

The Right to be Forgotten

Interpretation and Practice

Paul Lambert

*BA, LLB, LLM, TMA, CTMA, Qualified Lawyer, Adj Prof, CDPO, PhD, Consultant
Visiting Research Fellow, Institute of Advanced Legal Studies, University of London*

Bloomsbury Professional

LONDON • DUBLIN • EDINBURGH • NEW YORK • NEW DELHI • SYDNEY

Contents

<i>Preface</i>	<i>xv</i>
<i>Table of Statutes</i>	<i>xxi</i>
<i>Table of European Legislation</i>	<i>xxiii</i>
<i>Table of Cases</i>	<i>xxix</i>
<i>Abbreviations</i>	<i>xxxv</i>
<i>Notes</i>	<i>xxxvii</i>

Part A Background

Chapter 1 The Problem of Time	3
1 Introduction	3
2 The Problem of Time	3
3 A Whole New World	3
4 Two Decades Far, Far Away	5
5 Increasing Reach	5
6 Range	6
7 Increasing Problems	6
8 Real Effects	7
9 Tragic Effects	7
10 RtbF Solution	8
11 Increasing Adoption	8
12 Conclusion	10
Chapter 2 Big Bang	13
1 Introduction	13
2 'Big Bang' Over-reaction	13
3 Less 'Big Bang', More Progress	14
4 On Point	15
5 Similarity	16
6 Conclusion	19
Chapter 3 Problems Facing Individuals	21
1 Introduction	21
2 Memory and 'Permanence'	22
3 Digital Memory and Automation	23
4 Real Time	26
5 Children	27
6 Special Personal Data	28
7 Revenge Porn	33
8 OA Remedy and Solution Issues	37
9 On-Site Abuse Reporting	38
10 Reporting to Police	39
11 Image Copyright	40
12 Conclusion	42
Chapter 4 Online Tools	45
1 Introduction	45
2 Need for Rules and Tools	45

Chapter 5	Legal Backdrop	53
1	Introduction	53
2	Fundamental Right of Data Protection	53
3	EU Law and Data Protection Laws	54
4	Data Protection and Legal Instruments	58
5	GDPR	59
6	National Reference, Reaction and Adaptation of RtbF	65
7	Conclusion	67
Chapter 6	The Parties of Data Protection	69
1	Introduction	69
2	Main Parties	69
3	National Data Protection Supervisory Authority	78
4	Courts	79
5	Conclusion	80
Chapter 7	Forgetting and Other Rights	81
1	Introduction	81
2	The RtbF Right	81
3	Rectification Right	82
4	Erasure and Forgetting Right	82
5	GDPR: Article 16	84
6	GDPR: Article 17	84
7	Other Complementary Rights	85
Chapter 8	Enhanced Regime	93
1	Introduction	93
2	Changes and Expansions	93
3	General Welcome	94
4	EU Commission	94
5	Main Provisions and Changes	97
6	Security	106
7	GDPR Analysis	106
Chapter 9	Responses	111
1	Introduction	111
2	Headline Issues Raised	111
3	General Reactions	115
4	Positive Reactions	116
5	Negative Reactions	116
6	Business Reactions	118
7	Sectorial Reactions	119
8	Reactions From the US	120
9	Search Engines and Social Media	121
10	Unintended Consequences	123
11	Foundation Discussions	123
12	Conclusion	128
Chapter 10	Practical Issues Facing Individuals	129
1	Introduction	129
2	Responsibility	129

3	Passing the Buck	130
4	Disparity	130
5	Evidence	131
6	Report, Report, Report	131
7	Us, Not Us	132
8	Transparency of RtbF	132
9	Reliability of Internet Sources	133
10	Internet Data Sources and Locations	133
11	Cloud	134
12	Internet of Things	134
13	On-Site/Off-Site	134
14	GDPR and Directive: Enhanced provisions	135
15	Problem Content 137	
16	Accurate	138
17	Notification of Inaccuracy	138
18	Conclusion	138
Part B Right to be Forgotten: The Details		
Chapter 11 The Right		143
1	Introduction	143
2	Right to Erasure/Right to be Forgotten (RtbF)	143
3	Erasure and Forgetting	145
4	To Whom? The Individual Data Subject	146
5	Erasure and Forgetting of What? Personal Data	147
6	Who Must Act? The Controller	147
7	What Must Happen? Erasure and Forgetting	148
8	When Must It Happen? No Delay	149
9	Obligation on the Controller: Erasure and Forgetting	151
10	Timing: No Delay	151
11	Conditional or Specific Right(s)	152
12	Different Potential Rights	153
13	The Specific Right(s) to be Forgotten	153
14	Qualifying Factors	155
15	Conclusion	156
Chapter 12 The RtbF Rights and Streams		157
1	Introduction	157
2	Different Potential Rights	158
3	Headline GDPR Rights and Streams	158
4	Different Rights to be Forgotten	159
5	Problem Content	159
6	Pre- and Post-GDPR Comparison	162
7	Additional Rights and Grounds	204
8	Conclusion: Future Rights and Grounds	205
Chapter 13 Additional RtbF Obligations		207
1	Introduction	207
2	Obligations	208
3	Factors	208
4	Conclusion	209

Contents

Chapter 14 Exemptions	211
1 Introduction	211
2 Limited Exemptions	211
3 Complications	212
4 Onus	212
5 Limited Interpretation	213
6 Certain Exception Issues	213
7 Charter	213
8 Individualised Consideration	214
9 Necessity	214
10 Freedom of Expression	215
11 Legal Obligation by Law or Public Interests Task or Official Authority	216
12 Public Health Interest	217
13 Archiving or Statistics	218
14 Legal Claims	219
15 Timing	222
 Part C Official Guidance	
Chapter 15 The WP 29 Guidance on <i>Google Spain</i>	225
1 Introduction	225
2 WP 29 Guidance Criteria List	226
3 Linked Activities and Takedown Links	231
4 Broad Judgment on Territory	231
5 Member State Laws and Directive	231
6 Responsibility Even Without EU Establishment	232
7 Update Guidance	232
8 Establishment Test and ‘Context of the Activities of an Establishment’	233
9 Anti-Avoidance	234
10 Targeting	235
11 ‘Inextricable Link’ Between EU and Non-EU Activities	235
12 Local Link to Processing Activities	235
13 General Application	236
14 Revenue Planning	237
15 Lesson	237
16 Applicable Law and Multiple EU Establishments	237
17 ‘Inextricable Link’ Test as New Element of ‘ <i>In the Context of the Activities</i> ’ Analysis	239
18 One-stop Shop	240
19 GDPR	241
20 Conclusion	241
 Part D EU Case Examples	
Chapter 16 EU Case Law Examples	245
1 <i>Google Spain</i> : The Ground-breaking RtbF Case	245
2 Directive 95/46: Law Pre the GDPR	245
3 Facts, History and Circumstances	246
4 Legal Context: European Union Law	248
5 Questions and Issues Referred	254
6 Ruling of Court	277
7 Comment on <i>Google Spain</i>	278
8 Second <i>Google</i> EU RtbF Case	280

Part E National Case Law

Chapter 17 National Case Law: United Kingdom	287
1 Introduction	287
2 Data Protection Act	287
3 Successful RtbF Case: <i>NT2</i>	287
4 Unsuccessful RtbF Case: <i>NT1</i>	288
5 General Principles	288
6 UK Spent Convictions and the 1974 Act	293
7 Damages	298
8 Article 29 Working Party Guidelines	303
9 GDPR	305
10 Misuse of Private Information	306
11 Convictions, Confidentiality and Privacy	306
12 The e-Commerce Directive and Regulations	310
Chapter 18 Successful UK RtbF Case – <i>NT2</i>	313
1 Introduction	313
2 Description	313
3 Main Issue	315
4 Abuse of Process	316
5 Data Protection	316
6 The Problem URLs	318
7 Inaccuracy	318
8 Privacy Issues	319
9 Overall Court Assessment	327
10 Misuse of Private Information	327
11 Remedies	328
12 Overall Conclusions of <i>NT2</i>	329
Chapter 19 Unsuccessful UK RtbF Case – <i>NT1</i>	331
1 Introduction	331
2 Description	331
3 Main Issues	333
4 Abuse	336
5 Inaccuracy	339
6 Privacy	349
7 <i>Google Spain</i>	359
8 The <i>Misuse Issues</i>	385
9 Damages	386
10 Overall Conclusions in <i>NT1</i>	386
Chapter 20 ICO and the RtbF	389
1 Introduction	389
2 Guidance	389
3 Children	390
4 Onward Notifications	390
5 Backups	391
ICO Checklists	392

Contents

Chapter 21	UK Law	393
1	Introduction	393
2	Changes from GDPR	393
3	Derogations for Research, Statistics and Archiving	398
Chapter 22	UK Brexit and Data Protection	399
1	Introduction	400
2	Deal or No Deal	400
3	New Official Advice	400
4	ICO	400
6	Data and the European Union (Withdrawal) Act 2018	405
7	EUWA Details	406
	The <i>NT1</i> & <i>NT2</i> Case	417
8	Conclusion	419
Part F	Additional Cases	
Chapter 23	Additional Cases	423
1	Introduction	423
2	Sweden	423
3	France	424
4	Canada	426
5	Elsewhere	428
6	Conclusion	428
Part G	Media Issues	
Chapter 24	Media	431
1	Introduction	431
2	Balance	432
3	Problems and Solutions	433
4	Range of Media Rtbf Issues	433
5	GDPR	436
6	<i>Google Spain</i>	437
7	WP29	438
8	Public Figure	438
9	Preponderance	439
Part H	Additional Solutions: Options to Consider	
Chapter 25	Potential Additional Solution	443
1	Introduction	443
2	Right to Rectification	445
3	Restriction of Processing	445
4	Notification to Third Parties	448
5	Data Protection by Design and by Default	449
6	Data Protection Impact Assessment	450
7	Prior Consultation	452
8	Damages and Compensation	453
Part I	Impact, Commentary and Future	
Chapter 26	Conclusion: Impact and Future	457
1	Introduction	457
2	Awareness	457
3	Discretion	458

4	One Solution	458
5	Investigations	459
6	Transfers, Processors, Third Parties	460
7	New Risks	460
8	GDPR RtbF	461
9	Right to Rectification	461
10	Preventing Processing from Causing Damage or Distress	462
11	Compensation and Damages	462
12	Children	462
13	Data Access Rights	463
14	Identification Rights	463
15	Right to Restriction of Processing	463
16	Notification Rectification, Erasure or Restriction	463
17	A Rights Issue, a Protection, or Safety Issue? Or Both?	464
18	Online Abuse	464
19	Future and Additional RtbFs	464
20	Conclusion	466
<i>Appendices</i>		467
<i>Amanda Todd Transcript</i>		467
<i>Google Spain: Reference to Legal Provisions</i>		469
<i>Index</i>		479