

Ken Oliphant
Richard W. Wright (eds.)

Medical Malpractice and Compensation in Global Perspective

With Contributions by

Kinga Bączyk-Rozwadowska	Bernhard A. Koch
Pieter Carstens	Robert B Leflar
Loutjie Coetzee	Ken Oliphant
Eduardo Dantas	Richard W. Wright
Claudia di Marzo	Mårten Schultz
Colleen M. Flood	Charles M. Silver
Richard Golderg	Marc S. Stauch
Florence G'Sell-Macrez	Bryan Thomas
Mette Hartlev	Stephan Todd
Genevieve Helleringer	Vibe Ulfbeck
David A. Hyman	Zhu Wang

De Gruyter

Table of Contents

Ken Oliphant and Richard W. Wright

Medical Malpractice and Compensation in Global Perspective:

Introduction 1

 I. Issues Addressed 2

 A. Overall Scheme 2

 B. Details of the Applicable Liability and Compensation Systems . . 3

 C. Empirical Data 4

 D. Attitudes, Concerns, and Prospects 4

 II. Aims 4

Bernhard A. Koch

Medical Malpractice in Austria 7

Introduction 7

 I. The Insurance Framework 8

 A. Social Insurance in Austria 8

 B. The Role of Private Insurance 9

 1. First-Party Insurance 9

 2. Liability Insurance 10

 II. The Regulatory Framework 10

 A. Professional Law 10

 B. Criminal Law 11

 C. Contract Law 12

 D. Tortious and Contractual Liability 13

 1. Tortious and Contractual Liability Not Mutually Exclusive . . 13

 2. Tort Law in General 14

 3. Damage 14

 4. Causation 14

 5. Wrongfulness and Fault 17

 6. Multiple Persons Involved 18

 7. Informed Consent 21

 8. Remedies 24

 III. Compensation claims in practice 28

 A. General Remarks 28

 B. Patient Advocacies 29

 C. Conciliation Bodies 30

D. Compensation Funds	31
E. Outlook	32

Eduardo Dantas

A Bridge over troubled Waters: The Development of

Medical Malpractice Litigation in Brazil	35
-----------------------------------------------------------	-----------

Introduction	35
I. The Brazilian Legal System	39
II. The Structure of the Brazilian Legal System	40
III. The influence of the Consumer's Defense Code	43
A. Informed Consent, the Duty to Inform, and Informed Choice	45
B. Moral Damages and the Inversion of the Burden of Proof As Patient's Basic Rights	49
IV. The Changes Brought by the New Civil Code	50
Conclusion	52

Colleen M. Flood and Bryan Thomas

**Canadian Medical Malpractice Law in 2011: Missing the Mark on
Patient Safety**

Patient Safety	55
Introduction	55
I. The Canadian Malpractice Context	57
A. Service Delivery, Regulation and Liability Insurance	59
II. State and Quality of the Canadian Health Care System	60
A. Medical Malpractice in the Domain of Privately Financed Care	66
III. Redressing Adverse Events through the Courts	67
A. Canadian Medical Malpractice Liability in Context	69
B. Empirical Trends on Medical Liability Claims	70
C. Black Letter of Canadian Tort Law	72
1. Battery by Physicians	73
2. Negligence by Physicians	73
3. Hospital Liability	81
4. Government Liability	83
5. Damages	84
6. Ongoing Issues and Avenues of Reform	86
IV. Preventing Adverse Events: Professional and System Reform	87
A. Reforms at the Level of the Professions	88
1. Alternative Complaint Mechanisms	88
2. Revalidation/Recertification	89
3. Apology Legislation	90
B. Systemic Reforms	91
1. Accreditation of Facilities	91
2. Canadian Patient Safety Institute	92
3. Improved Information Gathering and Dissemination	92
Conclusion	94

Zhu Wang and Ken Oliphant

Yangge Dance: the Rhythm of Liability for Medical Malpractice in the People's Republic of China 97

Introduction 97

 I. The Wider Healthcare Context 99

 II. The Early P.R. China: Medical Services as Social Welfare (1949–1987) 102

 III. The Administrative Liability Regime 105

 A. The Medical Accident Rules 1987 105

 1. Context 105

 2. Main Features of the Administrative Liability Regime, 1987–2002 106

 B. The Medical Accident Regulations 2002 108

 1. Context 108

 2. Main Features of the Administrative Liability Regime, 2002 onwards 108

 IV. The Tort Liability Regime 111

 A. Recourse to the General Principles of Civil Liability 111

 B. Elements of the Tort Liability Regime 113

 1. Cause of Action 113

 2. Burden of Proof 113

 3. The Identification Process 114

 4. Assessment of Damages 115

 C. Effect on the Administrative Liability Regime 116

 V. Reform of Medical Liability under the Tort Liability Law of 2009 . . . 117

 A. Antecedents 117

 1. Increasing Disputes between Doctors and Patients 117

 2. Concerns about Defensive Medical Treatments 118

 3. The Chaos Resulting from the Dual Dystem of Medical Liability 119

 B. Legislative History 120

 C. Four Dimensions of the TLL 121

 1. Basis of the Cause of Action 121

 2. Burden of Proof 124

 3. The Identification Procedure 126

 4. Assessment of Damages 126

 VI. Another Step Backwards on Its Way? 127

Conclusion 130

Medical Malpractice and Compensation in France 131*Florence G'sell-Macrez***Part I: The French Rules of Medical Liability since the Patients' Rights Law of March 4, 2002 131****Introduction 131**

- I. General Conditions of Medical Liability 134
 - A. Facts Likely to Justify the Physician's Responsibility 135
 - 1. Liability Based on Fault 136
 - 2. Strict Liability 143
 - B. The Causal Link 148
 - 1. Causation Criterion 148
 - 2. Causation Proof 149
 - C. The Victim's Harm 154
- II. Administration and Adjudication of claims based on liability rules . . 156
 - A. Adjudication Through Conciliation Commissions 157
 - B. Adjudication Through Courts 159

*Geneviève Helleringer***Part II: Compensation Based on National Solidarity 163****Introduction 163**

- I. Typology of Cases Covered by National Solidarity 164
 - A. Medical Hazards 164
 - B. Hospital-Acquired Infections 166
 - C. Blood Transfusions Infections 167
 - 1. HIV Infection 167
 - 2. Hepatitis C Infection 168
 - 3. Additional Grounds 168
- II. Administration and Adjudication of Claims Based on National Solidarity 169
 - A. Administrated Claims 169
 - B. Procedural Routes to ONIAM 171
 - C. Adjudication Proceedings in Front of ONIAM 173
 - D. Regulatory Principles Applying to Rights of Recourse 174
- III. Awarded Compensation 175

*Marc S. Stauch***Medical Malpractice and Compensation in Germany 179****Introduction 179**

- I. The Potential Legal Consequences of Medical Injury 181
 - A. Criminal Law 181
 - B. Professional and Disciplinary Sanctions 182
 - C. Fault-Based Compensation in Private Law 183

Table of Contents

D. Strict Liability and No-Fault Compensation for Medical Product Injury	186
E. Social Security, Insurance, and Subrogation Issues	187
II. The System of Private Law Compensation	189
A. Treatment Malpractice Claims	189
1. Faulty Treatment	189
2. Causation	192
3. Proof Issues	193
B. Disclosure Malpractice Claims	196
1. Background	196
2. Standard of Disclosure	197
3. Causation	198
C. Damages and Liability Insurance Issues	199
D. The Medical Arbitration Boards	201
III. Assessment of the Current Situation	202
A. Empirical Data	202
B. Evaluation of the Private Law Redress Rules	205
C. Patient Safety Initiatives	207
Conclusion	208
Addendum	209

Claudia Di Marzo

Medical Malpractice: The Italian Experience	211
Introduction	211
I. The Problematic Nature of Medical Liability	213
II. The Assignment of the Burden of Proof Between Parties	221
A. Proving Fault	221
B. Proving Causation-In-Fact	226
C. Proving Causation Under the Criminal Law and Under the Civil Law	229
D. The Role of Informed Consent	232
Conclusion	235

Robert B Leflar

The Law of Medical Misadventure in Japan	239
Introduction	239
I. Prosecutions and Their Consequences	242
A. Prosecutions in Medical Cases	242
B. Response by the Health Ministry and the Medical Profession	246
C. One Prosecution Too Many: The Medical Professionals' Counterattack and the String of Acquittals	249
II. Civil Liability	251
A. Substantive Law of Medical Malpractice	252
1. Theories of Recovery	252

2. Standard of Care	253
3. Level of Proof	254
4. Informed Consent and Related Actions	257
5. Damages	258
B. Key Aspects of Procedural Law and Practice	260
1. In General	260
2. Discovery of Peer Review Findings	261
3. Judicial Administration Reforms	262
4. Settlement Practices, Overall Claiming Levels, and Malpractice Insurance Premiums	263
5. Plaintiffs' Attorney Fees and Court Filing Fees	267
III. The No-Fault Compensation System for Obstetrical Injury	268
Conclusion	271
Addendum	273

Stephen Todd

Treatment Injury in New Zealand 275

Introduction	275
I. The New Zealand Accident Compensation Scheme	276
A. The Woodhouse Report	276
B. Implementation	278
C. Developments to 2010	279
D. Relationship with the Common Law	283
E. Cover	285
1. Categories of Cover	285
2. Personal Injury	286
3. Residual Actions for Damages	287
F. Claimants	288
G. Benefits	288
H. Claims Process	290
I. Funding	291
J. Administration	292
II. Medical Injuries	292
A. Cover	295
B. Treatment Injury	296
1. Proof of Cause	296
a. <i>Atkinson</i> and <i>Ambros</i>	297
b. Modification of Ordinary Rules ³	301
2. Nature of Treatment Injury	304
3. Treatment Injury in Operation	307
4. Costs	310
C. Professional Accountability	311
1. Reporting of Medical Risks	312
2. Complaints	313

Table of Contents

3. Actions for Damages	314
a. Clinical Trials	314
b. Stillbirths	315
c. Pregnancy and Unwanted Births	316
d. Informed Consent Cases	317
e. Mental Injury	318
f. Miscellaneous	318
g. Exemplary Damages	318
Conclusion	319
A. Adequate Compensation?	319
B. Defensible Boundaries?	319
C. Administratively Efficient?	321
D. Disincentive to Safety-Conscious Behavior?	322
E. Overview	324

Kinga Bączyk-Rozwadowska

Medical Malpractice and Compensation in Poland	327
Introduction	327
I. Grounds for Civil Liability	331
II. Liability Based on Fault	344
III. Burden of Proof and Causation	351
IV. Compensation	356
V. Professional Liability of Doctors	370
Conclusion	372
Addendum	373

Vibe Ulfbeck, Mette Hartley and Mårten Schultz

Malpractice in Scandinavia	377
Introduction	377
I. The Overall Scheme for Preventing and Redressing Medical Errors and Adverse Events	379
A. Regulatory Methods in the Nordic Health Care Systems	379
B. Compensation Systems	380
C. Liability Systems	381
D. The Relationship Between the Systems	382
II. The Details of the Applicable Liability and Compensation Systems	383
A. Patient Injury Compensation Systems	383
1. Introduction	383
2. Basis for Compensation	383
a. The Experienced Specialist Standard	383
b. The Failure of Apparatus	385
c. The Alternative Treatment Rule	386
d. The Reasonableness Rule	386
e. "Accidents"	387

f. Wrong Diagnosis	388
g. Infection	388
3. Causation	388
a. The Concept of Causation in Scandinavian Law	388
b. The Problems of Causation in Malpractice Law	392
c. Relaxation of Evidence	392
d. Assessment of Damages	393
III. Available Empirical Data	394
Conclusion	395

L.C. Coetzee and Pieter Carstens

Medical Malpractice and Compensation in South Africa 397

I. The Overall Scheme for Preventing and Redressing Medical Errors and Adverse Events, Including Regulation, Criminal and Civil Liability, and Social and Private Insurance, and the Relationships Among These Various Systems	397
A. Regulatory Methods	397
1. Government Licensing Authorities for Doctors and Hospitals	397
2. Medico-Ethical Codes of Conduct	401
3. Reporting of Medical Errors and Adverse Events to the Health Profession Council of South Africa	402
B. Liability Systems	403
1. Contract	403
2. Delict (Tort)	406
3. Criminal Law	406
4. Relationship Between the Liability Systems	408
C. Compensation Systems	409
1. Sufficient Insurance Cover To Be Required for Private Health Establishments	413
2. Private Indemnity (Medical Protection Society)	414
D. Relationships Among the Compensation Systems, the Liability Systems, and the Regulatory Systems	415
II. The Details of the Applicable Liability and Compensation Systems	418
A. Criteria Defining Qualification for Compensation	418
1. Liability Based on Fault	418
2. The Role of the South African Constitution, 1996	420
3. Nature of Damages and Compensation	421
B. Causation and "Loss of Chance"	423
1. General Rules on Causation	423
2. "Loss of a Chance"	425
C. Liability for Failure to Obtain Informed Consent	426
D. Matters of Proof and Gathering of Evidence	427
1. Matters of Proof	427
a. General	427
b. Gathering of Evidence	431

III. Available Empirical Data on Medical Errors and Adverse Events, the Operation of the Systems Designed to Prevent and/or Redress such Errors and Events, and the Prevalence and Impact of Measures Designed to Reduce Medical Errors and Adverse Events, Improve System Performance, or Reduce System Costs	432
IV. Attitudes and Concerns About the Liability and Compensation Systems	435
 <i>Richard Goldberg</i>	
Medical Malpractice and Compensation in the UK	439
Introduction	439
I. The Context of Medical Malpractice Liability	440
II. Recent Empirical Evidence on the Numbers and Funding of Claims.	442
A. England	442
B. Scotland	445
C. Summary	446
III. NHS Redress Act 2006	446
IV. Patients' Rights Bill in Scotland: The No-Fault Compensation Review Group Report (McLean Report)	448
V. Basis of Liability for Medical Injury	451
A. Contract, Tort, and Delict	451
B. The Requirements of Negligence	451
C. Duty of Care	452
D. Standard of Care	452
E. Causation	454
1. Difficulties in Proving Causation in Clinical Negligence Cases	455
2. The Burden of Proof	456
3. The "But For" Test	456
4. Cumulative Causation	457
5. Material Increase in Risk	457
6. Alternative Causation	457
7. Reinstating <i>McGhee; Fairchild</i>	458
8. The Scope of <i>Fairchild</i> and Clinical Negligence Cases	459
9. Loss of a Chance	462
VI. Reforming the Costs of Civil Litigation in England and Wales: Implications of the Jackson Report for the Costs of Clinical Negligence and the Ministry of Justice Reform of Legal Aid	466
A. Jackson Report	466
B. Reform of Legal Aid in England and Wales	469
Conclusion	470

David A. Hyman and Charles M. Silver

Medical Malpractice and Compensation in Global Perspective:

How Does the U.S. Do It?	473
Introduction	473
I. Details of the Applicable Regulatory and Liability/Compensation Systems	476
A. Regulating the Delivery of Medical Care	476
B. Liability/Compensation Systems	477
1. Fault-Based (Negligence)	477
2. No-Fault Liability (Strict Liability)	483
C. Limitations on Liability/Contracting out of Liability	483
D. Immunity from Liability	485
II. Empirical Data on Medical Errors/Adverse Events and Malpractice Litigation	486
A. How Common Are Medical Errors and Adverse Events?	486
B. Malpractice Litigation	487
1. Claiming Frequency (relative to rate of medical error/adverse events)	488
2. Compensation Patterns and Time Trends	489
3. Impact of Caps on Non-Economic Damages	496
4. Accuracy of the Liability System	499
5. Frivolous Lawsuits	501
6. Cost of Medical Errors/Adverse Events	502
7. Cost of the Liability System	503
III. Attitudes and Concerns About the Liability and Compensation Systems	505
IV. Why Do Things Look the Way They Do?	506
V. What Have We Learned by Studying Texas?	507
A. Who Decides Malpractice Cases?	507
B. Does it Matter How Much the Jury Awards in a Malpractice Case?	508
C. How Much Coverage Do Physicians Have?	508
D. Do Changes in the Tort System (i.e., increases in the number of claims, or payouts per claim) Help Explain the Malpractice Crises that Hit the United States in 2000–2003?	509
E. Impact of Tort Reforms on Claim Frequency and Payouts	510
Conclusion	510

Ken Oliphant

Medical Malpractice and Compensation:

Comparative Observations	513
Introduction	513
I. Making Sense of Diversity	516
A. A Diversity of Legal Mechanisms	516

Table of Contents

1. Liability systems	516
2. Alternative compensation systems	521
3. Other regulatory and complaints mechanisms	523
B. The Wider Context	526
1. The substantive legal context	526
2. The wider litigation process	527
3. The health care context	530
C. Comparative Functional Analysis	533
II. Assessment of Liability-Based Approaches	535
A. Compensation	535
1. Mechanisms for dealing with organizational complexity . . .	536
2. Adaptation of the Requirements of Causation and Proof . . .	539
3. Patients' Rights and Disclosure Duties	542
B. Prevention	547
1. The deterrent effect of liability rules	547
2. Pushing prevention too far? Defensive medicine and related issues	549
C. Accountability	550
D. Weighing the Evidence	551
1. Public controversy and narratives of crisis	551
2. Empirical evidence	552
III. Assessment of No-Fault Alternatives	555
A. Introduction	555
B. New Zealand: an exclusive no-fault regime	555
C. The Nordic Patient Insurance Schemes	557
D. France: Compensation on the Basis of National Solidarity	558
E. Comparison and Evaluation	559
Conclusion	561
Publications	513