

Institute of Biomedical Ethics and History of Medicine, University of Zurich

Director: Prof. Dr. med. Dr. phil. Nikola Biller-Andorno

Dissertation under the supervision of Prof. Dr. med. Dr. phil. Nikola Biller-Andorno and
Prof. Dr. phil. Marcel Tanner

Ethical Implications of Malaria Vaccine Development

INAUGURAL-DISSERTATION

To receive the title of (Dr. sc. med./PhD)

awarded by the Faculty of Medicine

University of Zurich

submitted by

Machteld van den Berg

Dissertation committee:

Prof. Dr. med. Dr. phil. Nikola Biller-Andorno (chair and main supervisor)

Prof. Dr. phil. Marcel Tanner (co-supervisor)

PD Dr. med. et sc. nat. Sonja Merten

This dissertation has been accepted by the Medical Faculty, University of Zurich
upon request of Prof. Dr. Dr. Nikola Biller- Andorno

Zurich 2019

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT1

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS3

FUNDING5

TABLE OF CONTENTS7

ABBREVIATIONS.....11

INTRODUCTION.....13

Background 15

 Clinical trials in low-resource settings..... 15

 A pediatric malaria vaccine as a case study..... 15

 Why a malaria vaccine? 16

Malaria vaccine ethics 18

 Principle-based research ethics 18

 Respect for autonomy 18

 Beneficence and non-maleficence 20

 Justice..... 21

 Relational ethics..... 22

The broader picture..... 24

 The case study and clinical trials in low-resource settings 24

 Research objectives..... 24

**RTS,S MALARIA VACCINE PILOT STUDIES: ADDRESSING THE
HUMAN REALITIES IN LARGE-SCALE CLINICAL TRIALS.....27**

 Abstract..... 29

 Introduction..... 31

 The role of relationship in research studies..... 33

 Communities and vaccine uptake..... 35

 Long-term monitoring of study sites 36

 Conclusions..... 37

**CLINICAL TRIALS IN LOW-RESOURCE SETTINGS: THE
PERSPECTIVES OF CAREGIVERS OF PAEDIATRIC PARTICIPANTS
FROM UGANDA, TANZANIA AND KENYA41**

Abstract.....	43
Introduction.....	45
Methods.....	47
Sample population	47
Trial.....	47
Study design.....	47
Ethics.....	48
Analysis.....	48
Results	49
Trial Context	51
Community Context.....	52
Domestic Context.....	53
Discussion.....	55
Conclusion	57
 APPLYING COMPLEXITY THEORY TO MODEL THE OPERATION OF CLINICAL TRIALS IN HUMAN COMMUNITIES	 61
Abstract.....	63
Background	65
Methods.....	67
Study Design.....	67
In-depth interviews	67
Data analysis	68
Ethics.....	68
Results	69
Communities are complex adaptive systems	69
Challenges of working in CAS	70
How researchers work in complex adaptive systems	72
Discussion.....	77
Conclusion	82
 COMMUNITIES AND CLINICAL TRIALS: A CASE STUDY FROM THE RTS,S MALARIA VACCINE TRIALS IN EASTERN AFRICA	 87
Abstract.....	89
Introduction.....	91
Complexity Theory and Clinical Trials	92
Case Study: RTS,S Malaria Vaccine Phase III Clinical Trial	94
Methods.....	95
Study Design.....	95
In-depth Interviews	95

Data Analysis	95
Ethics.....	96
Results	97
Blood draws	98
Benefits	99
Influencers and gatekeepers	99
Relationships.....	100
Finances	101
Communication.....	102
Health	103
Simple Rules	104
Discussion and Relevance.....	106
Conclusion	109
GENERAL DISCUSSION	111
Overview.....	113
Consent and choice	115
Should we do research when choice is diminished?	116
A conflict of principles	118
How to address diminished choice?	121
Researcher’s embodied reality.....	127
Moral distress.....	127
The duty to rescue.....	128
Relational ethics	130
Strengthening agency.....	130
Trust	131
Roles and Responsibilities	135
CONCLUSION.....	139
Project Limitations.....	142
Implications for Future Research.....	143
REFERENCES.....	145
APPENDICES	163
Informed consent form caregivers	165
Caregiver interview guide.....	171
Informed consent form researchers.....	174
Researcher interview guide.....	180
Curriculum Vitae	183