

ASPEN CASEBOOK SERIES

*ELEVENTH EDITION*

---

# CASES AND MATERIALS ON TORTS

RICHARD A. EPSTEIN

Laurence A. Tisch Professor of Law  
New York University School of Law  
Peter and Kirsten Bedford Senior Fellow  
The Hoover Institution  
Stanford University  
James Parker Hall Distinguished Service Professor of Law  
Emeritus and Senior Lecturer  
The University of Chicago

CATHERINE M. SHARKEY

Crystal Eastman Professor of Law  
New York University School of Law



Wolters Kluwer

# CONTENTS

---

<i>Preface</i>	xxiii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xxv
<i>Introduction</i>	xxxi
<i>Torts Treatise: List of Chapters</i>	xxxix
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xli

---

## PART ONE

---

### PHYSICAL AND EMOTIONAL HARMS 1

---

#### CHAPTER 1

---

### INTENTIONAL HARMS: THE PRIMA FACIE CASE AND DEFENSES 3

Section A. Introduction	3
Section B. Physical Harms	4
1. Trespass to Person and Land	4
<i>Vosburg v. Putney</i>	4
<i>Dougherty v. Stepp</i>	12
2. Defenses to Intentional Torts	14
a. Consensual Defenses	14
<i>Mohr v. Williams</i>	14
<i>Canterbury v. Spence</i>	22
<i>Hudson v. Craft</i>	22
b. Mental Disability	28
<i>McGuire v. Almy</i>	28
c. Self-Defense	32
<i>Courvoisier v. Raymond</i>	32
d. Defense of Property	36
<i>Bird v. Holbrook</i>	36
e. Necessity	41
<i>Ploof v. Putnam</i>	41
<i>Vincent v. Lake Erie Transportation Co.</i>	44
Thomson, The Trolley Problem	50
Section C. Emotional and Dignitary Harms	52
1. Assault	52

<i>I. de S. and Wife v. W. de S.</i>	52
<i>Tuberville v. Savage</i>	53
Blackstone, Commentaries	53
2. Offensive Battery	56
<i>Alcorn v. Mitchell</i>	56
3. False Imprisonment	58
<i>Coblyn v. Kennedy's, Inc.</i>	58
4. The Intentional Infliction of Emotional Distress: Extreme and Outrageous Conduct	63
<i>Wilkinson v. Downton</i>	63

---

## CHAPTER 2

<b>STRICT LIABILITY AND NEGLIGENCE: HISTORIC AND ANALYTIC FOUNDATIONS</b>	<b>71</b>
<b>Section A. Introduction</b>	<b>71</b>
<b>Section B. The Formative Cases</b>	<b>72</b>
<i>The Thorns Case (Hull v. Orange)</i>	72
<i>Weaver v. Ward</i>	78
<b>Section C. The Forms of Action</b>	<b>82</b>
1. The Significance of the Forms	82
2. Trespass and Case	83
<i>Scott v. Shepherd</i>	84
3. The Breakdown of the Forms of Action	88
<b>Section D. Strict Liability and Negligence in the Second Half of the Nineteenth Century</b>	<b>91</b>
<i>Brown v. Kendall</i>	92
<i>Fletcher v. Rylands (1865)</i>	97
<i>Fletcher v. Rylands (1866)</i>	100
<i>Rylands v. Fletcher</i>	102
<i>Brown v. Collins</i>	108
<i>Powell v. Fall</i>	112
Holmes, The Common Law	114
<b>Section E. Strict Liability and Negligence in Modern Times</b>	<b>122</b>
<i>Stone v. Bolton</i>	122
<i>Bolton v. Stone</i>	123
<i>Hammontree v. Jenner</i>	132

---

## CHAPTER 3

<b>NEGLIGENCE</b>	<b>137</b>
Thayer, Public Wrong and Private Action Green, Judge and Jury	137
<b>Section A. Introduction</b>	<b>137</b>

<b>Section B. The Reasonable Person</b>	139
<i>Vaughan v. Menlove</i>	139
Holmes, The Common Law	144
<i>Roberts v. Ring</i>	146
<i>Daniels v. Evans</i>	148
<i>Breunig v. American Family Insurance Co.</i>	153
<i>Fletcher v. City of Aberdeen</i>	157
<i>Denver &amp; Rio Grande R.R. v. Peterson</i>	159
<b>Section C. Calculus of Risk</b>	160
<i>Blyth v. Birmingham Water Works</i>	160
Terry, Negligence	162
Seavey, Negligence — Subjective or Objective?	163
<i>Osborne v. Montgomery</i>	164
<i>Cooley v. Public Service Co.</i>	166
<i>United States v. Carroll Towing Co.</i>	170
Ross, Settled Out of Court	178
<i>Andrews v. United Airlines</i>	179
<b>Section D. Custom</b>	181
<i>Titus v. Bradford, B. &amp; K. R. Co.</i>	182
<i>Mayhew v. Sullivan Mining Co.</i>	184
<i>The T.J. Hooper (1931)</i>	186
<i>The T.J. Hooper (1932)</i>	187
<i>Lama v. Borrás</i>	193
<i>Murray v. UNMC Physicians</i>	200
Schuck, Rethinking Informed Consent	205
<i>Canterbury v. Spence</i>	206
<b>Section E. Statutes and Regulations</b>	218
Anon.	219
Thayer, Public Wrong and Private Action	219
<i>Osborne v. McMasters</i>	221
<i>Martin v. Herzog</i>	227
California Business & Professions Code §25602	231
<i>Uhr v. East Greenbush Cent. Sch. Dist.</i>	232
<b>Section F. Judge and Jury</b>	235
Holmes, The Common Law	238
<i>Baltimore and Ohio R.R. v. Goodman</i>	240
<i>Pokora v. Wabash Ry.</i>	241
<b>Section G. Proof of Negligence</b>	248
1. Methods of Proof	248
2. Res Ipsa Loquitur	249
<i>Byrne v. Boadle</i>	249
<i>Colmenares Vivas v. Sun Alliance Insurance Co.</i>	255
<i>Ybarra v. Spangard</i>	263

---

CHAPTER 4

---

<b>PLAINTIFF'S CONDUCT</b>	<b>275</b>
<b>Section A. Introduction</b>	<b>275</b>
<b>Section B. Contributory Negligence</b>	<b>276</b>
1. Basic Doctrine	276
<i>Butterfield v. Forrester</i>	276
<i>Beems v. Chicago, Rock Island &amp; Peoria R.R.</i>	277
Schwartz, Tort Law and the Economy in Nineteenth-Century America: A Reinterpretation	278
<i>Gyerman v. United States Lines Co.</i>	281
<i>LeRoy Fibre Co. v. Chicago, Milwaukee &amp; St. Paul Ry.</i>	289
<i>Derheim v. N. Fiorito Co.</i>	292
2. Last Clear Chance	296
<i>Fuller v. Illinois Central R.R.</i>	296
<b>Section C. Imputed Contributory Negligence</b>	<b>301</b>
<b>Section D. Assumption of Risk</b>	<b>303</b>
<i>Lamson v. American Axe &amp; Tool Co.</i>	303
<i>Murphy v. Steeplechase Amusement Co.</i>	308
<i>Dalury v. S-K-I Ltd.</i>	315
<b>Section E. Comparative Negligence</b>	<b>322</b>
1. At Common Law	322
Lombard Laws, King Liutprand	322
Beach, Contributory Negligence	323
Prosser, Comparative Negligence	323
<i>Li v. Yellow Cab Co. of California</i>	324
2. By Legislation	336
Federal Employers' Liability Act	336
New York	337
Pennsylvania	337
Wisconsin	337

---

CHAPTER 5

---

<b>CAUSATION</b>	<b>341</b>
<b>Section A. Introduction</b>	<b>341</b>
<b>Section B. Cause in Fact</b>	<b>343</b>
1. The "But For" Test	343
<i>New York Central R.R. v. Grimstad</i>	343
<i>Zuchowicz v. United States</i>	348
2. Joint and Several Liability and Multiple Causes	353
a. Joint and Several Liability	353
<i>Union Stock Yards Co. of Omaha v. Chicago, Burlington, &amp; Quincy R.R.</i>	354

California Civil Procedure Code §§875-877.5	356
<i>American Motorcycle Association v. Superior Court</i>	358
b. Multiple Sufficient Causes	367
<i>Kingston v. Chicago &amp; N.W. Ry.</i>	367
3. Indeterminate Causes	372
a. Alternative Liability	372
<i>Summers v. Tice</i>	372
b. Market Share Liability	376
<i>Sindell v. Abbott Laboratories</i>	376
c. Loss of Chance of Survival	387
<i>Herskovits v. Group Health Cooperative</i>	387
4. Proof of Factual Causation	394
<i>General Electric Co. v. Joiner</i>	394
<b>Section C. Proximate Cause (Herein of Duty)</b>	403
1. Physical Injury	403
Bacon, The Elements of the Common Lawes of England	403
Street, Foundations of Legal Liability	403
<i>Ryan v. New York Central R.R.</i>	403
<i>Berry v. Sugar Notch Borough</i>	407
<i>Brower v. New York Central &amp; H.R.R.</i>	412
<i>Wagner v. International Ry.</i>	417
<i>In re Polemis &amp; Furness, Withy &amp; Co.</i>	419
<i>Overseas Tankship (U.K.) Ltd. v. Morts Dock &amp; Engineering Co., Ltd. (Wagon Mound (No. 1))</i>	423
<i>Palsgraf v. Long Island R.R.</i>	431
<i>Marshall v. Nugent</i>	444
<i>Virden v. Betts and Beer Construction Company</i>	448
<i>Hebert v. Enos</i>	450
2. Emotional Distress	451
<i>Mitchell v. Rochester Ry.</i>	451
<i>Dillon v. Legg</i>	455

## CHAPTER 6

---

<b>AFFIRMATIVE DUTIES</b>	467
<b>Section A. Introduction</b>	467
<b>Section B. The Duty to Rescue</b>	469
Luke 10:30-37 (King James Translation)	469
<i>Buch v. Amory Manufacturing Co.</i>	470
<i>Hurley v. Eddingfield</i>	472
Bohlen, The Moral Duty to Aid Others as a Basis of Tort Liability	473
Ames, Law and Morals	473
Epstein, A Theory of Strict Liability	475
Posner, Epstein's Tort Theory: A Critique	476

	Bender, An Overview of Feminist Torts Scholarship	477
	<i>Montgomery v. National Convoy &amp; Trucking Co.</i>	481
<b>Section C. Duties of Owners and Occupiers</b>		486
	<i>Robert Addie &amp; Sons (Collieries), Ltd. v. Dumbreck</i>	486
	<i>Rowland v. Christian</i>	494
<b>Section D. Gratuitous Undertakings</b>		505
	<i>Coggs v. Bernard</i>	505
	<i>Erie Railroad Co. v. Stewart</i>	507
	<i>Moch Co. v. Rensselaer Water Co.</i>	512
<b>Section E. Special Relationships</b>		518
	<i>Kline v. 1500 Massachusetts Avenue Apartment Corp.</i>	519
	<i>Tarasoff v. Regents of University of California</i>	528

## CHAPTER 7

---

	<b>STRICT LIABILITY</b>	<b>539</b>
<b>Section A. Introduction</b>		539
<b>Section B. Trespass to Chattels and Conversion</b>		540
1. Trespass to Chattels		540
	<i>Intel Corp. v. Hamidi</i>	541
2. Conversion		549
	<i>Poggi v. Scott</i>	549
	<i>Moore v. Regents of the University of California</i>	553
<b>Section C. Animals</b>		563
	<i>Gehrts v. Batteen</i>	563
<b>Section D. Ultrahazardous or Abnormally Dangerous Activities</b>		572
	<i>Spano v. Perini Corp.</i>	572
	<i>Indiana Harbor Belt R.R. v. American Cyanamid Co.</i>	582
<b>Section E. Nuisance</b>		590
1. Private Nuisance		590
	<i>Vogel v. Grant-Lafayette Electric Cooperative</i>	590
	<i>Michalson v. Nutting</i>	596
	<i>Fontainebleau Hotel Corp. v. Forty-Five Twenty-Five, Inc.</i>	600
	<i>Rogers v. Elliott</i>	604
	<i>Ensign v. Walls</i>	608
	<i>Boomer v. Atlantic Cement Co.</i>	612
2. Public Nuisance		621
	<i>Anonymous</i>	621
<b>Section F. Vicarious Liability</b>		624
	<i>Ira S. Bushey &amp; Sons, Inc. v. United States</i>	624
	<i>Petrovich v. Share Health Plan of Illinois, Inc.</i>	632

---

CHAPTER 8

<b>PRODUCTS LIABILITY</b>	<b>641</b>
<b>Section A. Introduction</b>	<b>641</b>
<b>Section B. Exposition</b>	<b>645</b>
<i>Winterbottom v. Wright</i>	645
<i>MacPherson v. Buick Motor Co.</i>	648
<i>Escola v. Coca Cola Bottling Co. of Fresno</i>	656
<b>Section C. The Restatements</b>	<b>666</b>
1. A Tale of Two Texts	666
Restatement (Second) of Torts §402A	666
Restatement (Third) of Torts: Products Liability §§1-2	670
2. The Theory of Products Liability: Tort or Contract	671
<i>Casa Clara Condominium Association, Inc. v.</i>	
<i>Charley Toppino &amp; Sons, Inc.</i>	671
3. Proper Defendants Under Section 402A	678
<b>Section D. Product Defects</b>	<b>682</b>
1. Manufacturing Defects	682
<i>Speller v. Sears, Roebuck and Co.</i>	683
2. Design Defects	687
<i>Campo v. Scofield</i>	687
2 Harper and James, Torts §28.5	687
Wade, On the Nature of Strict Tort Liability for Products	687
a. Development of the Negligence Test	688
<i>Volkswagen of America, Inc. v. Young</i>	688
b. Consumer Expectations versus Risk-Utility Tests	697
<i>Barker v. Lull Engineering Co.</i>	697
c. Third Restatement and the Alternative Design Test	704
3. The Duty to Warn	708
<i>MacDonald v. Ortho Pharmaceutical Corp.</i>	709
<i>Vassallo v. Baxter Healthcare Corp.</i>	719
<i>Hood v. Ryobi America Corp.</i>	725
<b>Section E. Plaintiff's Conduct</b>	<b>731</b>
<i>Daly v. General Motors Corp.</i>	731
<b>Section F. Federal Preemption</b>	<b>740</b>
<i>Geier v. American Honda Motor Co.</i>	741
<i>Wyeth v. Levine</i>	747

---

CHAPTER 9

<b>DAMAGES</b>	<b>759</b>
<i>Sullivan v. Old Colony Street Ry.</i>	759
<i>Zibbell v. Southern Pacific Co.</i>	759
<b>Section A. Introduction</b>	<b>759</b>
<b>Section B. Recoverable Elements of Damages</b>	<b>760</b>



1. Pain and Suffering	760
<i>McDougald v. Garber</i>	760
2. Economic Losses	768
<i>O'Shea v. Riverway Towing Co.</i>	768
<i>Duncan v. Kansas City Southern Railway</i>	776
<b>Section C. Wrongful Death and Loss of Consortium</b>	782
1. Wrongful Death	783
a. History	783
b. Measure of Damages	785
2. Survival of Personal Injury Actions	786
3. Actions for Loss of Consortium	786
a. History	786
b. Parents and Children	787
c. Nontraditional Families	788
d. Damages in Consortium Cases	789
<b>Section D. Punitive Damages</b>	790
<i>Kemezy v. Peters</i>	790
<i>State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co. v. Campbell</i>	796
<b>Section E. Litigation Financing</b>	805
1. Contingent Fees	805
2. Class Actions	807
3. Fee Shifting	808
4. Sale of Tort Claims	808
5. Litigation Insurance	809
6. Alternative Litigation Financing	809
<b>Section F. Collateral Benefits</b>	810
<i>Harding v. Town of Townshend</i>	810

## CHAPTER 10

### TORT EXTENSIONS: INSURANCE AND NO-FAULT SYSTEMS

<b>Section A. Introduction</b>	815
<b>Section B. Liability Insurance</b>	816
1. Automobile and Other Basic Lines of Insurance	816
a. The March to Compulsory Insurance	816
b. The Standard Provisions of the Automobile Insurance Contract	818
i. The Omnibus Clause	818
ii. "Drive the Other Car" Clauses	819
iii. Uninsured Motorist Coverage	819
iv. Medical Payments	820
v. Misrepresentation and Nondisclosure	820
vi. Notice and Cooperation	821
2. Ambiguities of the Insurance Carrier	822
a. The Duty to Defend	823

b. The Obligation to Settle in Good Faith	823
<i>Crisci v. Security Insurance Co.</i>	823
3. Modern Tort Litigation	827
<i>Dimmitt Chevrolet, Inc. v. Southeastern Fidelity Insurance Corp.</i>	827
4. Cumulative Trauma Cases	835
<b>Section C. The No-Fault Systems</b>	837
1. Workers' Compensation	837
a. Historical Origins	838
b. The Scope of Coverage: "Arising Out of and in the Course of Employment"	844
<i>Clodgo v. Rentavision, Inc.</i>	844
<i>Wilson v. Workers' Compensation Appeals Board</i>	852
c. Benefits Under the Workers' Compensation Statutes	855
d. Exclusive Remedy	857
<i>Rainer v. Union Carbide Corp.</i>	857
2. Automobile No-Fault Insurance	862
a. The Basic Reform Proposal	862
American Bar Association, Special Committee on Automobile Insurance Legislation, Why the Statistical Studies Critical of the Fault System Are Flawed	864
Epstein, Automobile No-Fault Plans: A Second Look at First Principles	865
b. The Challenge of Implementation	865
3. No-Fault Insurance for Medical and Product Injuries	869
<b>Section D. The 9/11 Victim Compensation Fund</b>	871
<b>Section E. The New Zealand Plan</b>	873
Report of the Royal Commission of Inquiry, Compensation for Personal Injury in New Zealand	874
Accident Compensation: Options for Reform	875

## PART TWO

---

# TORTS AGAINST NONPHYSICAL INTERESTS 881

## CHAPTER 11

---

### DEFAMATION 883

<b>Section A. Introduction</b>	883
<b>Section B. Publication</b>	885
<i>Mims v. Metropolitan Life Insurance Co.</i>	885
<i>Firth v. State of New York</i>	889
<i>Blumenthal v. Drudge</i>	893
<b>Section C. False or Defamatory Statements</b>	898
<i>Parmiter v. Coupland</i>	898

	<i>Muzikowski v. Paramount Pictures Corp.</i>	898
	<i>Wilkow v. Forbes, Inc.</i>	906
<b>Section D. Libel and Slander</b>		912
	<i>Varian Medical Systems, Inc. v. Delfino</i>	912
<b>Section E. Basis of Liability: Intention, Negligence, and Strict Liability in Defamation</b>		918
	<i>E. Hulton &amp; Co. v. Jones</i>	918
<b>Section F. Damages</b>		920
1. Special Damages		920
	<i>Terwilliger v. Wands</i>	920
	<i>Ellsworth v. Martindale-Hubbell Law Directory, Inc.</i>	922
2. General Damages		925
	McCormick, Damages	925
	<i>Faulk v. Aware, Inc. (1962)</i>	925
	<i>Faulk v. Aware, Inc. (1963)</i>	926
3. Other Remedies		928
a. Injunctions		928
b. Retraction		928
c. Reply Statutes		929
d. Declaratory Relief and “Libel Tourism”		930
<b>Section G. Nonconstitutional Defenses</b>		931
1. Truth		931
	<i>Auvil v. CBS 60 Minutes</i>	931
2. Privileges in the Private Sphere		937
	<i>Watt v. Longsdon</i>	937
3. Privileges in the Public Sphere		943
a. Legal Proceedings and Reports Thereon		943
	<i>Kennedy v. Cannon</i>	943
b. Reports of Public Proceedings or Meetings		949
	<i>Brown &amp; Williamson Tobacco Corp. v. Jacobson</i>	949
c. Fair Comment: Artistic and Literary Criticism		952
	Veeder, Freedom of Public Discussion	954
<b>Section H. Constitutional Privileges</b>		957
1. Public Officials and Public Figures		957
	<i>New York Times Co. v. Sullivan</i>	957
	<i>Curtis Publishing Co. v. Butts</i>	964
2. Private Parties		972
	<i>Gertz v. Robert Welch, Inc.</i>	972
	<i>Obsidian Finance Group, LLC v. Cox</i>	980

---

## CHAPTER 12

	<b>PRIVACY</b>	985
<b>Section A. Introduction</b>		985
<b>Section B. Historical Background</b>		986

Warren & Brandeis, The Right to Privacy	986
Prosser, Privacy	988
Kalven, Privacy in the Tort Law — Were Warren and Brandeis Wrong?	990
Prosser, Privacy	992
<b>Section C. Intrusion Upon Seclusion</b>	993
<i>Nader v. General Motors Corp.</i>	993
<i>Boring v. Google Inc.</i>	1000
<i>Desnick v. American Broadcasting Co., Inc.</i>	1003
<b>Section D. Public Disclosure of Embarrassing Private Facts</b>	1011
<i>Sidis v. F-R Publishing Corp.</i>	1012
<i>Cox Broadcasting Corp. v. Cohn</i>	1016
<i>Haynes v. Alfred A. Knopf, Inc.</i>	1022
<b>Section E. False Light</b>	1027
<i>Time, Inc. v. Hill</i>	1027
<b>Section F. Commercial Appropriation of Plaintiff's Name or Likeness, or the Right of Publicity</b>	1032
<i>In re NCAA Student-Athlete Name and Likeness Litig.</i>	1033
<i>Factors Etc., Inc. v. Pro Arts, Inc.</i>	1045

## CHAPTER 13

---

<b>MISREPRESENTATION</b>	<b>1051</b>
<b>Section A. Introduction</b>	1051
<b>Section B. Fraud</b>	1052
<i>Pasley v. Freeman</i>	1052
<i>Vulcan Metals Co. v. Simmons Manufacturing Co.</i>	1060
<i>Swinton v. Whitinsville Savings Bank</i>	1065
<i>Laidlaw v. Organ</i>	1069
<i>Edgington v. Fitzmaurice</i>	1072
<i>Laborers Local 17 Health and Benefit Fund v. Philip Morris, Inc.</i>	1081
<b>Section C. Negligent Misrepresentation</b>	1087
<i>Ultramares Corp. v. Touche</i>	1087

## CHAPTER 14

---

<b>ECONOMIC HARMS</b>	<b>1099</b>
<b>Section A. Introduction</b>	1099
<b>Section B. Inducement of Breach of Contract</b>	1100
The Statute of Labourers (1351)	1100
<i>Lumley v. Gye</i>	1101
<i>Asahi Kasei Pharma Corp. v. Actelion Ltd.</i>	1111

<b>Section C. Intentional Interference with Prospective Advantage</b>	1117
<i>Tarleton v. M’Gawley</i>	1117
<b>Section D. Negligent Interference with Economic Relationships</b>	1120
<i>People Express Airlines, Inc. v. Consolidated Rail Corp.</i>	1120
<i>532 Madison Avenue Gourmet Foods, Inc. v. Finlandia Center, Inc.</i>	1129
<b>Section E. Unfair Competition</b>	1136
<i>Mogul Steamship Co. v. McGregor, Gow &amp; Co.</i>	1136
<i>International News Service v. Associated Press</i>	1145
<i>The National Basketball Association v. Motorola, Inc.</i>	1152
<i>Barclays Capital Inc. v. Theflyonthewall.com</i>	1156
<i>Ely-Norris Safe Co. v. Mosler Safe Co.</i>	1159
<i>Mosler Safe Co. v. Ely-Norris Safe Co.</i>	1161

## CHAPTER 15

---

<b>TORT IMMUNITIES</b>	1169
<b>Section A. Introduction</b>	1169
<b>Section B. Domestic or Intrafamily Immunities</b>	1170
1. Parent and Child	1170
a. Suits Between Parent and Child	1170
b. Third-Party Actions	1174
2. Spouses	1175
<b>Section C. Charitable Immunity</b>	1176
<b>Section D. Municipal Corporations</b>	1178
1. At Common Law	1178
2. By Statute	1180
745 Ill. Comp. Stat. (2016)	1181
3. Under the Constitution	1183
<b>Section E. Sovereign Immunity</b>	1185
Federal Tort Claims Act §§2671-2680	1186
<i>Berkovitz v. United States</i>	1187
<b>Section F. Official Immunity</b>	1196
<i>Clinton v. Jones</i>	1196
 <i>Table of Cases</i>	 1205
<i>Table of Restatement Sections</i>	1231
<i>Table of Secondary Authorities</i>	1237
<i>Index</i>	1251