

ASPEN CASEBOOK SERIES

CIVIL PROCEDURE

Tenth Edition

STEPHEN C. YEAZELL

David G. Price & Dallas P. Price Distinguished Professor of Law Emeritus
University of California, Los Angeles

JOANNA C. SCHWARTZ

Vice Dean for Faculty Development and Professor of Law
University of California, Los Angeles



Wolters Kluwer

Contents

Preface xxv

Acknowledgments xxvii

Chapter 1: An Overview of Procedure 1

A. The Idea and the Practice of Procedure 1

1. Locating Procedure 1
2. Clients, Lawyers, Procedure, and Strategy 2

B. Where Can the Suit Be Brought? 5

1. Personal Jurisdiction 6
2. Subject Matter Jurisdiction 6
 - Hawkins v. Masters Farms, Inc.* 7
 - Notes and Problems 10
3. Service of Process 13

C. Stating the Case 13

1. The Lawyer's Responsibility 13
 - Bridges v. Diesel Service, Inc.* 14
 - Notes and Problems 15
 - Note: Reading the Rules—Process and Politics 16
2. The Complaint 18
 - Bell v. Novick Transfer Co.* 19
 - Notes and Problems 19
3. The Response—Motions and Answer 21
 - a. Pre-Answer Motions 22
 - Notes and Problems 23
 - b. The Answer 24
 - Notes and Problems 26
4. Amendment of Pleadings 27

D. Parties to the Lawsuit 27

- Fisher v. Ciba Specialty Chemicals Corp.* 28
- Notes and Problems 30

E. Factual Development—Discovery	31
<i>Gorson v. T.G.R. Logistics, Inc.</i>	33
Notes and Problems	36
F. Pretrial Disposition—Summary Judgment	37
<i>Houchens v. American Home Assurance Co.</i>	38
Notes and Problems	41
G. Trial	42
<i>Norton v. Snapper Power Equipment</i>	43
Notes and Problems	45
H. Former Adjudication	47
<i>Ison v. Thomas</i>	48
Notes and Problems	49
I. Appeals	50
<i>Reise v. Board of Regents of the University of Wisconsin</i>	51
Notes and Problems	52
Note on Appellate Structure and Jurisdiction	54
Note: Civil Procedure in Your Substantive Courses	55
Assessment Questions—And a Word About Using These Questions	56
Analysis of Assessment Questions	58

PART I: THE CONSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK FOR U.S. LITIGATION

A. Approaching Civil Procedure	61
B. Constitutional Limits in Litigation	62
1. The Idea of Jurisdiction	62
2. Jurisdiction and the Constitution	63
3. The Constitution and Choice of Law	65

Chapter 2: Personal Jurisdiction 67

A. The Origins	67
<i>Pennoyer v. Neff</i>	68
Notes and Problems	74
B. The Modern Constitutional Formulation of Power	77
1. Redefining Constitutional Power	78
<i>International Shoe Co. v. Washington</i>	79
Notes and Problems	84

	<i>McGee v. International Life Insurance Co.</i>	86
	<i>Hanson v. Denckla</i>	87
	Notes and Problems	88
2.	Absorbing <i>In Rem</i> Jurisdiction	88
	<i>Shaffer v. Heitner</i>	90
	Notes and Problems	97
3.	Specific Jurisdiction: The Modern Cases	99
	<i>World-Wide Volkswagen Corp. v. Woodson</i>	100
	Notes and Problems	106
	<i>J. McIntyre Machinery, Ltd. v. Nicaastro</i>	111
	Notes and Problems	120
	<i>Abdouch v. Lopez</i>	121
	Notes and Problems	127
4.	General Jurisdiction	128
	<i>Goodyear Dunlop Tires Operations, S.A. v. Brown</i>	129
	Notes and Problems	132
	<i>Daimler AG v. Bauman</i>	133
	Notes and Problems	139
	<i>Bristol-Meyers Squibb Co. v. Superior Court</i>	140
	Notes and Problems	146
	<i>Burnham v. Superior Court</i>	148
	Notes and Problems	154
	Note on the Mechanics of Jurisdiction: Challenge and Waiver	155
	Notes and Problems	156
C.	Consent as a Substitute for Power	158
	<i>Carnival Cruise Lines, Inc. v. Shute</i>	159
	Notes and Problems	162
D.	Notice	163
1.	The Constitutional Requirements	163
	<i>Mullane v. Central Hanover Bank & Trust Co.</i>	165
	Notes and Problems	170
2.	Beyond the Constitutional Requirements: The Mechanics of Notice and Service	172
E.	Self-Imposed Restraints on Jurisdictional Power: Long-Arm Statutes, Venue, and Discretionary Refusal of Jurisdiction	177
1.	Long-Arm Statutes as a Restraint on Jurisdiction	177
	<i>Gibbons v. Brown</i>	178
	Notes and Problems	180
2.	Venue as a Further Localizing Principle	181
	Notes and Problems	183
	<i>Thompson v. Greyhound Lines, Inc.</i>	184
	Notes and Problems	186
3.	Declining Jurisdiction: Transfer and Forum Non Conveniens	187
	<i>Piper Aircraft v. Reyno</i>	188

Notes and Problems	193
<i>Atlantic Marine Construction Co. v. United States District Court</i>	195
Notes and Problems	198
Assessment Questions	199
Analysis of Assessment Questions	202

Chapter 3: Subject Matter Jurisdiction of the Federal Courts 205

A. The Idea and the Structure of Subject Matter Jurisdiction	205
B. Federal Question Jurisdiction	209
<i>Louisville & Nashville Railroad v. Mottley</i>	210
Notes and Problems	212
C. Diversity Jurisdiction	218
<i>Redner v. Sanders</i>	220
Notes and Problems	221
<i>Hertz Corp. v. Friend</i>	225
Notes and Problems	228
Note: Amount in Controversy	229
D. Supplemental Jurisdiction	232
Notes and Problems	233
<i>In re Ameriquest Mortgage Co. Mortgage Lending Practices Litigation</i>	235
<i>Szendrey-Ramos v. First Bancorp</i>	237
Notes and Problems	239
E. Removal	241
Notes and Problems	241
<i>Caterpillar, Inc. v. Lewis</i>	244
Notes and Problems	247
Assessment Questions	249
Analysis of Assessment Questions	251

Chapter 4: State Law in Federal Courts: *Erie* and Its Entailments 255

A. State Courts as Lawmakers in a Federal System	256
1. The Issue in Historical Context	256
2. Constitutionalizing the Issue	258
<i>Erie Railroad v. Tompkins</i>	259
Notes and Problems	263

- B. The Limits of State Power in Federal Courts 267**
 - 1. Interpreting the Constitutional Command of *Erie* 268
 - Guaranty Trust Co. v. York* 268
 - Notes and Problems 269
 - Byrd v. Blue Ridge Rural Electric Cooperative* 272
 - Notes and Problems 274
 - 2. De-constitutionalizing *Erie* 274
 - Hanna v. Plumer* 275
 - Notes and Problems 279
 - 3. Determining the Scope of Federal Law: Avoiding and Accommodating *Erie* 282
 - Note: Interpreting State Law: An Entailment of *Erie* 283
 - Assessment Questions 285
 - Analysis of Assessment Questions 286

PART II: THE PROCESS OF LITIGATION

- A. Approaching Civil Procedure 289**
- B. Choosing Procedure 290**
- C. A Roadmap for Exploring Choices 291**

Chapter 5: Incentives to Litigate 293

- A. Litigation in the United States at the Start of the Twenty-First Century 293**
 - Notes and Problems 297
- B. Reasons to Litigate: Dollars, Orders, and Declarations 299**
 - 1. Damages 299
 - Troupe v. C & S Wholesale Grocers, Inc.* 300
 - Notes and Problems 303
 - a. Damage Amounts: Ceilings and Floors 303
 - b. Categorizing Damages 305
 - Notes and Problems 306
 - 2. Specific Relief 307
 - Lucy Webb Hayes Natl. Training School v. Geoghegan* 308
 - Notes and Problems 311
 - 3. Declaratory Relief 311
 - Notes and Problems 314
 - 4. Temporary Remedies 315
 - a. Preliminary Injunctions and Temporary Restraining Orders: The Basic Problem 316

<i>Winter v. Natural Resources Defense Council, Inc.</i>	316
Notes and Problems	321
b. Provisional Remedies and Due Process	324
<i>Fuentes v. Shevin</i>	324
Notes and Problems	329
C. Financing Litigation	332
1. The “American” and “English” Rules About Attorneys’ Fees	334
Notes and Problems	336
2. Insurance, the Contingent Fee, and Alternative Litigation Finance	336
a. Insurance	337
Notes and Problems	337
b. The Contingent Fee	339
Notes and Problems	342
c. Alternative Litigation Finance	343
Notes and Problems	345
3. Public Subsidies and Professional Charity	347
Notes and Problems	349
4. From Fee Spreading to Fee Shifting	349
a. The Common Fund	350
Notes and Problems	350
b. By Contract	351
c. By Common Law	351
d. By Statute	351
Notes and Problems	352
Problem: How to Lose by Winning	353
Notes and Problems	354
<i>Buckhannon Board and Care Home, Inc. v. West Virginia Department of Health and Human Resources</i>	355
Notes and Problems	357
Assessment Questions	358
Analysis of Assessment Questions	359

Chapter 6: Pleading 361

A. The Story of Pleading	361
1. Of Stories and Jurisdiction	362
Notes and Problems	362
2. Plaintiff’s Story, Defendant’s Story	365
3. One Function of Pleading: Establishing the Law	366
Notes and Problems	368
<i>Haddle v. Garrison</i> (S.D. Ga. 1996)	371
Notes and Problems	372
<i>Haddle v. Garrison</i> (11th Cir. 1997)	374
Notes and Problems	374

<i>Haddle v. Garrison</i> (525 U.S. 121 (1998))	375
Notes and Problems	378
4. Another Function of Pleading: Sorting Strong from Weak Cases?	380
a. The “Ordinary” Case: How Much Detail in a Complaint?	381
Notes and Problems	382
<i>Ashcroft v. Iqbal</i>	385
Notes and Problems	395
b. Special Cases: Requiring and Forbidding Specificity in Pleading	397
<i>Stradford v. Zurich Insurance Co.</i>	397
Notes and Problems	400
5. Allocating the Elements of a Claim	402
<i>Jones v. Bock</i>	403
Notes and Problems	406
B. Ethical Limitations in Pleading—and in Litigation Generally	409
Notes and Problems	410
<i>Walker v. Norwest Corp.</i>	412
Notes and Problems	414
<i>Christian v. Mattel, Inc.</i>	416
Notes and Problems	420
C. Responding to the Complaint	421
1. Default	422
2. The Pre-Answer Motion (and a Close Post-Answer Relative)	422
Notes and Problems	423
Notes and Problems	424
Notes and Problems	426
3. Answer	427
a. Denials	427
<i>Zielinski v. Philadelphia Piers, Inc.</i>	428
Notes and Problems	431
b. Affirmative Defenses	433
Notes and Problems	433
4. Reply	435
Notes and Problems	435
5. Amendments	437
Notes and Problems	437
a. The Basic Problem: Prejudice	438
<i>Beeck v. Aquaslide ‘N’ Dive Corp.</i>	438
Notes and Problems	442
b. Statutes of Limitations and Relation Back	444
<i>Moore v. Baker</i>	445
<i>Bonerb v. Richard J. Caron Foundation</i>	446
Notes and Problems	448
Assessment Questions	450
Analysis of Assessment Questions	452

Chapter 7: Discovery 455

A. Modern Discovery 455

1. Discovery Before Discovery: Obligations and Spoliation 456
Zubulake v. UBS Warburg LLP 456
 Notes and Problems 459
2. Getting the Story Straight: Crafting a Discovery Plan 461

B. The Tools of Discovery 462

1. Required Disclosures—First Round 465
 Notes and Problems 465
2. Documents, Things, Land, and Bytes: Requests for Production (Rules 34 and 45) 466
 Notes and Problems 468
3. Asking Questions in Writing, Seeking Admissions: Interrogatories and Admissions (Rules 33 and 36) 468
 Notes and Problems 470
4. Asking Questions in Person: Depositions (Rule 30) and Physical and Mental Evaluations (Rule 35) 471
 Notes and Problems 473
5. Pretrial Witness Lists and the Pretrial Order 477
David and Goliath Do Discovery: A Taxonomy of Problems 477

C. The Scope of Discovery 478

1. Relevance 479
Favale v. Roman Catholic Diocese of Bridgeport 480
 Notes and Problems 482
2. Proportionality, Burden, and Privacy 483
Cerrato v. Nutribullet, LLC 484
Wagoner v. Lewis Gale Medical Center, LLC 485
Rengifo v. Erevos Enterprises, Inc. 488
 Notes and Problems 491
3. Privilege 492
 Notes and Problems 493
4. Trial Preparation Material 495
Hickman v. Taylor 495
 Notes and Problems 499

D. Experts 501

- Notes and Problems 503
Thompson v. The Haskell Co. 504
Chiquita International Ltd. v. M/V Bolero Reefer 505
 Notes and Problems 506

E. Ensuring Compliance and Controlling Abuse of Discovery 507

1. Types of Discovery Disputes 508
2. Ensuring Compliance 508
 Notes and Problems 509

- 3. Remedies: Management and Sanctions 510
 - Mueller v. Swift* 511
 - Notes and Problems 515
 - Security National Bank of Sioux City v. Abbott Laboratories* 515
 - Notes and Problems 517
 - Assessment Questions 519
 - Analysis of Assessment Questions 521

Chapter 8: Resolution Without Trial 523

A. The Pressure to Choose Adjudication or an Alternative 524

- 1. Default and Default Judgments 524
 - Peralta v. Heights Medical Center* 525
 - Notes and Problems 526
- 2. Scheduling Orders and Failure to Prosecute: Involuntary Dismissal 529
- 3. Voluntary Dismissal 530
 - Notes and Problems 531

B. Avoiding Adjudication 532

- 1. Negotiation and Settlement: Why Settle? And How? 532
 - Jane Smart v. GrowCo, Inc.* 534
 - a. Contracting to Dismiss 535
 - Notes and Problems 535
 - b. Third-Party Participation in Settlement: Facilitation, Encouragement, and Coercion 540
 - Notes and Problems 541
 - c. Contracting for Confidentiality 543
 - Notes and Problems 543
 - Kalinauskas v. Wong* 546
 - Notes and Problems 548
- 2. Contracting for Private Adjudication: Arbitration and Its Variants 550
 - a. The Idea and Practice of Arbitration 550
 - b. Federalism and Arbitration: Herein of Preemption 552
 - Ferguson v. Countrywide Credit Industries, Inc.* 554
 - Notes and Problems 558
 - Epic Systems v. Lewis* 559
 - Notes and Problems 566

C. Adjudication Without Trial: Summary Judgment 569

- Notes and Problems 569
- 1. Summary Judgment in Action: The Burdens on the Moving and Nonmoving Parties 572
 - Celotex Corp. v. Catrett* 573
 - Notes and Problems 576
- 2. Summary Judgment in Action: How Courts Should Assess the Evidence 579
 - Tolan v. Cotton* 579

Notes and Problems	583
<i>Bias v. Advantage International, Inc.</i>	583
Notes and Problems	586
Assessment Questions	588
Analysis of Assessment Questions	590

Chapter 9: The Trier and the Trial 593

A. Choosing and Challenging Judges 594

Notes and Problems	596
<i>Caperton v. A.T. Massey Coal Co.</i>	597
Notes and Problems	604

B. Sharing Power with a Jury 606

1. When May a Jury Decide?	606
Notes and Problems	610
2. Choosing Jurors	612
3. Challenging Jurors	614
Notes and Problems	617

C. What Will Trial Be About? The Final Pretrial Conference and Order 619

<i>Monfore v. Phillips</i>	619
Notes and Problems	622

D. Judges Guiding Juries 623

1. Instruction and Comment	623
2. Excluding Improper Influences	624
3. Size and Decision Rules	625

E. Judges Controlling Juries: Judgment as a Matter of Law 626

Notes and Problems	627
1. Judgment as a Matter of Law in Action: How Courts Should Assess the Evidence	629
<i>Pennsylvania Railroad v. Chamberlain</i>	629
Notes and Problems	633
2. Judgment as Matter of Law in Action: Judgments and Renewed Judgments	636
Notes and Problems	636
<i>Unitherm Food Systems, Inc. v. Swift-Eckrich, Inc.</i>	637
Notes and Problems	641

F. Judges Undoing Verdicts: The New Trial 642

1. The Justifications for New Trials	642
a. Flawed Procedures	642
b. Flawed Verdicts	643
<i>Lind v. Schenley Industries</i>	644
Notes and Problems	647

- 2. Conditional New Trials 648
 - a. New Trial Limited to Damages 648
 - b. Remittitur and Additur 649
- G. The Limits of Judicial Power: The Reexamination Clause and the Jury as a Black Box 650
 - Peterson v. Wilson* 650
 - Notes and Problems 654
 - Assessment Questions 657
 - Analysis of Assessment Questions 658

Chapter 10: Appeal 661

- A. Who Can Appeal? 662
 - 1. A Losing Party: Adversity 663
 - Notes and Problems 663
 - Aetna Casualty & Surety Co. v. Cunningham* 664
 - Notes and Problems 665
 - 2. Who Raised the Issue Below: Of Waivers and Sandbags 666
 - Notes and Problems 667
 - 3. Who Was Not Deterred from Appealing 670
- B. When a Decision May Be Reviewed: “Finality” 672
 - 1. The Final Judgment Rule 672
 - a. Appellate Jurisdiction and the Final Judgment Rule 673
 - Liberty Mutual Insurance Co. v. Wetzel* 673
 - Notes and Problems 677
 - b. Defining the Moment of Judgment 679
 - Notes and Problems 680
 - 2. Exceptions to the Final Judgment Rule 681
 - a. Practical Finality 682
 - Lauro Lines s.r.l. v. Chasser* 682
 - Notes and Problems 686
 - b. Injunctions 688
 - Notes and Problems 688
 - c. Interlocutory Appeals 689
 - d. Mandamus 689
 - Notes and Problems 690
- C. Scope of Review 691
 - 1. Law and Fact 691
 - Anderson v. Bessemer City* 692
 - Notes and Problems 696
 - 2. Harmless Error 697
 - Van Zee v. Hanson* 697
 - Notes and Problems 699
 - Assessment Questions 700
 - Analysis of Assessment Questions 701

Chapter 11: Respect for Judgments 703

A. Claim Preclusion 704

1. Precluding the “Same” Claim 704
 - a. Efficiency 704
 - Frier v. City of Vandalia* 705
 - Notes and Problems 710
 - Semtek Intl. Inc. v. Lockheed Martin Corp.* 713
 - Notes and Problems 717
 - b. Consistency—The Logical Implications of the Former Judgment 718
 - Notes and Problems 719
2. Between the “Same” Parties 720
 - Taylor v. Sturgell* 720
 - Notes and Problems 726
3. After a Final Judgment 729
4. After a Judgment “on the Merits” 730
 - Notes and Problems 730
 - Gargallo v. Merrill Lynch, Pierce, Fenner & Smith* 732
 - Notes and Problems 735

B. Issue Preclusion 735

1. The Same Issue 736
 - Notes and Problems 737
2. An Issue “Actually Litigated and Determined” 737
 - Illinois Central Gulf Railroad v. Parks* 738
 - Notes and Problems 740
3. An Issue “Essential to the Judgment” 741
 - Notes and Problems 742
4. Between Which Parties? 744
 - Parklane Hosiery Co. v. Shore* 745
 - Notes and Problems 750

C. The Boundaries of Preclusion 755

1. Claim Preclusion 755
2. Issue Preclusion 756

D. Repose: Collateral Attack and Reopened Judgments 757

1. Full Faith and Credit as a Bar to Collateral Attack 758
 - V.L. v. E.L.* 759
 - Notes and Problems 762
2. The Reopened Judgment as an Alternative to Collateral Attack 765
 - United States v. Beggerly* 766
 - Notes and Problems 768
 - Assessment Questions 770
 - Analysis of Assessment Questions 772

PART III: PROBING THE BOUNDARIES: ADDITIONAL CLAIMS AND PARTIES

Chapter 12: Joinder 777

A. Joinder of Claims 777

1. Joinder of Claims by Plaintiff 778
 - a. Historical Background 778
 - b. The Federal Rules 778
 - c. Joinder and Jurisdiction 779
Notes and Problems 780
2. Claims by the Defendant: Counterclaims and Crossclaims 782
Cordero v. Voltaire, LLC 782
Notes and Problems 785

B. Joinder of Parties 788

1. By Plaintiffs 788
Mosley v. General Motors Corp. 788
Notes and Problems 792
2. By Defendants: Third-Party Claims 794
Price v. CTB, Inc. 794
Notes and Problems 797
3. Compulsory Joinder 802
Temple v. Synthes Corp. 802
Notes and Problems 804
Helzberg's Diamond Shops v. Valley West Des Moines Shopping Center 806
Notes and Problems 809

C. Intervention 812

- Natural Resources Defense Council v. United States Nuclear Regulatory Commission* 813
Notes and Problems 817
Martin v. Wilks 819
Notes and Problems 823

D. Interpleader 825

- Southern Farm Bureau Life Ins. Co. v. Davis* 827
Notes and Problems 828

E. Class Actions 829

1. Introduction 829
2. The Class Action and the Constitution 830
 - a. Representative Adequacy 830
Hansberry v. Lee 831
Notes and Problems 836

b. Personal Jurisdiction	837
<i>Phillips Petroleum v. Shutts</i>	837
Notes and Problems	842
3. The Class Action and Federalism	842
<i>Standard Fire Ins. Co. v. Knowles</i>	844
Notes and Problems	848
4. Statutory Requirements	850
Notes and Problems	854
<i>Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. v. Dukes</i>	855
Notes and Problems	865
5. Settlement of Class Actions and the “Settlement Class”	867
Notes and Problems	869
a. Fees	870
Notes and Problems	871
b. Damages and Injunctive Relief	872
c. Settlement and Dismissal	872
<i>Amchem Products, Inc. v. Windsor</i>	873
Notes and Problems	880
Assessment Questions	883
Analysis of Assessment Questions	885
<i>Table of Cases</i>	889
<i>Table of Citations to the Judicial Code (28 U.S.C.)</i>	895
<i>Table of Citations to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure</i>	897
<i>Table of Authorities</i>	899
<i>Index</i>	901