.5.3	Benign and malignant neoplasms	4-70
	4.6.5.4	Preneoplastic lesions	4-70

4.6.6	Characterization of carcinogenic effects	4-71
4.6.6.1	Mechanisms relevant to humans	4-71
4.6.6.2	Mechanisms not relevant to humans	4-72
4.6.7	Assessment of carcinogenic response	4-74
4.6.7.1	Nature of the test substance	4-74
4.6.7.2	Relevance of study design	4-74
4.6.7.3	Are the tumours substance related?	4-75
4.6.7.4	Can a mode of action for the tumour response be established?	4-75
4.6.7.5	Is the mode of action relevant to humans?	4-76
4.6.7.6	Historical control data	4-76
4.7	Reproductive and developmental toxicity	4-78
4.7.1	Introduction	4-78
4.7.2	End-points of concern	4-79
4.7.3	Study design	4-81
4.7.3.1	Overview	4-81
4.7.3.2	Reproductive toxicity	4-82
4.7.3.3	Developmental toxicity	4-84
4.7.3.4	Tiered and combined approaches to reproductive and developmental toxicity testing	4-86
4.7.3.5	Endocrine toxicity	4-86
4.7.4	Issues specific to category of chemical	4-88
4.7.5	Interpretation of data	4-88
4.7.6	Other considerations	4-91
4.7.6.1	In vitro tests	4-91
4.7.6.2	Paternally mediated effects	4-91
4.7.7	Information gaps	4-92
4.8	Neurotoxicity	4-92
4.8.1	Introduction	4-92
4.8.2	Nervous system features	4-93
4.8.3	Evaluation of neurotoxicity	4-93
4.8.3.1	Morphological evaluations	4-94
4.8.3.2	Neurobehavioural evaluation	4-98
4.8.3.3	Developmental neurotoxicity	4-98
4.8.4	Tiered testing strategy	4-100
4.8.5	Cholinesterase-inhibiting compounds	4-102
4.8.6	Alternative test methods	4-103

4.8.7	Interpretation of data	4-104
4.9	Immunotoxicity	4-105
4.9.1	Introduction	4-105
4.9.2	Assessment of immunotoxicity	4-106
4.9.2.1	Laboratory animal studies	4-106
4.9.2.2	Human studies	4-114
4.9.3	Interpretation of data on immunotoxicity	4-116
4.9.4	Conclusions	4-116
4.10	Food allergy and other food hypersensitivities	4-117
4.10.1	Introduction	4-117
4.10.2	Prevalence	4-119
4.10.3	IgE-mediated food allergy	4-119
4.10.3.1	Sensitization	4-119
4.10.3.2	Symptoms and diagnosis	4-121
4.10.3.3	Common characteristics of food allergens	4-122
4.10.3.4	Thresholds	4-125
4.10.3.5	Risk assessment in food allergy	4-126
4.10.3.6	Evaluating potential allergenicity of genetically modified food	4-129
4.10.4	Non-IgE-mediated food allergy	4-132
4.10.4.1	Coeliac disease	4-132
4.10.5	Non-immune-mediated food hypersensitivity	4-134
4.10.5.1	Metabolic disorders	4-134
4.10.5.2	Other	4-135
4.11	General principles of studies in humans	4-135
4.11.1	Introduction	4-135
4.11.2	Lessons learnt from pharmaceutical development	4-139
4.11.3	Types of studies in humans	4-141
4.11.3.1	Short-term clinical laboratory studies	4-141
4.11.3.2	More prolonged clinical laboratory studies	4-144
4.11.3.3	Post-marketing surveillance and epidemiological studies	4-145
4.11.4	Other sources of information about effects in humans	4-148
4.11.4.1	Poisoning	4-148

4.11.4.2	Human tissues and other preparations in vitro	4-149
4.11.5	Ethical, legal and regulatory issues	4-149
4.12	Gastrointestinal tract considerations, including effects on the gut flora	4-150
4.12.1	General considerations	4-150
4.12.1.1	Effects of the gut microflora on the chemical	4-151
4.12.1.2	Effects of the chemical on the gut microflora	4-153
4.12.2	Decision tree approach for determining the potential adverse effects of residues of veterinary antimicrobial drugs on the human intestinal microflora	4-154
4.13	References	4-156
5	DOSE-RESPONSE ASSESSMENT AND DERIVATION OF HEALTH-BASED GUIDANCE VALUES	5-1
5.1	Dose-response assessment	5-2
5.1.1	Basic concepts of dose-response assessment	5-2
5.1.1.1	Dose	5-4
5.1.1.2	Response	5-6
5.1.2	Dose-response modelling (DRM)	5-7
5.1.2.1	Overview	5-7
5.1.2.2	Mathematical models	5-12
5.1.2.3	Dose-response models for continuous data	5-12
5.1.2.4	Dose-response models for quantal data	5-14
5.1.2.5	Model fitting and estimation of parameters	5-14
5.1.3	Modelling with covariates	5-17
5.1.4	Biologically based dose-response models	5-17
5.1.5	Uncertainty	5-18
5.1.6	Issues of extrapolation	5-18
5.2	Setting health-based guidance values	5-19
5.2.1	Introduction	5-19
5.2.2	Data	5-22
5.2.3	Safety/uncertainty factors	5-24

5.2.4	The NOAEL approach to deriving health-based guidance values	5-28
5.2.5	Benchmark dose approach to deriving health-based guidance values	5-30
5.2.6	Acceptable daily intakes	5-33
5.2.6.1	Food additives	5-33
5.2.6.2	Pesticides	5-35
5.2.6.3	Veterinary drug residues	5-35
5.2.7	Tolerable intakes	5-42
5.2.8	Group ADIs/TIs	5-43
5.2.9	Setting of acute reference doses (ARfDs)	5-44
5.2.9.1	General considerations	5-44
5.2.9.2	Practical cut-off value for ARfDs	5-45
5.2.9.3	Biological and toxicological considerations	5-47
5.2.9.4	Stepwise process for setting ARfDs	5-48
5.2.9.5	Toxicological end-points relevant for ARfD derivation	5-49
5.2.9.6	Uncertainty factors for ARfDs	5-51
5.2.9.7	Different ARfDs for population subgroups	5-54
5.2.9.8	Use of human data in setting ARfDs	5-54
5.2.9.9	Intake considerations in relation to ARfDs	5-55
5.2.9.10	Specific guidance on the derivation of ARfDs	5-55
5.3	References	5-55
6.	DIETARY EXPOSURE ASSESSMENT OF CHEMICALS IN FOOD	6-1
6.1	Introduction	6-2
6.1.1	General considerations	6-3
6.1.2	Dietary exposure assessment methods	6-5
6.1.3	Presentation of results of dietary exposure assessment	6-6
6.2	Data sources	6-6
6.2.1	Data on concentrations of chemicals in food, including water	6-7

	6.2.1.1	Use of maximum levels (MLs) or maximum residue limits (MRLs) in dietary exposure assessments (preregulation)	6-7
	6.2.1.2	Use of other concentration data sources for dietary exposure assessments (preregulation and post-regulation)	6-9
	6.2.1.3	Approaches for obtaining food chemical concentration data	6-10
	6.2.1.4	Sampling	6-14
	6.2.1.5	Analysis	6-18
	6.2.1.6	Deriving concentration data for use in estimating dietary exposures	6-21
	6.2.1.7	Uncertainty in food chemical concentration data	6-22
	6.2.1.8	Available food composition databases	6-27
	6.2.2	Food consumption data	6-29
	6.2.2.1	Food consumption data requirements	6-29
	6.2.2.2	Approaches for food consumption data collection	6-30
	6.2.2.3	Data reporting and use	6-34
	6.2.2.4	Usual food consumption patterns	6-38
	6.2.2.5	Food consumption databases	6-39
6.3		Estimating dietary exposure	6-41
	6.3.1	Introduction	6-41
	6.3.2	Considerations when undertaking an exposure assessment	6-42
	6.3.3	Stepwise approach to exposure assessment	6-43
	6.3.4	Deterministic/point estimates of dietary exposure	6-45
	6.3.4.1	Screening methods	6-45
	6.3.4.2	More refined deterministic/point estimates	6-55
	6.3.4.3	Further examples of point estimates using model diets	6-58
	6.3.4.4	Specialized studies designed to answer specific questions	6-60

6.3.5	Refined dietary exposure assessments (probabilistic distributional analyses)	6-61
6.3.5.1	Overview of probabilistic estimates of exposure	6-62
6.3.5.2	Probabilistic models	6-64
6.3.5.3	Applicability of a probabilistic approach at the international level	6-66
6.3.6	Specific considerations for modelling approaches for acute and chronic dietary exposure assessments	6-67
6.3.6.1	Chronic dietary exposure assessments	6-67
6.3.6.2	Acute dietary exposure assessments	6-68
6.3.7	Aggregate/cumulative exposures	6-71
6.3.8	Biomarkers of exposure	6-73
6.4	References	6-77
	Appendix 6.1: Acute dietary exposure estimates currently used by JMPR	6-92
7.	RISK CHARACTERIZATION	7-1
7.1	Introduction	7-1
7.2	Risks at estimated levels of exposure	7-3
7.2.1	General considerations	7-3
7.2.2	Uncertainty and variability analysis	7-5
7.2.3	Sensitivity analysis	7-7
7.3	Risks from exposure to multiple substances	7-8
7.3.1	General considerations	7-8
7.3.2	Toxic equivalency factor (TEF) approach	7-11
7.3.3	Surrogate approach	7-12
7.4	The formulation of advice on compounds that are both genotoxic and carcinogenic	7-13
7.5	Subpopulations at risk	7-16
7.6	References	7-18
8.	MAXIMUM RESIDUE LIMITS FOR PESTICIDES AND VETERINARY DRUGS	8-1
8.1	Introduction	8-2
8.2	Overview of current principles and practice of JMPR and JECFA for residue evaluation	8-3

8.2.1	JMPR assessment processes for pesticide residues	8-3
8.2.2	JECFA assessment processes for residues of veterinary drugs	8-7
8.2.3	Comparison of JMPR and JECFA approaches	8-14
8.3	Identification and description of residues and methods	8-16
8.3.1	Residue definition, chemical identity and physicochemical properties	8-16
8.3.1.1	Marker residue	8-19
8.3.1.2	Definition of residues for dietary intake	8-21
8.3.2	Pharmacokinetic, toxicokinetic and metabolic data used to determine the residue definition	8-23
8.3.2.1	Pharmacokinetics, toxicokinetics and metabolism	8-23
8.3.2.2	Purpose of livestock metabolism studies for veterinary drug and pesticide evaluation	8-27
8.3.2.3	Purpose of plant metabolism studies	8-29
8.3.3	Analytical methods and residue stability in stored analytical samples	8-31
8.3.3.1	Method performance requirements	8-31
8.3.3.2	Analyte stability	8-33
8.3.3.3	Fate of residues during commercial food processing	8-33
8.3.4	Field study data used to identify the MRL: livestock feeding studies and animal treatments	8-36
8.4	Criteria for selecting data, species and commodities	8-39
8.4.1	Comparability of definitions for species, tissues and commodities of foods of animal origin	8-39
8.4.1.1	Meat and muscle	8-40
8.4.1.2	Milk	8-40
8.4.1.3	Eggs	8-40
8.4.1.4	Aquatic species	8-41

	8.4.1.5	Edible offal	8-41
	8.4.2	Data evaluation based on the application of GLP, GAP and GPVD	8-41
	8.4.2.1	JMPR	8-42
	8.4.2.2	JECFA	8-43
	8.4.3	Direct external animal treatment—dossier submissions to JMPR and JECFA	8-43
8.5		Extrapolation issues	8-44
	8.5.1	Proposal for expanding the scope of MRLs	8-44
	8.5.1.1	Pesticide residues	8-44
	8.5.1.2	Residues of veterinary drugs	8-45
	8.5.1.3	Possible extension of MRLs to other animal species	8-47
	8.5.1.4	Honey	8-48
	8.5.2	Geographic extrapolation	8-48
	8.5.2.1	Pesticide residues	8-48
	8.5.2.2	Veterinary drug residues	8-49
8.6		References	8-49
9.		PRINCIPLES RELATED TO SPECIFIC GROUPS OF SUBSTANCES	9-1
9.1		Special considerations for substances consumed in small amounts	9-2
	9.1.1	Threshold of toxicological concern (TTC)	9-2
	9.1.2	Flavouring agents	9-8
	9.1.2.1	The JECFA procedure for safety evaluation	9-8
	9.1.2.2	Consideration of dietary exposure estimates	9-12
	9.1.3	Food contact materials/packaging migrants	9-15
	9.1.4	Processing aids	9-16
	9.1.4.1	Solvents	9-16
	9.1.4.2	Enzymes	9-18
	9.1.4.3	Immobilizing agents	9-20
9.2		Special considerations for nutrients and substances consumed in large amounts	9-21
	9.2.1	Introduction	9-21
	9.2.1.1	Chemical composition, specifications and impurities	9-22

	9.2.1.2	Nutritional studies	9-23
	9.2.1.3	Toxicity studies	9-24
9.2.2		Nutrients and related substances	9-26
	9.2.2.1	Adverse health effects of nutrients and related substances—general concepts	9-30
	9.2.2.2	Deriving the UL	9-34
9.2.3		Foods from novel sources	9-39
	9.2.3.1	Chemical composition	9-40
	9.2.3.2	Nutritional considerations	9-42
	9.2.3.3	Toxicological evaluations	9-42
	9.2.3.4	Human data	9-43
	9.2.3.5	History of use	9-43
	9.2.3.6	Exposure assessment	9-44
	9.2.3.7	Risk characterization	9-45
9.3		References	9-45
Annex 1: Glossary of terms			A-1
Annex 2: Dose conversion table			A-43
Résumé			R-1
Resumen			R-35
Index			I-1