

---

# The First Amendment

---

---

Sixth Edition

**Geoffrey R. Stone**

Edward H. Levi, Distinguished Service Professor  
University of Chicago Law School

**Louis M. Seidman**

Carmack Waterhouse Professor of Constitutional Law  
Georgetown University Law Center

**Cass R. Sunstein**

Robert Walmsley University Professor  
Harvard Law School

**Mark V. Tushnet**

William Nelson Cromwell Professor of Law  
Harvard Law School

**Pamela S. Karlan**

Kenneth and Harle Montgomery Professor of Public Interest Law  
Stanford Law School



Wolters Kluwer

# Contents

Preface	xix
Acknowledgments	xxi
Editorial Notice	xxiii
The First Amendment	xxv
The Constitution of the United States	xxvii
Biographical Notes on Selected U.S. Supreme Court Justices	xl
First Amendment Timeline	lxv

## PART I

---

Freedom of Expression	1
-----------------------	---

---

### I

---

The History and Philosophy of Free Expression	3
-----------------------------------------------	---

---

Note: The History of Free Expression	3
Note: The Philosophy of Free Expression	9
Note: Organization	16

### II

---

Content-Based Restrictions: Dangerous Ideas and Information	17
-------------------------------------------------------------	----

---

A. Speech that “Causes” Unlawful Conduct	17
Shaffer v. United States	18
<i>Masses Publishing Co. v. Patten</i>	19
<i>Schenck v. United States</i>	22
Note: <i>Shaffer</i> , <i>Masses</i> , and <i>Schenck</i>	24
Frohwerk v. United States	27
Debs v. United States	27
<i>Abrams v. United States</i>	29
Note: <i>Abrams</i> and the Emergence of the Holmes/Brandeis Tradition	32

<i>Gitlow v. New York</i>	35
Note: “Abstract Doctrine” versus “Urging to Action”	38
<i>Whitney v. California</i>	40
Note: The Brandeis Concurrence and the Road to <i>Dennis</i>	43
<i>Dennis v. United States</i>	46
Note: <i>Dennis</i> and the Communist “Conspiracy”	51
Note: The Road to <i>Brandenburg</i>	55
<i>Brandenburg v. Ohio</i>	57
Note: The <i>Brandenburg</i> Formulation	60
Note: Abridgment of Speech Other Than by Direct Criminal Prohibition	66
B. Speech that Provokes a Hostile Audience Reaction	72
<i>Terminiello v. Chicago</i>	72
<i>Cantwell v. Connecticut</i>	73
<i>Feiner v. New York</i>	74
Note: The Search for Mechanisms of Control	77
<i>Chaplinsky v. New Hampshire</i>	82
Note: Fighting Words	84
Note: The <i>Skokie</i> Controversy	88
<i>Snyder v. Phelps</i>	90
C. Classified Information	93
<i>New York Times Co. v. United States; United States         v. Washington Post Co.</i>	93
Note: The Pentagon Papers Controversy	100
Note: Dangerous Ideas and Information—Final Thoughts	107

### III

---

#### Overbreadth, Vagueness, and Prior Restraint 109

---

A. Overbreadth and Vagueness	109
<i>Gooding v. Wilson</i>	109
Note: Overbreadth	112
Note: Vagueness	115
B. Prior Restraint	116
<i>Lovell v. Griffin</i>	117
Note: Licensing as Prior Restraint	118
<i>Near v. Minnesota</i>	122
Note: Injunction as Prior Restraint	124

### IV

---

#### Content-Based Restrictions: “Low” Value Speech 129

---

A. False Statements of Fact	130
<i>New York Times v. Sullivan</i>	131
Note: “The Central Meaning” of <i>New York Times v. Sullivan</i>	137

Curtis Publishing Co. v. Butts; Associated Press v. Walker	140
Gertz v. Robert Welch, Inc.	141
Note: Public and Private Figures, Public and Private Speech	144
Dun & Bradstreet v. Greenmoss Builders	146
Note: Other False Statements of Fact	146
United States v. Alvarez	148
Hustler Magazine v. Falwell	152
B. "Nonnewsworthy" Disclosures of "Private" Information	154
<i>Cox Broadcasting Corp. v. Cohn</i>	154
Note: Invasion of Privacy and the First Amendment	157
C. Threats	162
Bridges v. California	162
Watts v. United States	163
Planned Parenthood v. American Coalition of Life Activists	164
D. Commercial Advertising	167
Virginia State Board of Pharmacy v. Virginia Citizens Consumer Council	168
Note: <i>Virginia Pharmacy</i> and "the Free Flow of Commercial Information"	175
Note: Truthful, Nondeceptive Commercial Advertising after <i>Virginia Pharmacy</i>	178
Central Hudson Gas v. Public Service Commission of New York	179
Note: Truthful, Nondeceptive Commercial Advertising	180
Note: Other Regulations of Commercial Advertising	185
E. Obscenity	189
Roth v. United States; <i>Alberts v. California</i>	190
Note: Obscenity and Free Expression	192
Note: Developments in the Law of "Obscenity"—1957–1973	197
<i>Miller v. California</i>	200
<i>Paris Adult Theatre I v. Slaton</i>	203
Note: The 1973 Reformulation and Its Aftermath	207
F. Child Pornography, Animal Cruelty, and Violent Expression	211
New York v. Ferber	211
Ashcroft v. The Free Speech Coalition	213
Note: Child Pornography	217
United States v. Stevens	218
Brown v. Entertainment Merchants Association	222
G. The Lewd, the Profane, and the Indecent	226
<i>Cohen v. California</i>	227
Note: Profanity, <i>Cohen</i> , and the Captive Audience	231
Erznoznik v. Jacksonville	234
FCC v. Pacifica Foundation	235
Note: Fleeting Expletives	237
IANCU v. BRUNETTI	239
Sable Communications, Inc. v. FCC	240
Reno v. American Civil Liberties Union	240
Ashcroft v. American Civil Liberties Union	241

Note: "Indecent" Expression	244
Note: Zoning Theaters with Adult Movies and Bars with Nude Dancing	248
H. Hate Speech	253
<i>Beauharnais v. Illinois</i>	253
Note: Group Defamation and "Hate Speech"	256
<i>R.A.V. v. City of St. Paul</i>	262
<i>Wisconsin v. Mitchell</i>	267
Note: <i>R.A.V.</i> and <i>Mitchell</i>	268
<i>Virginia v. Black</i>	270
Note: <i>R.A.V.</i> and <i>Black</i>	279
Note: Pornography and the Victimization of Women	279
Note: "Low" Value Speech—Final Thoughts	282

## V

---

Content-Neutral Restrictions: Limitations on the Means of Communication and the Problem of Content-Neutrality	285
---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

---

A. General Principles	286
<i>Schneider v. State</i>	286
<i>Martin v. City of Struthers</i>	287
<i>Kovacs v. Cooper</i>	288
<i>Metromedia, Inc. v. San Diego</i>	289
<i>City of Ladue v. Gilleo</i>	290
<i>Bartnicki v. Vopper</i>	291
Note: The Search for Principles	292
Note: The Meaning of "Content-Neutrality"	294
B. Speech on Public Property: The Public Forum	298
1. The Public Forum: Streets and Parks	299
<i>Commonwealth v. Davis</i>	299
<i>Hague v. CIO</i>	300
<i>Schneider v. State</i>	301
Note: Regulating the Public Forum	302
Note: Devices for Regulating the Public Forum	308
2. The Public Forum: Other Publicly Owned Property	311
<i>Adderley v. Florida</i>	311
Note: "No Less Than a Private Owner of Property"?	313
<i>International Society for Krishna Consciousness v. Lee</i>	318
Note: Modern Public Forum Doctrine	321
Note: The Right to a "Private" Forum	322

3. The Public Forum: Unequal Access and the Problem of Content-Neutrality	324
<i>Police Department of Chicago v. Mosley</i>	325
Note: <i>Mosley</i> and the “Equality” of Ideas	327
<i>Lehman v. City of Shaker Heights</i>	330
Note: <i>Lehman</i> and the Limits of <i>Mosley</i>	334
Perry Educators’ Association v. Perry Local Educators’ Association	337
Note: Quintessential, Designated, and Nonpublic Forums	338
Note: Religious Expression and the Meaning of “Viewpoint Neutrality”	343
Christian Legal Society Chapter v. Martinez	347
Reed v. Town of Gilbert	351
4. Unequal Access and the Problem of Government Speech	352
Southeastern Promotions v. Conrad	353
Board of Education, Island Trees Union Free School District v. Pico	355
Regan v. Taxation with Representation of Washington	357
National Endowment for the Arts v. Finley	359
Rust v. Sullivan	362
Note: The Implications of <i>Rust</i>	365
Legal Services Corp. v. Velazquez	367
Agency for International Development v. Alliance for Open Society International	368
Note: The Reach of Government Speech: <i>Summum</i> , <i>Walker</i> , and <i>Matal</i>	371
C. Symbolic Conduct	376
<i>United States v. O’Brien</i>	377
Note: Draft Card Burning and the First Amendment	383
Note: Flag Desecration and Misuse	388
Barnes v. Glen Theatre, Inc.	394
City of Erie v. Pap’s A.M.	398
Note: Other Forms of Symbolic Speech	399
D. Other Means of Expression: Litigation, Association, and the Right Not to Speak	402
NAACP v. Button	402
Note: Litigation and the First Amendment	403
NAACP v. Alabama	404
Roberts v. U.S. Jaycees	405
Note: Association and the First Amendment	407
Boy Scouts of America v. Dale	408
Note: The Meaning of <i>Dale</i>	411
Pruneyard Shopping Center v. Robins	412
Note: Compelled Affirmation, Expression, and Association: The Right Not to Speak	413

E. Regulation of Political Solicitation, Contribution, Expenditure, and Activity	421
<i>Buckley v. Valeo</i>	421
Note: <i>Buckley</i> and the Problem of Abridging Speech to “Enhance” the Electoral Process	431
Note: Subsidy and Disclosure	434
Note: Campaign Finance Regulation in the Thirty Years After <i>Buckley</i>	437
McConnell v. Federal Election Commission	441
Note: Campaign Finance and the Roberts Court	444
<i>Citizens United v. Federal Election Commission</i>	449
Note: Reflections on <i>Citizens United</i>	460
Note: Additional Regulation of the Electoral Process	471
Note: Regulating the Political Activities of Public Employees	473
Note: Content-Neutral Restrictions—Final Thoughts	477

## VI

---

Freedom of the Press	481
----------------------	-----

---

A. A “Preferred” Status for the Press?	481
B. A Right to “Gather” News?	483
<i>Branzburg v. Hayes</i>	483
Note: A Right to Gather News?	487
Note: A Press Right of Access to Information?	490
<i>Richmond Newspapers v. Virginia</i>	492
<i>Globe Newspaper Co. v. Superior Court</i>	494
Note: Variations on the Press Right of Access	495
C. Differential Treatment of the Press	496
<i>Minneapolis Star &amp; Tribune Co. v. Minnesota Commissioner of Revenue</i>	497
Note: Differential Treatment	498
D. Regulating the Press to “Improve” the Marketplace of Ideas	501
<i>Miami Herald Publishing Co. v. Tornillo</i>	501
<i>Red Lion Broadcasting Co. v. FCC</i>	502
Note: Regulating the Airwaves	505
<i>Turner Broadcasting System Inc. v. FCC</i>	507
Note: <i>Turner</i> and the Regulation of Cable	510
Note: The First Amendment in Cyberspace	511
Note: Free Expression—Final Thoughts	518

## PART II

---

### The Constitution and Religion

---

## VII

---

### Historical and Analytical Overview

---

Everson v. Board of Education	523
Note: The History of the Religion Clauses	526
Note: General Approaches to the Religion Clauses	533
Note: Defining Religion	540

## VIII

---

### The Establishment Clause

---

A. The Anticoercion Principle	546
<i>Lee v. Weisman</i>	546
Note: The Anticoercion Principle	556
B. The Nonendorsement Principle, History's Relevance, and de Facto Establishments	559
<i>Lynch v. Donnelly</i>	563
<i>American Legion v. American Humanist Association</i>	563
Note: Abandoning the Lemon Test and Replacing It with What?	574
C. Impermissible Purposes	578
<i>Trump v. Hawaii</i>	578
Note: Problems with a Purpose Test	586
D. Facially Neutral Statutes that Incidentally Aid Religion: Permissible and Impermissible Effects	593
Note: The Problem and Its Background	593
<i>Mueller v. Allen</i>	596
Note: From <i>Aguilar</i> to <i>Mitchell</i>	600
<i>Zelman v. Simmons-Harris</i>	606
Note: Purpose and Effect in Aid to Nonpublic Education—Benevolent Neutrality?	609
Note: Concluding Observations	615

## IX

---

<b>The Free Exercise Clause: Required Accommodations</b>	<b>617</b>
Note: From <i>Reynolds</i> to <i>Smith</i>	617
Braunfeld v. Brown	618
Sherbert v. Verner	619
Wisconsin v. Yoder	620
Note: Problems of Mandatory Accommodation	622
<i>Employment Division, Department of Human Resources</i> v. <i>Smith</i>	626
Note: Should Accommodation Be Required?	634
<i>Masterpiece Cakeshop Limited v. Colorado Civil Rights</i> <i>Commission</i>	637
Note: The Implications of Masterpiece Cakeshop	639

## X

---

<b>Permissible Accommodation</b>	<b>641</b>
<i>Corporation of Presiding Bishop of the Church of</i> <i>Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints v. Amos</i>	642
Texas Monthly v. Bullock	647
Board of Education of Kiryas Joel Village School District v. Grumet	648
Note: When — If Ever — Should Accommodations of Religion Be Permitted?	651
Hosanna-Tabor Evangelical Lutheran Church & School v. EEOC	655
Note: The Relation Between the Religion Clauses and Other Protections of Expression	656
Note: Concluding Observations	661
Table of Cases	663
Table of Authorities	669
Index	679