

ASPEN CASEBOOK SERIES

CIVIL PROCEDURE

Ninth Edition

STEPHEN C. YEAZELL

David G. Price & Dallas P. Price Professor of Law Emeritus
University of California, Los Angeles

JOANNA C. SCHWARTZ

University of California, Los Angeles



Wolters Kluwer

Contents

Preface xxv

Acknowledgments xxvii

Chapter 1: An Overview of Procedure 1

A. The Idea and the Practice of Procedure 1

1. Locating Procedure 1
2. Clients, Lawyers, Procedure, and Strategy 2

B. Where Can the Suit Be Brought? 5

1. Personal Jurisdiction 6
2. Subject Matter Jurisdiction 7
 - Hawkins v. Masters Farms, Inc.* 7
 - Notes and Problems 11
3. Service of Process 13

C. Stating the Case 14

1. The Lawyer's Responsibility 14
 - Bridges v. Diesel Service, Inc.* 14
 - Notes and Problems 16
 - Note: Reading the Rules 17
2. The Complaint 19
 - Bell v. Novick Transfer Co.* 20
 - Notes and Problems 20
3. The Response—Motions and Answer 22
 - a. Pre-Answer Motions 23
 - Notes and Problems 24
 - b. The Answer 25
 - Notes and Problems 27
4. Amendment of Pleadings 28

D. Parties to the Lawsuit 28

- Fisher v. Ciba Specialty Chemicals Corp.* 29
- Notes and Problems 31

E. Factual Development—Discovery	32
<i>Butler v. Rigsby</i>	34
Notes and Problems	37
F. Pretrial Disposition—Summary Judgment	38
<i>Houchens v. American Home Assurance Co.</i>	39
Notes and Problems	42
G. Trial	44
<i>Norton v. Snapper Power Equipment</i>	45
Notes and Problems	47
H. Former Adjudication	49
<i>Ison v. Thomas</i>	49
Notes and Problems	51
I. Appeals	52
<i>Reise v. Board of Regents of the University of Wisconsin</i>	53
Notes and Problems	54
Note on Appellate Structure and Jurisdiction	56
Note: Civil Procedure in Your Substantive Courses	58
Assessment Questions—And a Word About Using These Questions	59
Analysis of Assessment Questions	61

PART I: THE CONSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK FOR U.S. LITIGATION

A. Approaching Civil Procedure	63
B. Constitutional Limits in Litigation	64
1. The Idea of Jurisdiction	64
2. Jurisdiction and the Constitution	65
3. The Constitution and Choice of Law	67

Chapter 2: Personal Jurisdiction 69

A. The Origins	69
<i>Pennoyer v. Neff</i>	70
Notes and Problems	76
B. The Modern Constitutional Formulation of Power	80
1. Redefining Constitutional Power	80
<i>International Shoe Co. v. Washington</i>	81
Notes and Problems	86

<i>McGee v. International Life Insurance Co.</i>	89
<i>Hanson v. Denckla</i>	89
Notes and Problems	90
2. Absorbing <i>In Rem</i> Jurisdiction	91
<i>Shaffer v. Heitner</i>	93
Notes and Problems	100
3. Specific Jurisdiction: The Modern Cases	103
<i>World-Wide Volkswagen Corp. v. Woodson</i>	103
Notes and Problems	110
<i>J. McIntyre Machinery, Ltd. v. Nicastro</i>	114
Notes and Problems	124
<i>Abdouch v. Lopez</i>	125
Notes and Problems	131
4. General Jurisdiction	132
<i>Goodyear Dunlop Tires Operations, S.A. v. Brown</i>	133
Notes and Problems	136
<i>Daimler AG v. Bauman</i>	137
Notes and Problems	143
<i>Burnham v. Superior Court</i>	143
Notes and Problems	150
Note on the Mechanics of Jurisdiction: Challenge and Waiver	151
Notes and Problems	153
C. Consent as a Substitute for Power	154
<i>Carnival Cruise Lines, Inc. v. Shute</i>	155
Notes and Problems	158
D. The Constitutional Requirement of Notice	160
<i>Mullane v. Central Hanover Bank & Trust Co.</i>	161
Notes and Problems	168
Notes and Problems on Service of Process	171
E. Self-Imposed Restraints on Jurisdictional Power: Long-Arm Statutes, Venue, and Discretionary Refusal of Jurisdiction	175
1. Long-Arm Statutes as a Restraint on Jurisdiction	176
<i>Gibbons v. Brown</i>	176
Notes and Problems	178
2. Venue as a Further Localizing Principle	180
Notes and Problems	181
<i>Thompson v. Greyhound Lines, Inc.</i>	182
Notes and Problems	185
3. Declining Jurisdiction: Transfer and Forum Non Conveniens	186
<i>Piper Aircraft v. Reyno</i>	187
Notes and Problems	192
<i>Atlantic Marine Construction Co. v. United States District Court</i>	195

Notes and Problems	198
Assessment Questions	199
Analysis of Assessment Questions	202

Chapter 3: Subject Matter Jurisdiction of the Federal Courts 205

A. The Idea and the Structure of Subject Matter Jurisdiction	205
B. Federal Question Jurisdiction	209
<i>Louisville & Nashville Railroad v. Mottley</i>	210
Notes and Problems	213
C. Diversity Jurisdiction	220
<i>Redner v. Sanders</i>	221
Notes and Problems	222
<i>Hertz Corp. v. Friend</i>	227
Notes and Problems	229
Note: Amount in Controversy	231
D. Supplemental Jurisdiction	234
Notes and Problems	235
<i>In re Ameriquest Mortgage Co. Mortgage Lending Practices Litigation</i>	237
<i>Szendrey-Ramos v. First Bancorp</i>	239
Notes and Problems	241
E. Removal	242
Notes and Problems	243
<i>Caterpillar, Inc. v. Lewis</i>	246
Notes and Problems	249
Assessment Questions	251
Analysis of Assessment Questions	253

Chapter 4: State Law in Federal Courts: *Erie* and Its Entailments 255

A. State Courts as Lawmakers in a Federal System	256
1. The Issue in Historical Context	256
2. Constitutionalizing the Issue	258
<i>Erie Railroad v. Tompkins</i>	259
Notes and Problems	263
B. The Limits of State Power in Federal Courts	267
1. Interpreting the Constitutional Command of <i>Erie</i>	268
<i>Guaranty Trust Co. v. York</i>	268

- Notes and Problems 269
- Byrd v. Blue Ridge Rural Electric Cooperative* 272
- Notes and Problems 274
- 2. De-constitutionalizing *Erie* 274
 - Hanna v. Plumer* 275
 - Notes and Problems 279
- 3. Determining the Scope of Federal Law: Avoiding and Accommodating *Erie* 282
 - Semtek Intl. Inc. v. Lockheed Martin Corp.* 283
 - Notes and Problems 288
 - Note: Interpreting State Law: An Entailment of *Erie* 289
 - Assessment Questions 292
 - Analysis of Assessment Questions 292

PART II: THE PROCESS OF LITIGATION

- A. Approaching Civil Procedure 295
- B. Choosing Procedure 296
- C. A Roadmap for Exploring Choices 297

Chapter 5: Incentives to Litigate 299

- A. Litigation in the United States at the Start of the Twenty-First Century 299
 - Notes and Problems 303
- B. Reasons to Litigate: Dollars, Orders, and Declarations 305
 - 1. Damages 306
 - Troupe v. C & S Wholesale Grocers, Inc.* 306
 - Notes and Problems 309
 - a. Damage Amounts: Ceilings and Floors 310
 - b. Categorizing Damages 311
 - Notes and Problems 312
 - 2. Specific Relief 314
 - Lucy Webb Hayes Natl. Training School v. Geoghegan* 315
 - Notes and Problems 317
 - 3. Declaratory Relief 317
 - Notes and Problems 320
 - 4. Temporary Remedies 321
 - a. Preliminary Injunctions and Temporary Restraining Orders: The Basic Problem 322

<i>Winter v. Natural Resources Defense Council, Inc.</i>	322
Notes and Problems	327
b. Provisional Remedies and Due Process	330
<i>Fuentes v. Shevin</i>	331
Notes and Problems	335
C. Financing Litigation	338
1. The “American” and “English” Rules About Attorneys’ Fees	340
Notes and Problems	342
2. Insurance, the Contingent Fee, and Alternative Litigation Finance	342
a. Insurance	343
Notes and Problems	343
b. The Contingent Fee	345
Notes and Problems	348
c. Alternative Litigation Finance	349
Notes and Problems	351
3. Public Subsidies and Professional Charity	353
Notes and Problems	355
4. From Fee Spreading to Fee Shifting	356
a. The Common Fund	356
Notes and Problems	356
b. By Contract	357
c. By Common Law	357
d. By Statute	358
Notes and Problems	358
Problem: How to Lose by Winning	359
Notes and Problems	360
<i>Buckhannon Board and Care Home, Inc. v. West Virginia Department of Health and Human Resources</i>	361
Notes and Problems	363
Assessment Questions	364
Analysis of Assessment Questions	365

Chapter 6: Pleading 367

A. The Story of Pleading	367
1. Of Stories and Jurisdiction	368
Notes and Problems	368
2. Plaintiff’s Story, Defendant’s Story	371
3. One Function of Pleading: Establishing the Law	372
Notes and Problems	374
<i>Haddle v. Garrison</i> (S.D. Ga. 1996)	377
Notes and Problems	378
<i>Haddle v. Garrison</i> (11th Cir. 1997)	380
Notes and Problems	380

<i>Haddle v. Garrison</i> (525 U.S. 121 (1998))	381
Notes and Problems	384
4. Another Function of Pleading: Sorting Strong Cases from Weak Cases?	386
a. The “Ordinary” Case: How Much Detail in a Complaint?	387
Notes and Problems	388
<i>Ashcroft v. Iqbal</i>	391
Notes and Problems	401
b. Special Cases: Requiring and Forbidding Specificity in Pleading	403
<i>Stradford v. Zurich Insurance Co.</i>	403
Notes and Problems	406
5. Allocating the Elements of a Claim	409
<i>Jones v. Bock</i>	410
Notes and Problems	412
B. Ethical Limitations in Pleading—and in Litigation Generally	416
Notes and Problems	417
<i>Walker v. Norwest Corp.</i>	419
Notes and Problems	421
<i>Christian v. Mattel, Inc.</i>	423
Notes and Problems	427
C. Responding to the Complaint	429
1. Default	429
2. The Pre-Answer Motion (and a Close Post-Answer Relative)	429
Notes and Problems	430
Notes and Problems	431
Notes and Problems	434
3. Answer	434
a. Denials	435
<i>Zielinski v. Philadelphia Piers, Inc.</i>	435
Notes and Problems	439
b. Affirmative Defenses	441
Notes and Problems	441
4. Reply	443
Notes and Problems	444
5. Amendments	445
Notes and Problems	445
a. The Basic Problem: Prejudice	446
<i>Beeck v. Aquaslide ‘N’ Dive Corp.</i>	446
Notes and Problems	450
b. Statutes of Limitations and Relation Back	452
<i>Moore v. Baker</i>	453
<i>Bonerb v. Richard J. Caron Foundation</i>	454
Notes and Problems	456

Assessment Questions	458
Analysis of Assessment Questions	460

Chapter 7: Discovery 463

A. Modern Discovery 463

B. The Stages of Discovery 464

1. Required Disclosures—First Round 467
Notes and Problems 467
2. Documents, Things, Land, and Bytes: Requests for Production (Rules 34 and 45) 468
Notes and Problems 470
3. Asking Questions in Writing, Seeking Admissions: Interrogatories and Admissions (Rules 33 and 36) 471
Notes and Problems 472
4. Asking Questions in Person: Depositions (Rule 30) and Physical and Mental Evaluations (Rule 35) 473
Note on Physical and Mental Examinations 475
Notes and Problems 476
5. Pretrial Witness Lists and the Pretrial Order 480
David and Goliath Do Discovery: A Taxonomy of Problems 480

C. The Scope of Discovery 481

1. Relevance 482
Favale v. Roman Catholic Diocese of Bridgeport 483
Notes and Problems 485
2. Proportionality and Privacy 487
Price v. Leflore County Detention Center 487
Rengifo v. Erevos Enterprises, Inc. 488
Notes and Problems 491
3. Privilege 493
Notes and Problems 494
4. Trial Preparation Material 495
Hickman v. Taylor 496
Notes and Problems 500

D. Experts 502

- Notes and Problems 504
Thompson v. The Haskell Co. 505
Chiquita International Ltd. v. M/V Bolero Reefer 506
 Notes and Problems 508

E. Ensuring Compliance and Controlling Abuse of Discovery 508

1. Types of Discovery Disputes 509
Zubulake v. UBS Warburg LLP 509
Notes and Problems 514

- 2. Ensuring Compliance 516
 - Notes and Problems 516
- 3. Remedies: Management and Sanctions 518
 - Security National Bank of Sioux City v. Abbott Laboratories* 519
 - Notes and Problems 521
 - Assessment Questions 523
 - Analysis of Assessment Questions 525

Chapter 8: Resolution Without Trial 527

- A. The Pressure to Choose Adjudication or an Alternative 528
 - 1. Default and Default Judgments 528
 - Peralta v. Heights Medical Center* 528
 - Notes and Problems 530
 - 2. Scheduling Orders and Failure to Prosecute: Involuntary Dismissal 533
 - 3. Voluntary Dismissal 534
 - Notes and Problems 535
- B. Avoiding Adjudication 536
 - 1. Negotiation and Settlement: Why Settle? And How? 536
 - Jane Smart v. GrowCo, Inc.* 538
 - a. Contracting to Dismiss 539
 - Notes and Problems 539
 - b. Third-Party Participation in Settlement: Facilitation, Encouragement, and Coercion 544
 - Notes and Problems 545
 - c. Contracting for Confidentiality 547
 - Notes and Problems 547
 - Kalinauskas v. Wong* 550
 - Notes and Problems 552
 - 2. Contracting for Private Adjudication: Arbitration and Its Variants 553
 - Ferguson v. Countrywide Credit Industries, Inc.* 557
 - Notes and Problems 561
 - AT&T Mobility LLC v. Concepcion* 563
 - Notes and Problems 572
 - Ferguson v. Writers Guild of America, West* 574
 - Notes and Problems 578
- C. Adjudication Without Trial: Summary Judgment 578
 - Notes and Problems 579
 - 1. Summary Judgment in Action: The Burdens on the Moving and Nonmoving Parties 582
 - Celotex Corp. v. Catrett* 583
 - Notes and Problems 586

- 2. Summary Judgment in Action: How Courts Should Assess the Evidence 588
 - Tolan v. Cotton* 589
 - Notes and Problems 593
 - Bias v. Advantage International, Inc.* 593
 - Notes and Problems 596
 - Assessment Questions 598
 - Analysis of Assessment Questions 600

Chapter 9: The Trier and the Trial 603

- A. Choosing and Challenging Judges 604
 - Notes and Problems 606
 - Caperton v. A.T. Massey Coal Co.* 607
 - Notes and Problems 614
- B. Sharing Power with a Jury 615
 - 1. When May a Jury Decide? 616
 - Notes and Problems 620
 - 2. Choosing Jurors 622
 - 3. Challenging Jurors 624
 - Notes and Problems 627
- C. What Will Trial Be About? The Final Pretrial Conference and Order 629
 - Monfore v. Phillips* 630
 - Notes and Problems 632
- D. Judges Guiding Juries 633
 - 1. Instruction and Comment 633
 - 2. Excluding Improper Influences 634
 - 3. Size and Decision Rules 635
- E. Judges Controlling Juries: The Directed Verdict 636
 - Reid v. San Pedro, Los Angeles & Salt Lake Railroad* 638
 - Notes and Problems 639
 - Pennsylvania Railroad v. Chamberlain* 643
 - Notes and Problems 647
- F. Judges Undoing Verdicts: The New Trial 651
 - 1. The Justifications for New Trials 652
 - a. Flawed Procedures 652
 - b. Flawed Verdicts 652
 - Lind v. Schenley Industries* 653
 - Notes and Problems 656

- 2. Conditional New Trials 657
 - a. New Trial Limited to Damages 658
 - b. Remittitur and Additur 658

G. The Limits of Judicial Power: The Reexamination Clause and the Jury as a Black Box 659

- Peterson v. Wilson* 660
- Notes and Problems 663
- Assessment Questions 666
- Analysis of Assessment Questions 667

Chapter 10: Appeal 669

A. Who Can Appeal? 670

- 1. A Losing Party: Adversity 671
 - Notes and Problems 671
 - Aetna Casualty & Surety Co. v. Cunningham* 672
 - Notes and Problems 673
- 2. Who Raised the Issue Below: Of Waivers and Sandbags 674
 - Notes and Problems 675
- 3. Who Was Not Deterred from Appealing 678

B. When a Decision May Be Reviewed: “Finality” 680

- 1. The Final Judgment Rule 681
 - a. Appellate Jurisdiction and the Final Judgment Rule 681
 - Liberty Mutual Insurance Co. v. Wetzel* 682
 - Notes and Problems 686
 - b. Defining the Moment of Judgment 688
 - Notes and Problems 689
- 2. Exceptions to the Final Judgment Rule 690
 - a. Practical Finality 691
 - Lauro Lines s.r.l. v. Chasser* 691
 - Notes and Problems 695
 - b. Injunctions 697
 - Notes and Problems 698
 - c. Interlocutory Appeals 698
 - d. Mandamus 699
 - Notes and Problems 700

C. Scope of Review 701

- 1. Law and Fact 701
 - Anderson v. Bessemer City* 701
 - Notes and Problems 705
- 2. Harmless Error 707
 - Harnden v. Jayco, Inc.* 707
 - Notes and Problems 710

Assessment Questions	711
Analysis of Assessment Questions	712

Chapter 11: Respect for Judgments 715

A. Claim Preclusion 716

1. Precluding the “Same” Claim 716
 - a. Efficiency 716
Frier v. City of Vandalia 717
Notes and Problems 722
 - b. Consistency—The Logical Implications of the Former Judgment 725
Notes and Problems 727
2. Between the “Same” Parties 727
Taylor v. Sturgell 728
Notes and Problems 734
3. After a Final Judgment 737
4. After a Judgment “on the Merits” 738
Notes and Problems 738
Gargallo v. Merrill Lynch, Pierce, Fenner & Smith 741
Notes and Problems 743

B. Issue Preclusion 744

1. The Same Issue 745
Notes and Problems 746
2. An Issue “Actually Litigated and Determined” 746
Illinois Central Gulf Railroad v. Parks 747
Notes and Problems 748
3. An Issue “Essential to the Judgment” 750
Notes and Problems 751
4. Between Which Parties? 753
Parklane Hosiery Co. v. Shore 754
Notes and Problems 759

C. The Boundaries of Preclusion 765

1. Claim Preclusion 765
2. Issue Preclusion 766

D. Repose: Collateral Attack and Reopened Judgments 767

1. Full Faith and Credit as a Bar to Collateral Attack 767
Durfee v. Duke 768
Notes and Problems 772
2. The Reopened Judgment as an Alternative to Collateral Attack 775
United States v. Beggerly 775

Notes and Problems	778
Assessment Questions	779
Analysis of Assessment Questions	781

PART III: PROBING THE BOUNDARIES: ADDITIONAL CLAIMS AND PARTIES

Chapter 12: Joinder 785

A. Joinder of Claims 785

1. Joinder of Claims by Plaintiff 786
 - a. Historical Background 786
 - b. The Federal Rules 786
 - c. Joinder and Jurisdiction 787Notes and Problems 788
2. Claims by the Defendant: Counterclaims 790
Plant v. Blazer Financial Services 790
Notes and Problems 794

B. Joinder of Parties 798

1. By Plaintiffs 798
Mosley v. General Motors Corp. 798
Notes and Problems 802
2. By Defendants: Third-Party Claims 805
Price v. CTB, Inc. 805
Notes and Problems 807
3. Compulsory Joinder 812
Temple v. Synthes Corp. 813
Notes and Problems 815
Helzberg's Diamond Shops v. Valley West Des Moines Shopping Center 817
Notes and Problems 820

C. Intervention 823

- Natural Resources Defense Council v. United States Nuclear Regulatory Commission* 824
Notes and Problems 828
Martin v. Wilks 830
Notes and Problems 834

D. Interpleader 836

- Southern Farm Bureau Life Ins. Co. v. Davis* 838
Notes and Problems 839

E. Class Actions 840

1. Introduction 840
2. The Class Action and the Constitution 841
 - a. Representative Adequacy 841
 - Hansberry v. Lee* 842
 - Notes and Problems 847
 - b. Personal Jurisdiction 848
 - Phillips Petroleum v. Shutts* 848
 - Notes and Problems 853
3. The Class Action and Federalism 853
 - Standard Fire Ins. Co. v. Knowles* 855
 - Notes and Problems 859
- 4 Statutory Requirements 861
 - Notes and Problems 865
 - Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. v. Dukes* 866
 - Notes and Problems 876
5. Settlement of Class Actions and the “Settlement Class” 878
 - Notes and Problems 880
 - a. Fees 881
 - Notes and Problems 882
 - b. Damages and Injunctive Relief 883
 - c. Settlement and Dismissal 883
 - Amchem Products, Inc. v. Windsor* 884
 - Notes and Problems 891
 - Assessment Questions 894
 - Analysis of Assessment Questions 897

Table of Cases 899

Table of Citations to the Judicial Code (28 U.S.C.) 905

Table of Citations to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 907

Table of Authorities 909

Index 911