

# Questioning the Foundations of Public Law

Michael A Wilkinson  
and  
Michael W Dowdle

• H A R T •

OXFORD • LONDON • NEW YORK • NEW DELHI • SYDNEY

---

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

<i>Acknowledgements</i> .....	v
<i>Contributors</i> .....	xiii

### Part I: Introducing the Foundations of Public Law

1. Questioning the Foundations of Public Law and Questioning <i>Foundations of Public Law</i> .....	3
<i>Michael A Wilkinson and Michael W Dowdle</i>	
I. Introduction .....	3
II. Law and Politics .....	5
III. The Evolution of the Modern State .....	7
IV. Continuity and Critique .....	9
A. The Methodological Critique .....	9
B. The Normative Critique .....	10
C. The Material Critique .....	12
D. The Comparative Critique .....	13
2. Political Jurisprudence .....	15
<i>Martin Loughlin</i>	
I. Introduction .....	15
II. Schools of Jurisprudence .....	15
III. The Nature of the Inquiry .....	17
IV. The Political Domain .....	19
V. The State .....	22
VI. Power and Authority .....	23
VII. Constitution .....	26
VIII. The Logic of Political Jurisprudence .....	26
IX. Conclusion .....	28

### Part II: The Methodological Critique

3. Questioning a Uniform Concept of Public Law .....	33
<i>Andrew Halpin</i>	
I. Introduction .....	33
II. A Preliminary Digression on Goldsmith and Levinson .....	34
III. The Autonomy of Public Law .....	37
IV. Relating a Science of Political Right to Public Law .....	40
V. The Grammar of Public Law .....	45
VI. Why the Juristic Turn? .....	48

4. The Tragic Politics of Public Law.....	51
<i>Panu Minkkinen</i>	
I. Introduction .....	51
II. 'The Whirlwind of Rights'.....	54
III. The Polemical Intervention .....	57
IV. Tragic Metapolitics .....	60
5. Immanence and Irreconcilability: On the Character of Public Law as Political Jurisprudence.....	63
<i>Jacco Bomhoff</i>	
I. Introduction .....	63
II. Taking Religion Seriously: Political Jurisprudence as <i>Secular</i> .....	67
III. Autonomy and Ambivalence.....	71
IV. Taking Legalism Seriously: Political Jurisprudence as <i>Law</i> .....	73
V. Taking Exteriority Seriously: Public Law as <i>Immanent</i> ? .....	76
VI. Ritual and 'In-between' Spaces .....	79
VII. Conclusion.....	81
<b>Part III: The Normative Critique</b>	
6. Concrete Order Formation or Rational Will Formation? Constituent Power as the <i>Ratio</i> of <i>Voluntas</i> .....	85
<i>Hauke Brunkhorst</i>	
I. The Dialectic of <i>Potestas</i> and <i>Potentia</i> .....	85
II. <i>Nomos</i> and the Genealogy of Political Power.....	87
III. The Social Origin of Political Power .....	90
IV. Secularisation, Sovereignty and Rationality.....	92
V. Constituent Power, <i>Ratio</i> and <i>Voluntas</i> .....	94
VI. The Radical Democratic Reading of Constituent Power.....	96
7. Private Law, <i>Potentia</i> and the Ethical: On What Justification Does the State Coercively Tax its Subjects in Order to Build Bridges, Fund the BBC, and Subsidise Charities? .....	99
<i>James Penner</i>	
I. Introduction .....	99
II. Loughlin on <i>Societas</i> , <i>Universitas</i> , <i>Potestas</i> and <i>Potentia</i> .....	100
III. Kant on Private Right and the Foundations of the State.....	102
IV. Raz on the Rights of Citizens and the Justification of the State.....	103
V. <i>Potestas</i> and <i>Potentia</i> , and the Moral and the Ethical .....	104
VI. Justifying <i>Potentia</i> and the Ethical in Politics .....	107
VII. Conclusion.....	113
8. A Conventional Narrative: The Rhetorical Shape of <i>Foundations of Public Law</i> .....	115
<i>Anna Yeatman</i>	
I. Introduction: A Conventional Narrative.....	115
II. The Early Modern Discovery of the Idea of the State.....	116

III.	The Liberal Idea of the State .....	123
IV.	The Twentieth Century State—The Narrative of ‘the Triumph of the Social’ and the Displacement of Political Right by Regulatory Power.....	126
V.	Conclusion .....	131
9.	<i>Foundations of Public Law</i> and Postnational Constitutionalism .....	133
	<i>Neil Walker</i>	
I.	Introduction.....	133
II.	What Would Count as Evidence of an Underlying Shift?.....	134
III.	On Whom Lies the Burden to Imagine and Chart the Future?.....	138
<b>Part IV: The Material Critique</b>		
10.	Putting Public Law in its Place: State-Theoretical Comments on <i>Foundations of Public Law</i> .....	143
	<i>Bob Jessop</i>	
I.	Introduction.....	143
II.	Seven Approaches to the Analysis of the State .....	144
III.	Conceptual History and its Limitations .....	146
IV.	Beyond <i>Allgemeine Staatslehre</i> .....	151
	A. State Territory.....	152
	B. State Apparatus.....	153
	C. State Population .....	154
	D. The State Idea .....	156
V.	Public Law, the Multi-Dimensionality of the State and Substantive Crisis Mechanisms.....	157
VI.	Concluding Comments and Direct Questions.....	161
11.	The Materiality of Political Jurisprudence .....	165
	<i>Marco Goldoni</i>	
I.	Introduction.....	165
II.	Methodology: The Prudential Rationality of Political Jurisprudence .....	166
III.	Trajectory: From a Functional to a Reflexive Political Jurisprudence.....	168
IV.	Object: Right Ordering and its Grammar .....	172
V.	Subjectivity: The Material Constitution.....	175
12.	Public Law and the Autonomy of the Political: <i>A Material Critique</i> .....	181
	<i>Michael A Wilkinson</i>	
I.	Introduction.....	181
II.	What Grounds the Autonomy of the Political? .....	185
III.	The Relation between the Political and the Economic in the Material Ordering of the <i>Nomos</i> .....	188
IV.	The Interwar Breakdown of Public Law: A Crisis of the State .....	193
V.	The Post-War Constitutional Imagination: A Transformation of the State.....	199
VI.	Conclusion .....	204

### Part V: The Comparative Critique

13.	<i>Foundations of Public Law: A View from the United States</i> .....	209
	<i>Mark Tushnet</i>	
	I. Introduction .....	209
	II. US Constitutionalism: No Itch to Scratch? .....	210
	III. The UK's Position in a Changing World .....	213
14.	The Elusive Quest for Community: The Making of Political Identity in Modern Indian Constitutionalism .....	217
	<i>Mathew John</i>	
	I. Introduction .....	217
	II. The Authority of Community in Public Law .....	218
	III. Constitutionalism as the Search for Community in Colonial and Post-Colonial India .....	219
	IV. Adjudicating Minority Rights in the Indian Constitution .....	223
	A. The Constitutional Framework .....	223
	B. Two Conceptualisations of 'Minorities' .....	224
	V. Locating Loughlin against Gandhi's Rejection of the Nation .....	229
	VI. Searching for the 'Foundations' of Indian Constitutionalism .....	231
15.	Uncovering the Foundations of Administrative Law? .....	235
	<i>Denis Baranger</i>	
	I. Introduction .....	235
	II. Public Law as (Essentially) 'Sporadic and Peripheral' .....	237
	A. The Problem in Historical Terms .....	237
	B. The Conceptual Problem: The State and its Avatars .....	240
	III. In Search of a Foundation .....	244
	A. France: The Search for the 'Constitutional Bases' of Administrative Law .....	244
	B. Britain: 'A Foundation with too much Sand and not enough Rock' .....	248
	IV. Conclusion: Towards a Loughlinian Framework for Contemporary Public Law? .....	249
	A. Administrative Discretion: <i>Potestas</i> or <i>Potentia</i> ? .....	250
	B. The 'Right Ordering' of Administrative Law? .....	251

### Part VI: The Response

16.	Excavating <i>Foundations</i> .....	255
	<i>Martin Loughlin</i>	
	I. Introduction .....	255
	II. Approaches to Public Law .....	255
	III. Method and Objective of <i>Foundations</i> .....	258
	IV. State Theory .....	259
	V. State and Power in Analytical Jurisprudence .....	261
	VI. The Secularisation Thesis .....	262
	VII. How is Public Law Law? .....	264

VIII.	Is <i>Foundations</i> Conservative? .....	265
IX.	The Material Critique.....	266
X.	The Civic Republican Critique .....	268
XI.	The Rise of the Social .....	270
XII.	The Post-National Critique.....	271
XIII.	The Post-Colonial Critique.....	272
XIV.	American Exceptionalism .....	273
XV.	Conclusions .....	275
<i>Bibliography</i> .....		277
<i>Index</i> .....		291