

ASPEN CASEBOOK SERIES

# THE FIRST AMENDMENT

---

**Erwin Chemerinsky**

Dean and Jesse H. Choper Distinguished Professor of Law  
University of California, Berkeley School of Law



Wolters Kluwer

# CONTENTS

---

Preface	xxi
The First Amendment	xxiii
The Constitution of the United States	xxv

---

## PART I

---

### FIRST AMENDMENT: FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION 1

---

#### CHAPTER 1

---

#### INTRODUCTION TO FREEDOM OF SPEECH 3

A. Historical Background	3
B. Why Should Freedom of Speech Be a Fundamental Right?	5
1. Self-Governance	6
2. Discovering Truth	7
3. Advancing Autonomy	9
4. Promoting Tolerance	10
5. Conclusion	10
C. The Issues in Free Expression Analysis	10

---

#### CHAPTER 2

---

#### FREE SPEECH METHODOLOGY 13

A. The Distinction Between Content-Based and Content-Neutral Laws	13
1. The Importance of the Distinction	14
<i>Reed v. Town of Gilbert</i>	14
2. How Is It Determined Whether a Law Is Content-Based?	22
<i>Boos v. Barry</i>	22
<i>Williams-Yulee v. Florida Bar</i>	25
3. Problems in Applying the Distinction Between Content-Based and Content-Neutral Laws	35
<i>City of Renton v. Playtime Theatres, Inc.</i>	35
<i>National Endowment for the Arts v. Finley</i>	39
<i>Pleasant Grove City, Utah v. Summum</i>	42
<i>Walker v. Texas Division, Sons of Confederate Veterans</i>	47

B. Vagueness and Overbreadth	52
1. Vagueness	53
Coates v. City of Cincinnati	53
2. Overbreadth	55
Schad v. Borough of Mount Ephraim	55
3. Relationship Between Vagueness and Overbreadth	58
Board of Airport Commissioners of the City of Los Angeles v. Jews for Jesus, Inc.	59
C. Prior Restraints	60
1. What Is a Prior Restraint?	60
2. Are Prior Restraints Really So Bad?	61
3. Types of Prior Restraints	63
a. Court Orders as a Prior Restraint	63
Near v. State of Minnesota ex rel. Olson	63
i. Court Orders to Protect National Security	65
New York Times Co. v. United States	66
ii. Court Orders to Protect Fair Trials	73
Nebraska Press Association v. Stuart	73
iii. Court Orders Seizing the Assets of Businesses Convicted of Obscenity Violations	78
Alexander v. United States	78
b. Licensing as a Prior Restraint	80
Lovell v. City of Griffin, Ga.	80
Watchtower Bible & Tract Society of New York, Inc. v. Village of Stratton	82
i. Important Reason for Licensing	87
ii. Clear Standards Leaving Almost No Discretion to the Government	87
City of Lakewood v. Plain Dealer Publishing Co.	87
iii. Procedural Safeguards	89
D. What Is an Infringement of Freedom of Speech?	90
1. Civil Liability and Denial of Compensation for Speech	91
2. Prohibitions on Compensation	92
United States v. National Treasury Employees Union	92
3. Compelled Speech	94
West Virginia State Board of Education v. Barnette	94
Rumsfeld v. Forum for Academic & Institutional Rights, Inc.	97
McIntyre v. Ohio Elections Commission	102
4. Unconstitutional Conditions	107
Speiser v. Randall	108
Rust v. Sullivan	109
Legal Services Corp. v. Velazquez	113
5. Government Pressures	120

## CHAPTER 3

<b>TYPES OF UNPROTECTED AND LESS PROTECTED SPEECH</b>	<b>123</b>
A. Incitement of Illegal Activity	124
1. The "Clear and Present Danger" Test	125
<i>Schenck v. United States</i>	126
<i>Frohwerk v. United States</i>	127
<i>Debs v. United States</i>	128
<i>Abrams v. United States</i>	130
2. The Reasonableness Approach	132
<i>Gitlow v. New York</i>	133
<i>Whitney v. California</i>	135
3. The Risk Formula Approach	139
<i>Dennis v. United States</i>	139
4. The <i>Brandenburg</i> Test	145
<i>Brandenburg v. Ohio</i>	145
<i>Holder v. Humanitarian Law Project</i>	148
B. Fighting Words, the Hostile Audience, and the Problem of Racist Speech	157
1. Fighting Words	157
<i>Chaplinsky v. New Hampshire</i>	158
a. Narrowing the Fighting Words Doctrine	160
b. Fighting Words Laws Invalidated as Vague and Overbroad	160
<i>Gooding v. Wilson</i>	160
c. Narrow Fighting Words Laws as Content-Based Restrictions	163
<i>R.A.V. v. City of St. Paul, Minnesota</i>	163
2. The Hostile Audience Cases	169
3. The Problem of Racist Speech	172
<i>Beauharnais v. Illinois</i>	172
<i>Virginia v. Black</i>	176
C. Sexually Oriented Speech	184
1. Obscenity	184
a. Supreme Court Decisions Finding Obscenity Unprotected	184
<i>Roth v. United States</i>	185
<i>Paris Adult Theatre I v. Slaton</i>	187
<i>Miller v. California</i>	190
b. Should Obscenity Be a Category of Unprotected Speech?	192
c. Should There Be a New Exception for Pornography?	194
2. Child Pornography	195
<i>New York v. Ferber</i>	195
<i>Ashcroft v. Free Speech Coalition</i>	198

3. Protected but Low-Value Sexual Speech	204
a. Zoning Ordinances	205
<i>Young v. American Mini Theatres, Inc.</i>	205
b. Nude Dancing	208
<i>City of Erie v. Pap's A.M.</i>	209
c. Should There Be Such a Category as Low-Value Sexual Speech?	213
4. Government Techniques for Controlling Obscenity and Child Pornography	214
<i>Stanley v. Georgia</i>	214
<i>Osborne v. Ohio</i>	216
5. Profanity and "Indecent" Speech	216
<i>Cohen v. California</i>	217
a. The Broadcast Media	220
<i>Federal Communications Commission v. Pacifica Foundation</i>	220
b. Telephones	223
c. The Internet	224
<i>Reno v. American Civil Liberties Union</i>	224
d. Cable Television	228
D. A New Exception for Violent Speech?	230
<i>United States v. Stevens</i>	230
<i>Brown v. Entertainment Merchants Association</i>	237
E. Commercial Speech	245
1. Constitutional Protection for Commercial Speech	245
<i>Virginia State Board of Pharmacy v. Virginia Citizens Consumer Council, Inc.</i>	246
Overview of the Section	251
2. What Is Commercial Speech?	251
<i>Bolger v. Youngs Drug Products Corp.</i>	252
<i>Sorrell v. IMS Health Inc.</i>	253
3. The Test for Evaluating Regulation of Commercial Speech	260
<i>Central Hudson Gas &amp; Electric Corp. v. Public Service Commission of New York</i>	260
Is Least Restrictive Alternative Analysis Applicable?	263
4. Advertising of Illegal Activities	265
5. False and Deceptive Advertising	265
6. Advertising That Inherently Risks Deception	266
Restrictions on Trade Names	266
<i>Friedman v. Rogers</i>	266
Attorney Solicitation of Prospective Clients	267
Solicitation by Accountants	269
7. Regulating Commercial Speech to Achieve Other Goals	269
a. "For Sale" Signs on Houses	270

b. Alcohol Products	270
<i>44 Liquormart, Inc. v. Rhode Island</i>	271
c. Tobacco Products	273
<i>Lorillard Tobacco Co. v. Reilly</i>	273
d. Gambling	280
e. Advertising by Lawyers and Other Professionals	281
F. Reputation, Privacy, Publicity, and the First Amendment:	
Torts and the First Amendment	283
1. Defamation	283
a. Public Officials as Defamation Plaintiffs	283
<i>New York Times Co. v. Sullivan</i>	284
b. Public Figures as Plaintiffs	289
<i>Gertz v. Welch</i>	290
c. Private Figures, Matters of Public Concern	296
<i>Dun &amp; Bradstreet, Inc. v. Greenmoss Builders, Inc.</i>	296
d. Private Figures, Matters Not of Public Concern	299
e. Conclusion	299
2. Intentional Infliction of Emotional Distress	299
<i>Hustler Magazine v. Falwell</i>	300
<i>Snyder v. Phelps</i>	302
3. Public Disclosure of Private Facts	307
<i>Cox Broadcasting Corp. v. Cohn</i>	307
Information from Nongovernment Sources	310
4. Right of Publicity	311
G. Conduct That Communicates	312
1. What Is Speech?	312
2. When Is Conduct Communicative?	312
3. When May the Government Regulate Conduct That	
Communicates?	313
a. The <i>O'Brien</i> Test	313
<i>United States v. O'Brien</i>	313
b. Flag Desecration	317
<i>Texas v. Johnson</i>	317
c. Spending Money as Political Speech	323
<i>Buckley v. Valeo</i>	323
Criticisms of <i>Buckley</i>	330
The Continuing Distinction Between	
Contributions and Expenditures	331
When Are Contribution Limits Too Low?	332
Are Corporate Expenditures Protected Speech?	334
<i>First National Bank of Boston v. Bellotti</i>	334
<i>Citizens United v. Federal Election Commission</i>	338
The Constitutionality of Public Financing	
of Elections	355
<i>Arizona Free Enterprise Club's Freedom Club</i>	
<i>PAC v. Bennett</i>	355

## CHAPTER 4

<b>WHAT PLACES ARE AVAILABLE FOR SPEECH?</b>	<b>365</b>
A. Government Properties and Speech	366
1. Initial Rejection and Subsequent Recognition of a Right to Use Government Property for Speech	366
<i>Hague v. Committee for Industrial Organization</i>	366
<i>Schneider v. New Jersey</i>	367
2. What Government Property and Under What Circumstances?	369
a. Public Forums	371
i. Content Neutrality	371
<i>Police Department of the City of Chicago v. Mosley</i>	371
ii. Time, Place, and Manner Restrictions	373
<i>Hill v. Colorado</i>	374
<i>McCullen v. Coakley</i>	379
iii. Licensing and Permit Systems	390
iv. No Requirement for Use of the Least Restrictive Alternative	391
<i>Ward v. Rock Against Racism</i>	391
b. Designated Public Forums	393
c. Limited Public Forums	394
<i>Christian Legal Society Chapter of the University of             California, Hastings College of the Law v. Martinez</i>	394
d. Nonpublic Forums	406
<i>International Society for Krishna Consciousness,             Inc. v. Lee</i>	407
3. Private Property and Speech	411
4. Speech in Authoritarian Environments: Military, Prisons, and Schools	412
a. Military	412
<i>Parker v. Levy</i>	413
b. Prisons	415
<i>Thornburgh v. Abbott</i>	415
c. Schools	419
<i>Tinker v. Des Moines Independent Community             School District</i>	420
<i>Bethel School District No. 403 v. Fraser</i>	423
<i>Hazelwood School District v. Kuhlmeier</i>	425
<i>Morse v. Frederick</i>	430
d. The Speech Rights of Government Employees	438
<i>Garcetti v. Ceballos</i>	439

---

**CHAPTER 5**


---

<b>FREEDOM OF ASSOCIATION</b>	<b>447</b>
A. Laws Prohibiting and Punishing Membership	448
B. Laws Requiring Disclosure of Membership	449
<i>NAACP v. State of Alabama ex rel. Patterson</i>	449
Campaign Finance Disclosure	451
C. Compelled Association	452
<i>Board of Regents of the University of Wisconsin System v. Southworth</i>	455
D. Laws Prohibiting Discrimination	458
<i>Roberts v. United States Jaycees</i>	458
<i>Boy Scouts of America v. Dale</i>	464

---

**CHAPTER 6**


---

<b>FREEDOM OF THE PRESS</b>	<b>471</b>
A. Introduction: Are There Special Rights for the Press?	471
B. Freedom of the Press as a Shield to Protect the Press from the Government	472
1. Taxes on the Press	472
<i>Minneapolis Star &amp; Tribune Co. v. Minnesota Commissioner of Revenue</i>	473
2. Application of General Regulatory Laws	477
<i>Cohen v. Cowles Media Co.</i>	478
3. Keeping Reporters' Sources and Secrets Confidential	480
<i>Branzburg v. Hayes</i>	480
4. Laws Requiring That the Media Make Access Available	487
C. Freedom of the Press as a Sword: A First Amendment Right of Access to Government Places and Papers?	488
1. Access to Judicial Proceedings	489
<i>Richmond Newspapers v. Virginia</i>	489
2. Prisons	496
<i>Houchins v. KQED</i>	496

---

**PART II**


---

<b>FIRST AMENDMENT: RELIGION</b>	<b>501</b>
----------------------------------	------------

---

**CHAPTER 7**


---

<b>INTRODUCTION TO THE RELIGION CLAUSE</b>	<b>503</b>
A. Constitutional Provisions Concerning Religion and the Tension Between Them	503



B. History in Interpreting the Religion Clauses	505
C. What Is Religion?	506
The Attempt to Define Religion Under the Selective Service Act	507
<i>United States v. Seeger</i>	507
Requirement for Sincerely Held Beliefs	510
<i>United States v. Ballard</i>	510
The Relevance of Religious Dogma and Shared Beliefs	512

## CHAPTER 8

---

<b>THE FREE EXERCISE CLAUSE</b>	<b>515</b>
A. Introduction: Free Exercise Clause Issues	515
B. The Current Test	516
<i>Employment Division, Department of Human         Resources of Oregon v. Smith</i>	516
The Law Before <i>Employment Division v. Smith</i>	524
<i>Sherbert v. Verner</i>	525
1. Government Benefit Cases	527
2. Compulsory Schooling	528
3. Cases Rejecting Exemptions Based on the Free Exercise Clause	528
Statutory Protection of Religious Freedom	532
<i>Burwell v. Hobby Lobby</i>	533
<i>Cutter v. Wilkinson</i>	538
C. Is Denial of Funding for Religious Education a Violation of Free Exercise of Religion?	539
<i>Locke v. Davey</i>	540

## CHAPTER 9

---

<b>THE ESTABLISHMENT CLAUSE</b>	<b>545</b>
A. Competing Theories of the Establishment Clause	545
1. Strict Separation	545
2. Neutrality Theory	546
3. Accommodation	549
4. The Theories Applied: An Example	550
<i>County of Allegheny v. American Civil Liberties             Union, Greater Pittsburgh Chapter</i>	550
B. Government Discrimination Among Religions	555
C. The <i>Lemon</i> Test for the Establishment Clause	556
<i>Lemon v. Kurtzman</i>	556

The Requirement for a Secular Purpose	558
The Requirement for a Secular Effect	559
The Prohibition of Excessive Entanglement	560
D. Religious Speech and the First Amendment	561
1. Religious Group Access to School Facilities	561
2. Student Religious Groups' Receipt of Government Funds	563
3. Student-Delivered Prayers	564
<i>Santa Fe Independent School District v. Doe</i>	564
4. Religious Symbols on Government Property	568
<i>McCreary County v. American Civil Liberties Union</i>	
<i>of Kentucky</i>	569
<i>Van Orden v. Perry</i>	581
E. When Can Religion Become a Part of Government Activities?	592
1. Religion as a Part of Government Activities: Schools	592
Release Time	592
School Prayers and Bible Reading	593
<i>Engel v. Vitale</i>	593
<i>Lee v. Weisman</i>	596
Curricular Decisions	604
2. Religion as a Part of Government Activities: Legislative Chaplains	605
<i>Town of Greece v. Galloway</i>	605
F. When Can Government Give Aid to Religion?	614
Aid to Parochial Elementary and Secondary Schools	615
<i>Mitchell v. Helms</i>	616
<i>Zelman v. Simmons-Harris</i>	628
Tax Exemptions for Religious Organizations	643
Aid to Religious Colleges and Universities	644
Aid to Religious Institutions Other than Schools	645
Table of Cases	649
Index	657