

CASES AND MATERIALS ON TORTS

Fifth Edition



David W. Robertson

*William Powers, Jr. and Kim L. Heilbrun Chair in Tort Law
University Distinguished Teaching Professor
The University of Texas at Austin*

William Powers, Jr.

*Joseph D. Jamail Centennial Chair in Law
University Distinguished Teaching Professor
The University of Texas at Austin*

David A. Anderson

*Fred and Emily Marshall Wulff Centennial Chair in Law
The University of Texas at Austin*

Olin Guy Wellborn III

*William C. Liedtke, Sr. Professor of Law
The University of Texas at Austin*

AMERICAN CASEBOOK SERIES®

 **WEST**
ACADEMIC
PUBLISHING

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE	III
TABLE OF CASES	XVII
Chapter I. Trial Court Procedure in Torts Cases	1
Chapter II. Intentional Harms to Persons and Property	9
A. Introduction	9
B. Battery	10
Ghassemieh v. Schafer.....	10
Note	15
Garratt v. Dailey	15
Notes	18
Fisher v. Carrousel Motor Hotel, Inc.	21
Notes	23
C. Assault	23
Vetter v. Morgan	23
Notes	25
D. False Imprisonment	26
Herbst v. Wuennenberg	26
Notes	30
E. Intentional Infliction of Emotional Distress.....	31
Eckenrode v. Life of America Insurance Company	31
Note	35
Dana v. Oak Park Marina, Inc.	35
Note	36
F. Trespass to Land	37
Amphitheaters, Inc. v. Portland Meadows	37
Notes	39
Martin v. Reynolds Metals Company.....	40
Notes	44
G. Trespass to Chattels and Conversion	44
Pearson v. Dodd.....	44
Notes	47
H. Consent	48
O'Brien v. Cunard S.S. Co.	48
Note	50
Overall v. Kadella.....	50
Notes	53
McPherson v. McPherson.....	53
Notes	55

I.	Privileges	56
1.	Self-Defense and Defense of Others	56
	Tatman v. Cordingly	56
	Notes.....	58
2.	Defense of Property	60
	Katko v. Briney.....	60
	Note	63
	Teel v. May Department Stores Co.	63
	Note	66
3.	Necessity	67
	Ploof v. Putnam	67
	Vincent v. Lake Erie Transp. Co.	69
Chapter III. Negligence—Introduction and Standard of Care		73
A.	Introduction	73
B.	Substandard Care	77
	Grace & Co. v. City of Los Angeles.....	77
	Notes	79
	T.J. Hooper	85
	Notes	86
C.	The “Reasonable Person”	86
	Vaughan v. Menlove.....	86
	Notes	88
	Roberts v. State of Louisiana.....	89
	Note	92
	Strait v. Crary	92
	Notes	95
D.	Violation of Statute	97
	Martin v. Herzog	97
	Notes	100
	Tedla v. Ellman	101
	Note	103
	Gorris v. Scott.....	104
	Potts v. Fidelity Fruit & Produce Co.....	105
	Note	106
	Zerby v. Warren.....	106
E.	Res Ipsa Loquitur	109
	Colmenares Vivas v. Sun Alliance Insurance Co.	109
	Notes	112
Chapter IV. Factual Causation.....		115
A.	The But-For Test	116
	East Texas Theatres, Inc. v. Rutledge	116
	Marek v. Southern Enterprises, Inc.....	119
	Notes	121
	Viner v. Sweet.....	123
	Note	126

B.	Limited-Purpose Substitutes for the But-For Approach: The Substantial Factor Test and the Restatement (Third) Substitute.....	127
	Sanders v. American Body Armor and Equipment, Inc.....	127
	Note	128
	June v. Union Carbide Corporation	128
	Notes	132
C.	Limited-Purpose Substitutes for the But-For Approach: The Alternative Liability, Concerted Action, and Market Share Theories.....	135
	Pennfield Corp. v. Meadow Valley Electric, Inc.	135
	Notes	137
	Poole v. Alpha Therapeutic Corporation.....	138
	De Carvalho v. Brunner	141
	Notes	142
D.	Limited-Purpose Substitutes for the But-For Approach: The Lost Opportunity Doctrine	144
	Smith v. Parrott.....	145
	Notes	148
E.	Apportioning Damages on the Basis of Causation.....	151
1.	Apportioning Harm Caused by Multiple Tortfeasors	151
	Holtz v. Holder.....	151
	Notes.....	154
2.	Apportioning Harm Caused by a Combination of Tortious Conduct and Other Causes	156
	Follett v. Jones.....	156
	Lancaster v. Norfolk and Western Railway Co.	157
	Notes.....	160
	Blatz v. Allina Health System	162
	Notes.....	165
	Chapter V. Proximate Cause (Scope of Liability).....	167
A.	Introduction to Classification and Terminology Problems	167
B.	The Restatement (Third) Approach	168
	Royal Indemnity Co. v. Factory Mutual Insurance Co.	168
	Notes	171
C.	Famous Old Cases	173
	Overseas Tankship Ltd. v. Morts Dock & Engineering Co. Ltd. (Wagon Mound I)	173
	Notes	177
	Palsgraf v. Long Island R. Co.	184
	Notes	189
D.	Controversial Modern Cases.....	193
	Edwards v. Honeywell, Inc.	193
	Notes	199
	Meyering v. General Motors Corp.	200
	Note	205

Chapter VI. The Duty Issue	207
A. The Principle of Heaven v. Pender.....	207
B. Privity of Contract.....	211
Bush v. SECO Electric Co.....	213
Notes	216
C. Nonfeasance vs. Misfeasance	217
Satterfield v. Breeding Insulation Co.	219
Notes	223
Lacey v. United States	224
Notes	225
Galanti v. United States	227
Notes	230
D. Emotional Trauma	233
Bosley v. Andrews	234
Notes	236
Niederman v. Brodsky	237
Notes	240
Sinn v. Burd.....	240
Notes	244
Armstrong v. Paoli Memorial Hospital	244
Notes	250
E. Pure Economic Loss	252
Barber Lines v. M/V Donau Maru.....	254
Notes	260
East River Steamship Corp. v. Transamerica Delaval, Inc.	262
Notes	267
F. Owners and Possessors of Land	269
1. Possessor's Liability for Injuries off the Land	270
Sprecher v. Adamson Companies	270
Notes.....	275
2. Possessor's Liability for Injuries on the Land	276
Machado v. Yacht Haven U.S.V.I., LLC	276
Notes.....	281
Bennett v. Stanley	282
Notes.....	285
G. Creating No-Duty Rules	285
Thompson v. Kaczinski	288
Notes	290
Kentucky Fried Chicken of California, Inc. v. Superior Court.....	291
Notes	295
 Chapter VII. Damages in Personal Injury and Fatal Injury	
Litigation	297
A. Compensatory Damages in Personal Injury Cases	297
Rodriguez v. McDonnell Douglas Corp.	299
Notes	307

1.	Present Value.....	308
	Banks v. Sunrise Hospital	310
	Notes.....	313
2.	Collateral Benefits.....	315
	Hoffman v. 21st Century North American Ins. Co.....	317
	Notes.....	321
B.	Fatal Injuries: Wrongful Death and Survival Actions.....	321
	Sea-Land Services, Inc. v. Gaudet.....	323
	Notes	327
C.	Other Compensatory Damage Issues.....	327
1.	Interest.....	327
2.	Taxation	328
3.	Lump-Sum Judgments and Structured Settlements	328
4.	Caps on Damages	329
D.	Punitive Damages	330
	Mathias v. Accor Economy Lodging, Inc.....	331
	Notes	335
Chapter VIII. Vicarious Liability.....		337
	Patterson v. Blair	338
	Castellanos v. Tommy John, LLC	346
Chapter IX. Victim Fault and Proportionate Liability		351
A.	Punishing Tort Victims.....	351
	Mischalski v. Ford Motor Company	352
	Guadamud v. Dentsply International, Inc.....	355
	Notes	358
B.	Traditional Affirmative Defenses in Negligence Actions	360
C.	Replacing the Contributory Negligence Doctrine with Comparative Fault.....	360
	McIntyre v. Balentine	362
	Notes	367
	Wassell v. Adams	371
	Notes	376
D.	Proportionate Liability Issues in Multiple Tortfeasor Cases	382
1.	Jettisoning Joint and Several Liability; Authorizing Percentage- Fault Assignments to Nonparty Tortfeasors	383
	Brown v. Keill	383
	Notes.....	390
	Varela v. American Petrofina Company of Texas, Inc.	394
	Notes.....	396
2.	Indemnity, Contribution, and Partial Settlements	398
a.	Indemnity.....	399
b.	Contribution.....	400
c.	Partial Settlements	400
	McDermott, Inc. v. AmClyde.....	400
	Notes.....	406

E.	Imputed Contributory or Comparative Fault.....	406
	Continental Auto Lease Corporation v. Campbell	407
	Notes	409
	White v. Lunder.....	411
	Note	413
F.	Failure to Avoid Consequences; Failure to Mitigate Damages	414
	Hutchins v. Schwartz	414
	Notes	417
G.	The Continually Expanding Influence of Comparative Fault	
	Concepts	419
	1. Holding the Line: A “Conceptual Phases” Map	421
	Exxon Company, U.S.A. v. Sofec, Inc.	422
	Notes.....	426
	Piner v. Superior Court.....	427
	Notes.....	432
H.	Percentage-Fault Assignments in Intentional Tort Cases	433
	Ozaki v. Ass’n of Apartment Owners of Discovery Bay	434
	Notes	437
I.	Assumption of the Risk	439
	1. Express Assumption of Risk	440
	Hojnowski v. Vans Skate Park	443
	Notes.....	449
	2. Implied Primary Assumption of Risk.....	450
	Bennett v. Hidden Valley Golf and Ski, Inc.....	450
	Notes.....	453
	3. Implied Secondary Assumption of Risk	455
	Kane v. Landscape Structures, Inc.	456
	Note	459
	Chapter X. Statutes of Limitations and Repose.....	461
A.	Statutes of Limitations	461
	Jolly v. Eli Lilly & Co.	462
	Notes	466
	Feltmeier v. Feltmeier	467
	Notes	470
B.	Statutes of Repose	472
	Bradway v. American National Red Cross	472
	Notes	474
	Chapter XI. Government and Family Immunities.....	477
A.	Government Immunity	478
	1. State and Local Governments	478
	Hicks v. State.....	478
	Notes.....	481
	2. The “Public Duty” Doctrine.....	483
	Riss v. City of New York	484
	Notes.....	487

3.	Federal Government.....	489
a.	Federal Tort Claims Act.....	489
	Merando v. United States	492
	Notes.....	497
b.	Immunity for Government Contractors	498
4.	Immunity of Government Officials and Employees	499
B.	Family Immunities.....	500
	Price v. Price	500
	Zellmer v. Zellmer	503
Chapter XII. Medical Malpractice		511
A.	Professional Standard of Care	511
	Melville v. Southward	511
	Notes	517
B.	Informed Consent.....	518
	Harrison v. United States.....	519
	Notes	523
Chapter XIII. Common Law Strict Liability		525
A.	Animals	525
B.	Abnormally Dangerous Activities	526
	Rylands v. Fletcher	526
	Notes	529
	Siegler v. Kuhlman.....	530
	Notes	534
Chapter XIV. Products Liability		537
A.	Introduction	537
B.	Emergence of Strict Tort Liability	541
	Greenman v. Yuba Power Products, Inc.	541
	Notes	544
C.	Defect	546
	Linegar v. Armour of America, Inc.....	546
	Phillips v. Kimwood Machine Company	550
	Notes	555
	Potter v. Chicago Pneumatic Tool Co.....	557
D.	Plaintiff-Conduct Defenses	559
	Daly v. General Motors Corp.	559
	Notes	564
Chapter XV. Nuisance.....		567
	Amphitheaters, Inc. v. Portland Meadows	567
	Notes	570
	Boomer v. Atlantic Cement Co.	571
	Notes	574
INDEX.....		577