

CASES AND MATERIALS ON

# INSURANCE LAW

Seventh Edition



By

**Leo P. Martinez**

*Albert Abramson Professor of Law  
University of California, Hastings College of the Law*

**Douglas R. Richmond**

*Managing Director—Professional Services  
Aon Risk Solutions*

AMERICAN CASEBOOK SERIES®

**WEST®**

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

PREFACE TO THE SEVENTH EDITION .....	V
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS .....	VII
EDITORS' NOTE .....	IX
TABLE OF CASES .....	XXIII
<b>Introduction.....</b>	<b>1</b>
Shaya B. Pacific, LLC v. Wilson, Elser, Moskowitz, Edelman & Dicker, LLP .....	1
Notes.....	7
Griffin Systems, Inc. v. Ohio Department of Insurance .....	9
Notes.....	16
Kentucky v. Reinhold .....	17
Notes.....	23
Truta v. Avis Rent a Car System, Inc. ....	24
Notes.....	29
<b>Chapter 1. Governmental Regulation of Insurance.....</b>	<b>37</b>
A. State Regulation .....	37
Ostrer v. Schenck .....	38
Notes.....	43
Wilson v. All Service Insurance Corp.....	44
Notes.....	46
B. Federal Involvement in State Insurance Regulation .....	52
Question .....	53
The McCarran–Ferguson Act .....	53
Notes.....	54
Questions .....	54
C. Federal Regulation .....	55
Employee Retirement Income Security Program Protection of Employee Benefit Rights.....	61
Pilot Life Insurance Co. v. Dedeaux .....	62
Notes.....	65
Concluding Note .....	77
<b>Chapter 2. Forming and Negotiating the Insurance Contract.....</b>	<b>79</b>
A. Formalities of Contract Making .....	79
Note .....	87
B. Negotiation, Agency, and Binders: Insurers' Problems .....	87
Washington National Insurance Company v. Strickland .....	87
Note .....	92
Talbot v. Country Life Insurance Co.....	93

Notes.....	95
A Note on Binders .....	96
Alea London Limited v. Bono–Soltysiak Enterprises .....	96
Notes.....	102
World Trade Center Properties, L.L.C. v. Travelers Indemnity Co.....	103
Notes.....	104
Ohio Farmers Insurance Co. v. Dakota Agency, Inc. ....	105
Notes.....	108
C. The Law of Misrepresentation: An Applicant's Problem in Negotiation .....	110
Merchants Fire Assurance Corp. v. Lattimore .....	110
Notes.....	117
Funchess v. United States Life Insurance Co. ....	122
Notes.....	123
Thompson v. Occidental Life Insurance Co. ....	124
Notes.....	129
Lettieri v. Equitable Life Assurance Society of United States .....	130
Notes.....	134
<b>Chapter 3. Interpretation of Insurance Contracts.....</b>	<b>137</b>
A. General Principles.....	137
Preliminary Note—Interpretation of Insurance Policies.....	137
J.A. Brundage Plumbing and Roto–Rooter, Inc. v. Massachusetts Bay Ins. Co. ....	139
Montrose Chemical Corporation of California v. Admiral Insurance Company.....	139
Notes.....	140
Steven v. Fidelity and Casualty Company of New York.....	146
Notes.....	154
Federal Insurance Co. v. Stroh Brewing Co. ....	158
Note .....	166
World Trade Center Properties, L.L.C. v. Travelers Indemnity Co.....	167
Notes.....	179
B. Waiver, Estoppel and Other Theories.....	185
Foremost Insurance Co. v. Putzier [Including Evel Knievel] .....	185
Foremost Insurance Co. v. Putzier [Including Antonio Guanche] ..	189
Notes.....	195
Maxwell v. Hartford Union High School District .....	198
Note .....	204
Republic Insurance Co. v. Silverton Elevators, Inc. ....	204
Notes.....	208
<b>Chapter 4. Extra–Contractual Liability: The Covenant of Good Faith and Fair Dealing.....</b>	<b>211</b>
A. Distinguishing First Party and Third Party Insurance .....	211

Montrose Chemical Corp. of California v. Admiral Insurance Co. ....	211
B. The Covenant of Good Faith and Fair Dealing .....	214
PPG Industries, Inc. v. Transamerica Ins. Co. ....	214
C. The Origins: Third Party Cases .....	215
Crisci v. Security Insurance Company .....	215
Notes .....	221
D. Constitutional Limitations .....	224
State Farm Mutual Automobile Ins. Co. v. Campbell .....	225
Notes .....	243
E. Limiting Third Party Claims .....	247
Murphy v. Allstate Insurance Company .....	247
Notes .....	251
F. The First Party Problem .....	252
Beck v. Farmers Insurance Exchange .....	252
Notes .....	260
G. Reverse Bad Faith .....	263
H. The Legislative Response .....	266
State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Company v. Reeder ....	268
QBE Insurance Corp. v. Chalfonte Condominium Apartment Ass'n, Inc. ....	271
Notes .....	280
I. A Postscript .....	284
Bi-Economy Market, Inc. v. Harleysville Insurance Company of New York .....	285
Notes .....	293
<b>Chapter 5. Liability Insurance .....</b>	<b>295</b>
A. Introduction—The Undertaking .....	295
Preliminary Note .....	295
Aerojet-General Corp. v. Transport Indemnity Co. ....	296
B. The Insurer's Undertaking .....	298
1. The Duty to Indemnify .....	298
Notes .....	300
2. The Duty to Defend .....	300
Notes .....	302
Pekin Insurance Co. v. Wilson .....	304
Fitzpatrick v. American Honda Motor Co., Inc. ....	316
Northfield Insurance Co. v. Loving Home Care, Inc. ....	324
Notes .....	334
American and Foreign Insurance Co. v. Jerry's Sport Center, Inc. ....	336
Notes .....	354
3. The Duty to Negotiate and to Effect Settlements .....	359
Mid-America Bank & Trust Co. v. Commercial Union Ins. Co. ....	359
Contreras v. United States Security Insurance Co. ....	361
Notes .....	368
C. The Insured's Undertaking .....	370

1.	Notice Requirements for Liability Claims .....	370
	Country Mutual Insurance Co. v. Livorsi Marine, Inc.....	371
	Notes.....	382
2.	The Insured's Duty of Cooperation.....	386
	State Farm Fire & Cas. Co. v. King Sports, Inc. ....	386
	Notes.....	399
3.	Intentional Injury .....	402
	Pachucki v. Republic Insurance Co. ....	402
	Notes.....	408
	General Direct Marketing, Inc. v. Lexington Insurance Co. ....	409
	Notes.....	416
D.	Reservations of Rights, Waiver Agreements, and Lawyer's Obligations.....	418
	Armstrong Cleaners, Inc. v. Erie Ins. Exch. ....	423
	Notes.....	437
E.	Problems of Multiple Coverage .....	444
1.	Concurrent Policies: Coverage Triggers.....	446
	Montrose Chemical Corp. v. Admiral Ins. Co. ....	446
	Notes.....	450
	American Home Products Corporation v. Liberty Mutual Insurance Company.....	451
	Notes.....	456
	Montrose Chemical Corp. v. Admiral Ins. Co. ....	456
	Notes.....	469
2.	Stacking of Coverage .....	471
	State of California v. Continental Insurance Co. ....	471
	Karscig v. McConville.....	477
	Notes.....	482
3.	Apportioning Liability.....	485
	Benjamin Moore & Co. v. Aetna Casualty & Surety Co. ....	485
	Notes.....	500
	Wooddale Builders, Inc. v. Maryland Casualty Co. ....	502
	Note .....	504
4.	Overlapping and Conflicting Liability Insurance Coverage.....	504
	Preliminary Note.....	504
	Richardson v. Ludwig.....	508
	Employers Reinsurance v. Mission Equities Corp. ....	511
	Carriers Insurance Co. v. American Policyholders' Insurance Co. ....	514
	Notes.....	518
F.	Context Specific Application.....	521
1.	The Environment.....	521
	Sulphuric Acid Trading Co., Inc. v. Greenwich Insurance Co. ....	522
	Notes.....	532
	AIU Insurance Co. v. Superior Court.....	536
	Notes.....	553
2.	Intellectual Property .....	553

a.	Copyright Infringement .....	555
	Ben Berger & Son, Inc. v. American Motorist Insurance Co. ....	555
	Notes.....	560
b.	Trademark Infringement .....	561
	General Casualty Co. of Wisconsin v. Wozniak Travel, Inc. ....	561
	Lebas Fashion Imports of USA, Inc. v. ITT Hartford Ins. Group ..	571
c.	Patent Infringement.....	580
	Aetna Casualty & Surety Co. v. Superior Court .....	581
	Notes.....	588
	Iolab Corp. v. Seaboard Surety Co. ....	588
	Note .....	593
d.	Specialty Policies .....	593
3.	Employment Practices Liability .....	594
	Andover Newton Theological School, Inc. v. Continental Casualty Co. ....	595
	Coit Drapery Cleaners, Inc. v. Sequoia Insurance Co. ....	600
	Notes.....	607
<b>Chapter 6. Property Insurance .....</b>		<b>611</b>
A.	Basic Principles .....	611
1.	Notice of Loss .....	614
	Gardner-Denver Co. v. Dic-Underhill Construction Co. ....	614
	Notes.....	618
	Schreiber v. Pennsylvania Lumberman's Mutual Insurance Company.....	620
	Notes.....	621
2.	Proof of Loss .....	622
	Nagel-Taylor Automotive Supplies, Inc. v. Aetna Casualty & Surety Co. ....	622
	Notes.....	626
	Fine v. Bellefonte Underwriters Ins. Co. ....	630
	Notes.....	635
B.	Insurers' Defenses .....	635
1.	No Insurable Interest—Variations on a Theme .....	635
	Notes.....	641
	G.M. Battery & Boat Company v. L.K.N. Corp. ....	641
	Note .....	645
	Hunter v. State Farm Fire and Casualty Co. ....	645
	Note .....	648
	Tublitz v. Glens Falls Insurance Co. ....	649
	American Family Mutual Insurance Co. v. Coke .....	650
	Notes.....	653
2.	There Is No Contract.....	655
	Christ Gospel Temple v. Liberty Mutual Insurance Co. ....	655
	Notes.....	658
3.	Loss Not Caused by Covered Risk .....	659
a.	Substantive v. Evidentiary Conditions .....	659
	Cochran v. MFA Mutual Insurance Co. ....	659

Notes.....	661
b. Implied Exceptions .....	662
Engel v. Redwood County Farmers Mutual Insurance Co. ....	662
Notes.....	665
c. Concurrent Causation .....	666
Pan American World Airways, Inc. v. Aetna Casualty & Surety Corp. ....	666
Note .....	668
Continental Insurance Co. v. Arkwright Mutual Insurance Co. ....	669
Notes.....	678
Graham v. Public Employees Mutual Insurance Co. ....	678
Notes.....	682
Garvey v. State Farm Fire and Casualty Co. ....	683
Note .....	695
4. The Insured Is Disqualified .....	699
a. Breach of Warranty .....	699
Introductory Note—No Coverage v. Breach of Warranty .....	699
Violin v. Fireman's Fund Insurance Co. ....	701
Notes.....	706
Reid v. Hardware Mutual Insurance Co. of the Carolinas .....	706
Vlastos v. Sumitomo Marine & Fire Ins. Co. (Europe), Ltd. ....	708
American Home Assurance Co. v. Harvey's Wagon Wheel, Inc. ....	712
Notes.....	716
b. Insured Fails to Meet a Condition: Increasing Hazard and the Vacancy or Unoccupancy Clause .....	717
Midwest Office Technology, Inc. v. American Alliance Ins. Co. ....	717
Notes.....	720
c. The Policy Has Been Cancelled .....	723
Baker v. St. Paul Fire & Marine Insurance Co. ....	724
Notes.....	728
C. Paying Claims.....	729
1. The Amount of Recovery .....	729
Titus v. West American Insurance Co. ....	729
Notes.....	735
Carey v. American Family Brokerage, Inc. ....	740
Notes.....	745
2. Apportionment Among Partial Interests .....	748
a. Joint Tenants .....	748
Russell v. Williams .....	748
b. Mortgagor/Mortgagee .....	752
Whitney National Bank of New Orleans v. State Farm Fire and Casualty Co. ....	752
Notes.....	754
c. Vendor/Vendee.....	756
Notes.....	756
Acree v. Hanover Insurance Co. ....	757
Notes.....	760

d. Bailment.....	763
D. Subrogation.....	764
Welch Foods, Inc. v. Chicago Title Ins. Co.....	765
Richard D. Brew & Co. v. Auclair Transportation, Inc.....	769
Notes.....	771
1. Limitations on Insurers' Rights of Subrogation .....	772
Sutton v. Jondahl .....	772
Duell v. Greater New York Mutual Insurance Co.....	774
Notes.....	775
Reeder v. Reeder.....	776
Note .....	781
Wimberly v. American Casualty Company of Reading, Pennsylvania (CNA) .....	782
Notes.....	786
2. Interference With Insurer's Subrogation Rights.....	786
Home Insurance Co. v. Hertz Corp. ....	786
Note .....	788
Executive Jet Aviation, Inc. v. United States.....	789
Note .....	792
<b>Chapter 7. Personal Insurance .....</b>	<b>795</b>
A. Insurance of the Person .....	795
Preliminary Note.....	795
1. Contract Formation and Conditional Receipts .....	798
Riner v. Allstate Life Insurance Co. ....	799
Notes.....	810
2. The Insurable Interest Requirement .....	811
Mutual Savings Life Insurance Co. v. Noah.....	811
Note .....	815
Note .....	818
3. The Insurer's Defenses.....	822
a. Payment of Premiums .....	822
Furtado v. Metropolitan Life Insurance Co. ....	822
Note .....	825
b. Conditions Precedent and Misrepresentation .....	826
Friez v. National Old Line Insurance Co. ....	826
Note .....	829
4. Incontestability.....	830
Crawford v. Equitable Life Assurance Society of United States....	830
Notes.....	838
5. Accidents.....	839
Wickman v. Northwestern National Insurance Co. ....	840
LaAsmar v. Phelps Dodge Corp. Life, Accidental Death & Dismemberment and Dependent Life Insurance Plan.....	851
Notes.....	865
Wetzel v. Westinghouse Electric Corp. ....	868
Notes.....	870
6. Rights to Proceeds .....	875



a.	Beneficiary Rights .....	875
	In re the Marriage of O'Connell.....	875
	Notes.....	881
b.	Changing the Beneficiary.....	883
	Manhattan Life Insurance Co. v. Barnes.....	883
	Notes.....	887
c.	Murder of the Insured .....	890
	Prudential Insurance Co. of America v. Athmer .....	890
	Notes.....	895
d.	Subrogation .....	895
	Shumpert v. Time Insurance Co.....	895
	Notes.....	901
	Perreira v. Rediger .....	901
	Notes.....	912
	In re Estate of Scott.....	913
	Notes.....	918
e.	"Other Insurance" and Multiple Insurance .....	923
	Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Kansas, Inc. v. Riverside Hospital .....	923
	O'Bar v. MFA Mutual Insurance Company .....	926
	Notes.....	928
7.	Personal Insurance and Business .....	929
	Wells v. John Hancock Mutual Life Insurance Co. ....	929
	Note .....	934
	Ryan v. Tickle .....	934
	Note .....	938
	Problems.....	939
	State Farm Life Insurance Co. v. Fort Wayne National Bank.....	942
B.	Disability Insurance.....	943
1.	Payment of Premiums .....	943
	Megee v. United States Fidelity and Guaranty Co. ....	943
2.	Implied Terms—"The Process of Nature" .....	945
	Willden v. Washington National Insurance Co. ....	945
3.	The Scope of Coverage.....	948
	Emond v. State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co. ....	948
	Notes.....	951
	Chalmers v. Metropolitan Life Insurance Co. ....	953
	Notes.....	956
C.	Automobile Insurance .....	956
1.	"Use, Maintenance or Operation" of a Car .....	957
	American States Insurance Company v. Allstate Insurance Company.....	957
	Note .....	958
2.	Insurer's Defenses .....	963
a.	The Policy Has Been Rescinded or Cancelled.....	963
	Barrera v. State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co. ....	963
	Notes.....	969

---

b. Permissive Users and the Omnibus Clause.....	974
Curtis v. State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co.....	974
Notes.....	980
State Farm Mutual Insurance Co. v. Schwartz.....	989
Notes.....	994
<b>Appendix A. Glossary of Insurance Terms.....</b>	<b>997</b>
<b>Appendix B. Commercial General Liability Coverage Form.....</b>	<b>1007</b>
<b>Appendix C. Personal Auto Policy .....</b>	<b>1023</b>
<b>Appendix D. Homeowners 3 – Special Form.....</b>	<b>1037</b>
<b>INDEX.....</b>	<b>1061</b>