
INTRODUCTION TO THE CANADIAN LEGAL SYSTEM

SASHA BAGLAY
University of Ontario Institute of Technology

PEARSON

Toronto

Contents

Preface xvii

Acknowledgments xx

Part 1 Introduction to Law 1

1 What Is Law? 1

1. How Is Law Developed and Expressed? 2
Box 1.1 Examples of Various Definitions of Law 3
2. What Are the Functions of the Law? 4
 - 2.1 Order and Regulation 4
 - 2.2 Justice 5
 - 2.3 Social Change 6
3. What Values Does Law Reflect and What Values Should It Reflect? 7
Box 1.2 Law and Its Underlying Values: Examples 8
4. What Are the Characteristics of Legal Rules? 8
5. Why Do People Obey Legal Rules? 9
6. The Rule of Law 10
Box 1.3 Case Study Illustration: *Henco Industries v Haudenosaunee Six Nations* (2006), 82 OR (3d) 721 11
7. Types of Law 13
 - 7.1 Domestic versus International Law 13
 - 7.2 By Subject Matter 14
 - 7.3 Public versus Private Law 14
 - 7.4 Substantive versus Procedural Law 14

Summary 15

Critical Thinking Questions 15

Further Readings and Useful Resources 15

Endnotes 15

2 Systems and Sources of Law 17

Part I. Overview of Selected Systems of Law 18

1. Chthonic Legal Tradition 19
2. Religious-Based Systems of Law 19
3. Socialist Systems 20
4. Common Law System 21

- 5. Civil Law System 22
 - 5.1 Common Law and Civil Law Compared 23
- 6. Mixed Systems 24

Part II. System of Law in Canada 24

- 1. Reception of European Civil and Common Law in Canada 25
- 2. First Nations Legal Traditions 25

Part III. Sources of Law in Canada 27

- 1. Legislation 27
 - 1.1 Statutes 28
 - 1.2 Subordinate Legislation 28
 - 1.3 Finding and Citing Statutes and Subordinate Legislation 28
- 2. Case Law 30
 - 2.1 Ratio Decidendi and Obiter Dicta 30
 - 2.2 Binding and Persuasive Precedents 30
 - Box 2.1 Impact of a Binding Precedent: *Childs v Desormeaux*, [2006] 1 SCR 643 31
 - 2.3 Researching, Understanding, and Applying Judicial Decisions: *R v Hamilton*, [2004] OJ No 3252 32
- 3. Interrelationship Between Case Law and Legislation 36
 - Box 2.2 Finding an Answer to a Specific Legal Issue 37

Summary 38

Critical Thinking Questions 38

Further Readings and Resources 39

Endnotes 39

3 Structure of Canadian Government 42

Part I. Systems of Government 44

- 1. Democracies versus Authoritarian and Totalitarian Regimes 44
- 2. Republics versus Monarchies 45
- 3. Parliamentary, Presidential, and Mixed Systems 45
- 4. Unitary versus Federal States 46

Part II. Structure of Canadian Government 46

- 1. Branches of Government 46
 - 1.1 Legislative Branch 47
 - 1.1.1 Statutory Enactment Process 48
 - 1.2 Executive Branch 51
 - Box 3.1 Practical Application: *Safe Streets and Communities Act*, SC 2012, c 1 (Bill C-10) 52
 - Box 3.2 Minority versus Majority Government: Refugee Reform Legislation 53
 - 1.3 Judicial Branch 54

2. **Interaction Between Branches of Government** 54
 - 2.1 Impact on the Formation of the Law 54

Box 3.3 Regulation of Tobacco Advertising: Judicial–Legislative Dialogue?
(*RJR-MacDonald Inc v Canada (Attorney General)*, [1995] 3 SCR 199 and *Canada (Attorney General) v JTI-Macdonald Corp*, [2007] 2 SCR 610) 55
 - 2.2 Government Accountability 56
3. **Federalism: The Interaction Between Levels of Government** 58

Box 3.4 Provinces as Challengers of Federal Laws: Firearms Registration 59
4. **External Pressures: Interest Groups** 60

Box 3.5 Example of an Interest Group: Women's Legal Education and Action Fund (LEAF) 60

 - 4.1 Lobbying 61
 - 4.2 Litigation 62

Part III. Aboriginal Self-Government 62

1. **Brief Historic Overview** 62
2. **Inherent Right of Aboriginal Peoples to Self-Government and Its Implementation** 64

Summary 67

Critical Thinking Questions 67

Further Readings and Useful Resources 68

Endnotes 68

4 Canada's Courts 72

Part I. Substantive Issues 74

1. **Power to Establish Courts and Appoint Judges** 74
2. **Functions of Courts** 74
 - 2.1 Resolving Disputes 75
 - 2.2 Interpreting Legislation 75

Box 4.1 Practical Application: What Does "at the time of application" Mean? 75
 - 2.3 Overseeing Administrative Decision Making 76
 - 2.4 Reviewing Constitutionality of Government Actions and/or Legislation 76

Box 4.2 Example of a Reference Case: *Reference re Senate Reform*, 2014 SCC 32 77
3. **Jurisdiction of Courts** 77
4. **Participants in Litigation** 78
5. **Structure of Canadian Courts** 79
 - 5.1 Provincial Court System: Ontario 80
 - 5.1.1 Ontario Court of Justice 80
 - 5.1.2 Superior Court of Justice 81
 - 5.1.3 Court of Appeal for Ontario 82
 - 5.1.4 Specialized Courts 82
 - 5.2 Federal Courts 83
 - 5.2.1 The Supreme Court of Canada 83

6. Key Features of the Court System	85
6.1 Open Court	85
6.2 Formality and Decorum	85
6.3 Adversarial System	86
7. Judicial Appointments	86
7.1 Appointments to Lowest Provincial Courts	87
7.2 Appointments to Provincial Superior Courts and Federally Created Courts	87
7.3 Appointments to the Supreme Court of Canada	88
7.4 Judicial Ethics	88
7.5 Judicial Misconduct	89
8. Administrative Tribunals	90
Part II. Critical Perspectives	90
1. Access to Justice	91
2. Adversarial System, Vulnerable Witnesses, and Discovery of the Truth	92
2.1 Does the Adversarial Process Facilitate Discovery of the Truth?	92
2.2 Is the Adversarial Process Well Equipped to Deal Sensitive with Vulnerable Witnesses?	93
Summary	95
Critical Thinking Questions	96
Further Readings and Useful Resources	96
Endnotes	96
5 Theoretical Perspectives	101
1. Natural Law	102
Box 5.1 Assisted Suicide: Can Natural Law Provide Us with a Guiding Value?	104
2. Positivism	105
Box 5.2 Natural Law versus Positivism: Hart–Fuller Debate	106
Box 5.3 Connecting Theory and Practice: Representative Democracy, Individual Liberty, and the Rule of Law	106
3. Legal Realism	107
Box 5.4 <i>Sauvé v Canada (Chief Electoral Officer)</i> , [2002] 3 SCR 519	108
4. Critical Perspectives	109
4.1 Critical Legal Studies	109
4.2 Critical Race Theory	110
4.3 Feminist Theory	111
Box 5.5 Critical Perspective: Diversity in Canadian Judiciary and Legislature	111
5. Legal Pluralism	116
Summary	118
Critical Thinking Questions	118
Further Readings and Useful Resources	119
Endnotes	119

6 The Constitution and the Charter of Rights and Freedoms 121

Part I. Substantive Law 123

- 1. What is a Constitution? 123**
- 2. Canada's Constitution: An Overview 123**
 - 2.1 Constitution Act, 1867 124
 - Box 6.1 Sections 91 and 92 of the *Constitution Act, 1867* 125
 - Box 6.2 Controversies Over Federal/Provincial Jurisdiction: *R v Morgentaler*, [1993] 3 SCR 463 127
 - 2.2 Constitution Act, 1982 128
- 3. Attempts for Further Constitutional Reform 129**
 - 3.1 Meech Lake Accord (1987) 129
 - 3.2 Charlottetown Accord (1992) 129
- 4. The Charter of Rights and Freedoms 130**
 - 4.1 Charter Rights 131
 - Box 6.3 Sections 1–15 of the *Charter of Rights and Freedoms* 131
 - 4.1.1 What is the Meaning and Scope of Each Right? 134
 - Box 6.4 Is a Fetus Considered a "Human Being" and Does it Have the Right to Life? 135
 - Box 6.5 *R v Tessling*, [2004] 3 SCR 432: Does Flying a Forward Looking Infrared (FLIR) Camera Over One's House Amount to Search and Violation of One's Privacy? 136
 - 4.1.2 Reconciling Competing Rights 137
 - Box 6.6 Reconciling Competing Rights: *R v NS*, [2012] SCJ No 72 137
 - 4.2 Limitations on *Charter* Rights 138
 - 4.2.1 Section 1 138
 - 4.2.2 Section 33 140
 - 4.3 Application of the *Charter* 140
 - 4.4 Remedies Under the *Charter* 141
 - Box 6.7 Practical Application: Exclusion of Evidence Under s. 24(2) 142
 - Box 6.8 Practical Application: *Sauvé v Canada (Chief Electoral Officer)*, [2002] 3 SCR 519 143
- 5. Impact of the Charter 145**
 - Box 6.9 Limited Nature of Judicial Review Prior to the *Charter*: *R v Quong-Wing* (1914), 49 SCR 440 145

Part II. Critical Perspectives 146

- 1. How Has the Charter Influenced Political Life in Canada? 146**
 - 1.1 Judicial Role in Policy Making 146
 - 1.2 Interaction Between Legislatures and Courts in the Context of *Charter* Challenges 147
- 2. Who Has Benefited from Charter Challenges the Most? 148**
- 3. Has the Charter Brought about Positive Changes Overall? 149**

Summary	150
Critical Thinking Questions	151
Further Readings and Resources	151
Endnotes	151

Part 2 Selected Areas of Law and Critical Perspectives 155

7 Administrative Law 155

Box 7.1 Administrative Agencies and Abuse of Power: *Roncarelli v Duplessis*, [1959] SCR 121 157

1. Administrative Agencies and Decision Making: An Overview 158

- 1.1 Administrative Agencies 158
- 1.2 Administrative Decision Making 163
 - 1.2.1 Powers of the Decision Maker 163
 - 1.2.2 Decision Making Procedure 163
- 1.3 Key Principles of Administrative Law 164

2. Fairness of Decision Making 164

- 2.1 The Right to be Heard 164
 - 2.1.1 The Nature of the Decision 165
 - 2.1.2 The Nature of the Statutory Scheme 166
 - 2.1.3 The Importance of the Decision to the Individual Affected 166
 - 2.1.4 Legitimate Expectations of the Parties 166
 - 2.1.5 Procedure Chosen by the Agency 166
- 2.2 The Right to Have a Decision Made by an Independent and Impartial Decision Maker 166

3. Administrative Tribunals and Fair Process 167

Box 7.2 Example of an Administrative Tribunal: The Immigration and Refugee Board 169

4. Oversight of Administrative Decision Making: Appeal and Judicial Review 171

- 4.1 Appeal 171
- 4.2 Judicial Review 172
 - 4.2.1 Scope of Judicial Review 172
 - 4.2.2 Standard of Review 172

Box 7.3 Choosing between the Two Standards of Review: *Canada (Citizenship and Immigration) v Khosa*, [2009] 1 SCR 339 174

5. Remedies 174

Box 7.4 Judicial Review of Administrative Decisions and Remedies: *Johnstone v Canada (Border Services)*, [2014] FCJ No 455 175

Summary	176
Critical Thinking Questions	177
Further Readings and Resources	177
Endnotes	177

8 Criminal Law 179

Box 8.1 Determining Principles of Criminal Liability:

The Case of Vince Li 180

Part I. Substantive Law 181

1. The Basics of Criminal Law 181

1.1 Jurisdiction Over Criminal Law and Sources of Criminal Law 181

1.2 Elements of an Offence 182

1.2.1 Actus Reus 182

1.2.2 Mens Rea 182

Box 8.2 Intent versus Motive: *R v Latimer*, [2001] 1 SCR 3 183

1.3 Safeguards to Ensure a Fair Criminal Process 184

2. Types of Offences 184

2.1 Summary Conviction, Indictable, and Hybrid Offences 184

2.2 True Crimes and Regulatory Offences 185

2.3 Incomplete Offences 185

3. Parties to an Offence 186

Box 8.3 Practical Application: Parties to an Offence 186

4. Defences 187

4.1 Self-Defence 187

4.2 Defence of Property 187

4.3 Not Criminally Responsible (NCR) 188

4.4 Automatism 188

4.5 Provocation 188

4.6 Duress 189

4.7 Necessity 189

4.8 Mistake of Fact 189

4.9 Consent 189

4.10 Intoxication 190

Box 8.4 The Defence of Intoxication: *R v Daviault*, [1994] 3 SCR 63 191

5. Sentencing 192

5.1 Sentencing Options 192

5.2 Objectives and Principles of Sentencing 193

Part II. Critical Perspectives 194

1. *Bedford v Canada*: Should Sex Work be Criminalized? 194

2. *R v Hamilton*: How Should the Disadvantaged Background of an Accused Factor into Sentencing? 196

Summary 197

Critical Thinking Questions 198

Further Readings and Resources 198

Endnotes 199

9 Contract Law 202

Part I. Substantive Law 204

- 1. Main Principles of Contract Law 204**
 - 1.1 Formation of a Contract 204
 - 1.2 Agreement 205
 - 1.3 Intention to Create a Legally Binding Relationship 205
 - 1.4 Consideration 206
 - Box 9.1 An Agreement to Obtain a *Get* (Jewish Divorce): *Bruker v Marcovitz*, [2007] SCJ No 54 206
 - 1.5 Terms of a Contract 207
 - 1.6 Legal Formalities 207
 - 1.7 A Contract Must Not be Illegal 207
 - 1.8 Consequences of Not Fulfilling Essential Elements of a Contract 208
- 2. Capacity to Enter into Contracts 208**
 - 2.1 Minors 208
 - 2.1.1 Contracts for Necessaries of Life 209
 - 2.1.2 Contracts for Nonnecessaries of Life 209
 - 2.2 Persons with Mental Disorders and Disabilities 209
 - 2.3 Intoxicated Individuals 210
- 3. Privity of Contract 210**
- 4. Circumstances Putting into Question Validity of a Contract 211**
 - 4.1 Mistakes 211
 - 4.2 Misrepresentation 212
 - 4.3 Coercing a Party into a Contract 213
 - 4.3.1 Duress 213
 - 4.3.2 Undue Influence 213
 - 4.4 Unconscionability 213
 - Box 9.2 Unconscionability: *Williams v Condon*, [2007] OJ No 1683 214
- 5. Discharge of a Contract 214**
 - 5.1 By Performance 215
 - 5.2 By Agreement 215
 - 5.3 By Frustration 215
 - 5.4 By Operation of the Law 215
 - 5.5 By Breach 216
- 6. Remedies 216**
 - 6.1 Damages 216
 - Box 9.3 Punitive Damages: *Whiten v Pilot Insurance Co*, [2002] 1 SCR 595 217
 - 6.2 Rescission 218
 - 6.3 Specific Performance 218
 - 6.4 Injunction 218
 - Box 9.4 Rescission and Damages: *Murch v Dan Leonard Auto Sales Ltd*, [2013] SJ No 523 218
 - 6.5 Rectification 219

Part II. Critical Perspectives 219

- 1. Classical Contract Law: Autonomy, Efficiency, and a Minimalist State 220**
- 2. Contemporary Contract Law: Balancing Individual Autonomy and Protection of Weaker Parties 221**

Summary 222

Critical Thinking Questions 223

Further Readings and Resources 224

Endnotes 224

10 Tort Law 226

Part I. Substantive Law 228

1. Functions of Tort Law 228

2. Types of Torts 229

2.1 Intentional Torts 229

2.1.1 Battery 229

Box 10.1 Battery: *Malette v Shulman et al*, 63 OR (2d) 243 (upheld on appeal: 72 OR (2d) 417 (ONCA)) 230

2.1.2 Assault 231

2.1.3 False Imprisonment 231

2.1.4 Trespass to Land 231

2.1.5 Wrongful Interference with Chattels 231

2.1.6 Defamation 231

2.1.7 Defences to Intentional Torts 231

2.2 Negligence 232

2.2.1 Duty of Care 232

2.2.2 How do We Know When a Duty of Care Exists? 233

Box 10.2 *Dobson (Litigation Guardian of) v Dobson*, [1999] 2 SCR 753:

Does a Mother Owe a Duty of Care to Her Fetus? 234

2.2.3 Breach of the Duty of Care and the Standard of a "Reasonable Person" 234

2.2.4 Causation and Proximity 235

Box 10.3 Causation: *Cottrelle v Gerrard*, [2003] OJ No 4194 235

Box 10.4 Proximity: *Palsgraf v Long Island Railway Co*, 162 NE 99 (1928) 236

2.2.5 Defences to Torts of Negligence 236

3. Special Categories of Liability 236

3.1 Strict Liability 237

3.2 Nuisance 237

3.3 Occupier's Liability 238

3.4 Crown Liability 238

Box 10.5 Policy versus Operational Decisions: *Just v British Columbia*, [1989] 2 SCR 1228 239

4. Contributory Fault or Negligence 239

5. Joint Tortfeasors 240

Box 10.6 Duty of Care, Voluntary Assumption of Risk, and Contributory Negligence: *Crocker v Sundance Northwest Resorts Ltd*, [1988] SCJ No 60 241

Box 10.7 Contributory Negligence and Damages: *Jacobsen v Nike Canada Ltd*, [1996] BCJ No 363 242

6. Remedies 242

6.1 Damages 242

6.1.1 How Do Courts Calculate the Amount of Damages to be Awarded? 243

Box 10.8 Defamation and Punitive Damages: *Reichmann v Berlin*, [2002] OJ No 2732 243

6.2 Other Remedies 244

Part II. Critical Perspectives 244

1. Theoretical Perspectives on Tort Law: An Overview 244

2. What Harm is Recognized as Compensable? 245

3. What is the Impact of Gender/Race/Class Factors on the Calculation of Future Loss of Income? 246

3.1 Reliance on Gendered and Race-Specific Income Tables 246

3.2 Presumptions about Women's Lifestyles 247

3.3 Reliance on Family Background as a Predictor of Future Education and Career Achievement 247

Summary 248

Critical Thinking Questions 249

Further Readings and Useful Resources 249

Endnotes 249

11 Family Law 252

Part I. Substantive Law 254

1. Jurisdiction Over Family Law 255

2. Formation of Marriage and Cohabitation 255

2.1 Marriage 257

2.2 Cohabitation 257

3. Rights and Obligations in Marriage and Cohabitation 258

4. Dissolution of Marriage 258

4.1 Divorce 258

4.2 Annulment 259

5. Issues Upon Breakdown of Marriage or Cohabitation 260

6. Interrelationship of Family and Contract Law 260

Box 11.1 *Hartshorne v Hartshorne*, [2004] 1 SCR 550: Should a Marriage Contract Be Set Aside? 261

7. Support Payments 262

7.1 Spousal Support 262

Box 11.2 Practical Application: Andrew and Gina's Case 263

Box 11.3	<i>Gammon v Gammon</i> , [2008] OJ No 603: Should a Separation Agreement Be Set Aside?	264
7.2	Child Support	265
7.3	Enforcement of Support Payments	265
8.	Child Custody	266
9.	Division of Property	268
9.1	Married Couples	268
9.2	Unmarried Couples	268
10.	Family Violence	269
10.1	Public Law Remedies	270
10.2	Private Law Remedies: Torts	271
Part II. Critical Perspectives		272
1.	Choice, Autonomy, and Power Imbalance in Family Law	272
2.	Law and Social Change: Lesbian Families, Assisted Conception, and Donor's Right to Custody and Access	273
Summary		274
Critical Thinking Questions		275
Further Readings and Resources		275
Endnotes		275
12 Human Rights in Canada		278
Part I. International Human Rights		279
1.	International Human Rights Treaties	280
Box 12.1	Excerpts from the <i>Universal Declaration of Human Rights</i>	280
1.1	The <i>International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights</i> (ICCPR)	283
1.2	The <i>International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights</i> (ICESCR)	283
1.3	<i>Convention Against Torture</i> (CAT)	284
2.	International Treaty Bodies	284
3.	Canada and the International Human Rights System	287
3.1	Canada's Sixth Periodic Report to the Committee Against Torture	287
3.2	An Individual Complaint Against Canada to the Committee Against Torture	289
4.	Do International Human Rights Make a Difference?	290
4.1	What is Canada's International Human Rights Record?	291
Part II. Canadian Human Rights Act and Provincial Human Rights Codes		292
1.	Situation Prior to the Implementation of the Canadian Human Rights Act and Provincial Codes	293
2.	Key Elements of Human Rights Systems	293
2.1	Types of Discriminatory Treatment and Prohibited Grounds of Discrimination	293
2.2	Duty to Accommodate	294

Box 12.2 How Human Rights Complaints Can Make a Difference: <i>Lepofsky v Toronto Transit Commission</i> (2005 and 2007)	294
Box 12.3 The Duty to Accommodate: Case Examples	295
2.3 Human Rights Commissions and/or Tribunals	296
3. Ontario Human Rights Code and System	296
Box 12.4 Remedies: <i>Qureshi v G4S Security Services (Canada) Ltd.</i> , [2009]	
OHRTD No 428	298

Summary	299
Critical Thinking Questions	299
Further Readings and Resources	300
Endnotes	300

Chapters in Pearson Custom Library (online)

Alternative Dispute Resolution and Restorative Justice Initiatives

Part I. Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR)

1. **An Overview of ADR**
 - 1.1 Advantages of ADR

Box CW1.1 Limitations of Litigation: *Suzuki v Munroe*, [2009]
BCJ No 2019
 - 1.2 Routes to ADR
 - 1.3 Understanding Conflict
 - 1.3.1 Typology of Conflicts
 - 1.3.2 Typology of Responses to Conflict
2. **ADR Mechanisms**
 - 2.1 Negotiation
 - 2.2 Mediation
 - 2.3 Arbitration
 - 2.4 Comparison of Negotiation, Mediation, Arbitration, and Court Adjudication
3. **Factors of Power and Culture in ADR**
 - 3.1 Power Dynamics
 - 3.2 Culture

Box CW1.2 Example of ADR: Resolution of Aboriginal Land Claims
4. **ADR and Court Processes**

Part II. Restorative Justice

1. **The Concept of Restorative Justice**
2. **Restorative Justice Initiatives in the Criminal Justice System**
 - 2.1 Victim–Offender Mediation
 - 2.2 Group Conferencing
 - 2.3 Sentencing Circles

Summary
Critical Thinking Questions
Further Readings and Resources
Endnotes

International Law

Part I. Basics of International Law

- 1. Main Characteristics of Public International Law**
 - 1.1 The Difference Between Domestic and International Law
 - 1.2 Governing Principles of Public International Law
- 2. Sources of Public International Law**
 - 2.1 Customary International Law
 - 2.2 Treaties
 - 2.3 Interrelationship Between Treaties and Customary International Law
- 3. Interrelationship Between Public International Law and Domestic Law**

Part II. International System

- 1. Key Principles of Interstate Relations**
 - 1.1 Recognition
 - 1.2 Reciprocal versus Community Rights and Obligations
 - 1.3 Jurisdiction
 - 1.4 State and Diplomatic Immunity
 - 1.4.1 State Immunity
 - 1.4.2 Diplomatic Immunity
 - Box CW2.1 Suing a State for the Infliction of Torture: *Kazemi Estate v Islamic Republic of Iran*, 2014 SCC 62
 - 1.5 State Responsibility
 - Box CW2.2 Attributability: *US v Iran*, [1980] ICJ Rep 3
- 2. The United Nations**

Part III. Selected Areas of Public International Law

- 1. Responsibility To Protect**
- 2. Prohibition on the Use of Force or Threat of Use of Force**
 - 2.1 Self-Defence
 - 2.2 Use of Force Under Security Council Authorization
- 3. International Criminal law**
 - 3.1 International Crimes
 - 3.2 International Criminal Tribunals and the International Criminal Court

Summary
Critical Thinking Questions
Further Readings and Resources
Endnotes

Glossary 304
Index 308