

UNIVERSITY CASEBOOK SERIES®

COMPARATIVE CONSTITUTIONAL LAW

THIRD EDITION

by

VICKI C. JACKSON

Thurgood Marshall Professor of Constitutional Law
Harvard Law School

MARK TUSHNET

William Nelson Cromwell Professor of Law
Harvard Law School

 FOUNDATION
PRESS

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE TO THE THIRD EDITION.....	V
PREFACE TO THE SECOND EDITION.....	IX
PREFACE TO THE FIRST EDITION.....	XIII
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.....	XIX
TABLE OF CASES.....	LIII
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES	LXI
EDITORIAL NOTICE.....	XCI

Chapter I. Introduction: Reproductive Rights and Comparative

Constitutional Law	1
A. The U.S. Supreme Court's Abortion Decisions	2
Roe v. Wade	5
Note on Doe v. Bolton	23
Questions and Comments on Roe and Doe.....	24
Planned Parenthood of Southeastern Pennsylvania v. Casey	24
Questions and Comments on Casey.....	70
B. Abortion and Constitutional Law in Canada and Germany	71
1. The Morgentaler Decision: Some Background Notes on Abortion and the Constitution in Canada	71
Morgentaler, Smoling and Scott v. The Queen	72
Questions and Comments on Morgentaler	105
2. Introduction to the German Abortion Decisions	106
<i>West German Abortion Decision: A Contrast to Roe v. Wade,</i> translated by Robert E. Jonas and John D. Gorby, in 9 John Marshall J. of Prac. & Proc. 605 (1976):.....	108
Questions and Comments on the 1975 German Abortion Decision.....	124
Abortion and Reunification in Germany	125
Second Abortion Decision, German Federal Constitutional Court	126
Questions and Comments on the 1993 German Abortion Decision.....	148
C. Concluding Note on Comparisons	152

Chapter II. What Is Comparative Constitutional Law?159

A. The Value of Comparative Constitutional Study: Competing Perspectives.....	161
Donald P. Kommers, <i>The Value of Comparative Constitutional Law</i> , 9 J. Marshall J. of Practice & Procedure 685 (1976)	162
Günter Frankenberg, <i>Critical Comparisons: Re-thinking Comparative Law</i> , 26 Harv. Int'l L. J. 411 (1985).....	165
John Bell, <i>Comparing Public Law</i> , in <i>Comparative Law in the 21st Century</i> (Andrew Harding & Esin Örüçü eds., 2002).....	168
Questions and Comments.....	172

B.	Comparing Legal Decisions.....	173
1.	The Death Penalty in the European Union, Canada and the United States.....	173
	United States v. Burns	182
	Roper v. Simmons	190
	Questions and Comments.....	199
2.	Additional Considerations	205
a.	The Relevance of Practical Concerns in the Study of Comparative Constitutional Law	205
b.	The Relevance of Comparative Constitutional Law in Generating Philosophical or Social Scientific “Hypotheses”	206
c.	Dispelling the Sense of False Necessity and Learning About Other Cultures	206
3.	Constitutional “Borrowing” and Other Transnational Influences	206
	A.E. Dick Howard, <i>The Indeterminacy of Constitutions</i> , 31 Wake Forest L.Rev. 383, 402–04 (1996)	207
4.	Constitutionalism, International Agreements and Transnational Legal Sources.....	211
5.	The Units of Comparison: The Irish Experience With Reproductive Freedom and Popular Initiative.....	214
6.	Critical Comparison?	227
	Questions and Comments.....	229
	Chapter III. Constitutions and Constitutionalism	231
A.	General Considerations	231
	Cass Sunstein, <i>Constitutionalism and Secession</i> , 58 U. Chi. L. Rev. 633 (1991)	231
	Questions and Comments on Sunstein.....	235
	Walter F. Murphy, <i>Constitutions, Constitutionalism, and Democracy</i> , in <i>Constitutionalism and Democracy: Transitions in the Contemporary World</i> (Douglas Greenberg, Stanley N. Katz, Melanie Beth Oliviero, & Steven C. Wheatley eds., 1993).....	237
	Questions and Comments on Murphy	246
	Edward McWhinney, <i>Constitution-Making: Principles, Process, Practice</i> (1981).....	247
	Daniel P. Franklin & Michael J. Baun (eds.), <i>Political Culture and Constitutionalism: A Comparative Approach</i> (1994).....	251
	Questions and Comments.....	260
B.	Constitutions Without Constitutionalism	261
	H.W.O. Okoth-Ogendo, <i>Constitutions Without Constitutionalism: Reflections on an African Political Paradox</i> , in <i>Constitutionalism and Democracy: Transitions in the Contemporary World</i> (Douglas Greenberg, Stanley N. Katz, Melanie Beth Oliviero, & Steven C. Wheatley, eds., 1993)	261
	Questions and Comments on Okoth-Ogendo	272

Charles Manga Fombad, <i>Constitutional Reforms and Constitutionalism in Africa: Reflections on Some Current Challenges and Future Prospects</i> , 59 Buff. L. Rev. 1007 (2011)	274
Carlos Santiago Nino, <i>Transition to Democracy, Corporatism and Presidentialism with Special Reference to Latin America</i> , in <i>Constitutionalism and Democracy: Transitions in the Contemporary World</i> (Douglas Greenberg, Stanley N. Katz, Melanie Beth Oliviero, & Steven C. Wheatley, eds., 1993)	277
Note on Constitutions as Obstacles to Constitutionalism	287
Note on the People's Republic of China	289
Note on the Role of International (or Extra-National) Influences on Domestic Constitution-Making or Interpretation	294

Chapter IV. Creating Constitutions: Constitutional Moments and Transitions

A. Constitutional Legitimacy: Processes and Substance	297
1. Processes and Institutions of Constitutional Transformation: An Introduction	298
2. Processes and Institutions of Constitutional Transformation: Some Examples	300
a. The "Round Table Process" in Hungary	300
Istvan Pogany, <i>Constitutional Reform in Central and Eastern Europe: Hungary's Transition to Democracy</i> , 42 Int'l & Comp. L.Q. 332 (1993)	301
b. South Africa's Two-Stage Process	302
(i) Historical and Political Context	303
In re Certification of the Constitution of the R.S.A.	303
(ii) The Multi-Party Negotiating Process, the Interim Constitution, and the Role of the Constitutional Court	305
c. Silent judicial-legislative partnership: Incremental constitutional lawmaking in Israel?	308
Martin Edelman, <i>The Changing Role of the Israeli Supreme Court</i> , in <i>Comparative Judicial Systems: Challenging Frontiers in Conceptual and Empirical Analysis</i> (John R. Schmidhauser, ed. 1987)	309
United Mizrahi Bank v. Migdal Cooperative Village (1995), 49 (iv) P.D. 221, English translation in 31 Isr. L. Rev. 764 (1997)	312
d. The Post-World War II Constitutions in Germany and Japan; Subsequent International interventions	317
Questions and Comments	319
e. Participation, International Norms, and Failed Constitutional Processes: A Recent Case Study (Kenya's 1998–2005 Effort)	322
Alicia L. Bannon, <i>Note: Designing a Constitution-Drafting Process: Lessons From Kenya</i> , 116 Yale L. J. 1824 (2007)	323

	Questions and Comments	334
	Note: Iceland as New Model? Public Participation, Transparency, Time, and Attention	335
B.	Constitutional Change and Constitutional Legitimacy	337
1.	Consent and Legitimacy	337
	Walter F. Murphy, <i>Consent and Constitutional Change</i> , in Human Rights and Constitutional Law (James O'Reilly, ed., 1992)	337
	Questions and Comments	342
2.	Change by Amendment; Unconstitutional Amendments?	342
	Vicki C. Jackson, <i>Unconstitutional Constitutional Amendments: A Window Into Constitutional Theory and Transnational Constitutionalism</i> , in <i>Demokratie- Perspektiven: Festschrift für Brun-Otto Bryde zum 70 (Michael Bäuerle, Philipp Dann & Astrid Wallrabenstein eds., 2013)</i>	343
	Questions and Comments	350
3.	Constitution-Making: Clean Breaks or Evolutionary Change?	351
	Jon Elster, <i>Essay: Forces and Mechanisms in the Constitution- Making Process</i> , 45 Duke L. J. 364 (1995)	352
	Bruce Ackerman, <i>The Future of Liberal Revolution</i> (1992)	357
	Gary Jeffrey Jacobsohn, <i>Apple of Gold: Constitutionalism in Israel and the United States</i> (1993)	364
	Stanley N. Katz, <i>Constitutionalism in East Central Europe: Some Negative Lessons From the American Experience (1993)</i>	371
	Questions and Comments on Constitutional Transitions	375
	Note on Historical Context in Constitutionalism: Incrementalism and Clean Breaks	376
C.	Constitutional Regime Change: Principle and Compromise in Eastern Europe	377
	Stephen Holmes & Cass R. Sunstein, <i>The Politics of Constitutional Revision in Eastern Europe</i> , in <i>Responding to Imperfection: The Theory and Practice of Constitutional Amendment (Sanford Levinson, ed., 1995)</i>	379
	Questions and Comments on Entrenchment and Amendment	392
	Note on Amendments, Electoral Design and Abusive Constitutionalism: Hungary's New Constitution, 2010–12	394
	David Landau, <i>Abusive Constitutionalism</i> , 47 U.C. Davis L. Rev. 189 (2013)	395
	Questions and Comments	397
	Note: Transitional Justice and Constitutionalism	398
Chapter V. Constitutional Entrenchment, Courts and Democracy		409
A.	Constitutionalism Without a Constitution?	409
1.	The Constitution of the United Kingdom	410

S.E. Finer, Vernon Bogdanor & Bernard Rudden, <i>On the Constitution of the United Kingdom</i> , in Comparing Constitutions (1995)	410
Questions and Comments	421
2. Australia's Rejection of a Bill of Rights	426
Robert McClelland, Address to the National Press Club of Australia, April 21, 2010, http://www.pilch.org.au/Assets/Files/Launch%20of%20Australia's%20Human%20Rights%20Framework.pdf	438
Note: Rights Protection Without a Bill of Rights in Australia	443
Questions and Comments	445
B. Constitutionalism Without Entrenchment?	447
1. Dialogue and Legislative Override in Canada	449
Peter W. Hogg & Allison A. Bushell, <i>The Charter Dialogue Between Courts and Legislatures: (Or Perhaps The Charter Of Rights Isn't Such A Bad Thing After All)</i> , 35 Osgoode Hall L.J. 75 (1997)	449
Christopher P. Manfredi & James B. Kelly, <i>Six Degrees of Dialogue: A Response to Hogg and Bushell</i> , 37 Osgoode Hall L.J. 513 (1999)	458
Mark Tushnet, <i>Policy Distortion and Democratic Debilitation: Comparative Illumination of the Countermajoritarian Difficulty</i> , 94 Mich. L. Rev. 245 (1995)	460
Questions and Comments	469
2. Constitutional Entrenchment and Legislative Overrides in the United States	471
Katzenbach v. Morgan	472
City of Boerne v. Flores	478
Questions and Comments	484
C. Constitutional Review Without a Bill of Rights	486
Australian Capital Television Pty. Ltd. v. Commonwealth of Australia	486
Questions and Comments	493
Note on the Status of Basic Laws in Israel	495
Chapter VI. Constitutional Courts: Structure and Procedure	499
A. Structure and Function of Constitutional Courts: An Introduction	500
1. Centralized v. Decentralized Review; Hybrid Models; The Significance of Institutional Structure	501
2. The Possible Significance of Civil Law vs. Common Law Traditions	503
a. Civil Law Judges: Careerist vs. Recognition Models of Judicial Selection	503
b. Stare Decisis	504
3. Abstract vs. Concrete Review; Case or Controversy Limitations	504

4.	Development of Judicial Review in Europe: Constitutional Courts, Not Supreme Courts.....	505
	Wojciech Sadurski, <i>Constitutional Review in Europe and in the United States: Influences, Paradoxes, and Convergence</i> (February 2011) Sydney Law School Research Paper No. 11/15 (available at SSRN: http://ssrn.com/abstract=1754209).....	505
	Louis Favoreu, <i>Constitutional Review in Europe</i> , in <i>Constitutionalism and Rights: The Influence of the United States Constitution Abroad</i> (Louis Henkin & Albert J. Rosenthal eds., 1990).....	519
	Questions and Comments.....	527
5.	Hybrid Systems in Latin America and Elsewhere.....	528
	Allan-Randolph Brewer-Carías, <i>Judicial Review in Comparative Law</i> (1989).....	529
	Questions and Comments.....	533
	Note on Political Explanations for Judicial Review.....	534
B.	Structure, Composition, Appointment, and Jurisdiction	536
1.	Survey of Constitutional Courts, Jurisdiction and Composition.....	537
2.	The United States and the U.S. Supreme Court	537
	Henry Paul Monaghan, <i>The Confirmation Process: Law or Politics</i> , 101 Harv. L. Rev. 1202 (1988).....	542
	Lee Epstein, "A Better Way to Appoint Justices," <i>The Christian Science Monitor</i> (Mar. 17, 1992).....	545
	Questions and Comments.....	546
3.	France and the Conseil Constitutionnel.....	547
	John Bell, <i>French Constitutional Law</i> (1992).....	550
	Alec Stone, <i>The Birth of Judicial Politics in France: The Constitutional Council in Comparative Perspective</i> (1992).....	557
	Questions and Comments.....	564
4.	Germany and Its Federal Constitutional Court	565
a.	Historical Background	565
b.	The German Constitutional Court: Creation, Jurisdiction, Status.....	567
c.	The German Constitutional Court and the Appointments Process.....	575
	Donald P. Kommers, <i>Judicial Politics in West Germany</i> (1976).....	575
	Questions and Comments.....	583
5.	New Constitutional Courts of the 1990s: Eastern Europe, South Africa, Asia	584
6.	Latin American Courts	590
C.	Adjudicatory Procedures	591
1.	The United States Supreme Court: Procedure and Justiciability.....	593
	<i>Allen v. Wright</i>	595
	Questions and Comments.....	604

2.	France and the Conseil Constitutionnel.....	605
	John Bell, French Constitutional Law (1992)	605
3.	Germany's Constitutional Court	616
	Donald P. Kommers & Russell A. Miller, The Constitutional Jurisprudence of the Federal Republic of Germany (3d ed. 2012).....	616
	Questions and Comments.....	624
	Note on Supra-National Influence on the Structures of Judicial Review.....	625

Chapter VII. Constitutional Courts and Constitutional

	Adjudication	627
A.	Foundational Cases, Judicial Coups d'État, Incrementalism?	628
1.	Germany and the Southwest Case.....	628
	Southwest Case	629
	Notes [By Murphy and Tanenhaus].....	633
	Questions and Comments.....	633
2.	France, The 1962 Referendum Decision and the 1971 Decision on Associations.....	634
	Alec Stone, The Birth of Judicial Politics in France (1992)	634
	Declaration of the Rights of Man—1789	643
	Questions and Comments.....	644
	Alec Stone Sweet, <i>The Juridical Coup d'État and the Problem of Authority</i> , 8 German Law Journal 915 (2007) (on-line)	645
	Questions and Comments.....	646
3.	Israel: A Series of "Marbury's"? A Constitutional Revolution?	646
	Eli Salzberger, <i>Judicial Activism in Israel</i> , in Judicial Activism in Common Law Supreme Courts (Brice Dickson ed., 2007)	647
	Note on the West Bank and Gaza	658
	Gary Jeffrey Jacobsohn, Apple of Gold: Constitutionalism in Israel and the United States (1993).....	660
	Ronen Shamir, " <i>Landmark Cases</i> " and the Reproduction of <i>Legitimacy: The Case of Israel's High Court of Justice</i> , 24 Law & Society Rev. 781 (1990).....	670
	Questions and Comments.....	677
	Marcia Gelpe, <i>Constraints on Supreme Court Authority in Israel and the United States: Phenomenal Cosmic Powers; Itty Bitty Living Space</i> , 13 Emory Int'l L. Rev. 493 (1999).....	680
	Note on Mizrahi Bank and the Effects of Judicial Review of Statutes on Judicial Legitimacy	686
4.	Hungary and South Africa on the Death Penalty.....	688
	Note on Constitutional Review and Public Law, Domestic and International	690
	Martin Shapiro & Alec Stone Sweet, On Law, Politics and Judicialization (2002).....	691

Questions and Comments.....	692
B. Judicial Reasoning: Proportionality and Constitutional Texts	694
1. Canada.....	696
R. v. Oakes.....	696
Questions and Comments.....	700
2. Israel.....	701
Beit Sourik Village Council v. Government of Israel	701
Questions and Comments.....	715
3. The United States: Proportionality and Other Interpretive Methods	716
Hamdi v. Rumsfeld	717
Questions and Comments.....	733
4. Proportionality as a General Principle of Constitutionalism?	733
David M. Beatty, <i>The Ultimate Rule of Law</i> (2004)	733
Questions and Comments.....	734
5. Proportionality and the Possibilities and Limits of Comparison.....	735
Jacco Bomhoff, <i>Balancing the Global and the Local: Judicial Balancing as a Problematic Topic in Comparative (Constitutional) Law</i> , 31 <i>Hastings Int'l & Comp. L.Rev.</i> 555 (2008)	735
Questions and Comments.....	742
C. Judicial Legitimacy and Judicial Efficacy.....	742
Ruth Gavison, <i>The Role of Courts in Rifted Democracies</i> , 33 <i>Isr.</i> <i>L. Rev.</i> 216 (1999)	743
Comments and Questions.....	746
D. Justiciability, Judicial Activism, and the Effects of Different Forms of Judicial Review on Legislative Roles.....	747
1. India and Public Interest Litigation.....	748
Jamie Cassels, <i>Judicial Activism and Public Interest Litigation in India: Attempting the Impossible?</i> , 37 <i>Am. J. Comp. L.</i> 495 (1989)	753
S.P. Sathe, <i>Judicial Activism: The Indian Experience</i> , 6 <i>Wash. U. J. L. & Pol'y</i> 29 (2001).....	760
Questions and Comments.....	764
2. Constitutional Litigation and Courts' Relationship to Civil Society and Political Institutions.....	769
Mauro Cappelletti, <i>The Judicial Process in Comparative Perspective</i> (1989)	770
David Landau, <i>Political Institutions and Judicial Role in Comparative Constitutional Law</i> , 51 <i>Harv. Int'l L. J.</i> 319 (2010).....	771
Questions and Comments.....	791
3. Courts in Transitional Societies: Activism, Backlash and the Protective Function of Justiciability Limits?	791
a. Russia.....	792

Herbert Hausmaninger, <i>Towards a “New” Russian Constitutional Court</i> , 28 Cornell Int’l L. J. 349 (1995)	794
Questions and Comments	801
b. Pakistan	805
Note, <i>The Pakistani Lawyers’ Movement and the Popular Currency of Judicial Power</i> , 123 Harv L. Rev. 1705 (2010)	806
Questions and Comments	818
4. The Question of “Juridification”	821
Alec Stone, <i>Abstract Constitutional Review and Policy Making in Western Europe</i> , in <i>Comparative Judicial Review and Public Policy</i> (Donald W. Jackson & C. Neal Tate eds., 1992)	821
Questions and Comments	830

Chapter VIII. Separation of Powers: Governments, Courts and

Emergency Powers	833
A. Comparative Structures of Representative Government	833
B. Legislative and Executive Powers and Commitment to Hostilities	839
Judgment of the Second Senate of 7 May 2008 (AWACS II) (German Constitutional Court)	841
Lori Fisler Damrosch, <i>Constitutional Control Over War Powers: A Common Core of Accountability in Democratic Societies?</i> 50 U. Miami L. Rev. 181 (1995)	854
Questions and Comments	864
C. Legislative and Executive Power in Emergencies	867
1. Constitutional Texts and Emergency Powers	869
The Constitution of the Argentine Nation, 1994	869
The Constitution of the French Republic, 1958	869
The Constitution of the Italian Republic, 1947	870
The Spanish Constitution, 1978	870
The Constitution of the United States	871
2. Substantive Versus Separation of Powers Controls on Emergency Powers	875
Ex Parte Milligan	875
Public Committee Against Torture v. State of Israel	883
Questions and Comments	893
3. Constitutionalism and Emergencies	896
Oren Gross, <i>Chaos and Rules: Should Responses to Violent Crises Always Be Constitutional?</i> , 112 Yale L.J. 1011 (2003)	897
Questions and Comments	916
David Cole, <i>Judging the Next Emergency: Judicial Review and Individual Rights in Times of Crisis</i> , 101 Mich. L. Rev. 2565 (2003)	917
Questions and Comments	920

D. Emergencies, Foreign Affairs and Courts: Of Justiciability and Political Questions	921
1. "Political Questions" and Foreign Affairs in the United States	922
Goldwater v. Carter	922
Questions and Comments.....	927
2. Is There a "Political Question" Doctrine in Germany?	929
The Cruise Missile Case	930
Thomas M. Franck, Political Questions/Judicial Answers: Does The Rule of Law Apply to Foreign Affairs? (1992).....	934
Anne-Marie Slaughter Burley, <i>Are Foreign Affairs Different?</i> (reviewing Thomas M. Franck, Political Questions/ Judicial Answers), 106 Harv.L. Rev. 1980 (1993)	946
Questions and Comments.....	950
Chapter IX. Federalism: Power Sharing and Minority Protection.....	955
A. Federal Structure and Political Power: U.S., Canada, Germany, Switzerland and Europe.....	958
1. The United States	959
2. Canadian Federalism.....	960
Martha A. Field, <i>The Differing Federalisms of Canada and the United States</i> , 55 Law and Contemporary Problems 107 (Winter, 1992).....	961
Labatt Breweries of Canada Ltd v. Attorney General of Canada	969
Reference re Securities Act.....	975
R. v. Crown Zellerbach Canada Ltd.....	985
Questions and Comments.....	994
3. German Federalism	998
a. "Bundestreue" and the Legislative Competence of the Länder.....	999
The First Television Case (1961).....	999
Questions and Comments.....	1003
b. The Reserved Powers of the German Länder.....	1004
The Concordat Case	1005
Questions and Comments.....	1008
c. "Administrative Federalism," the Role of the Bundesrat, the "Bundesrat" Case, and Constitutional Reform	1009
d. Judicial Review of the Necessity of Federal Legislation in Areas of Concurrent Authority: Enforcing Subsidiarity?.....	1015
Geriatric Nursing Act Case (2002).....	1016
Questions and Comments.....	1019
4. Swiss Federalism	1020
Otto K. Kaufman, <i>Swiss Federalism</i> , in Forging Unity Out of Diversity: The Approaches of Eight Nations (Robert A. Goldwin, Art Kaufman, & William A. Schambra eds., 1989).....	1023

Thomas O. Hueglin, <i>New Wine in Old Bottles? Federalism and Nation States in the Twenty-First Century: A Conceptual Overview</i> , in <i>Rethinking Federalism: Citizens, Markets and Governments in a Changing World</i> (Karen Knop, Sylvia Ostry, Richard Simeon, & Katherine Swinton eds., 1995)	1030
Questions and Comments	1033
Note on Federalism and Finances	1040
5. Federalism, Centralization and Decentralization: The European Union and Subsidiarity	1046
George A. Bermann, <i>Taking Subsidiarity Seriously: Federalism in the European Community and the United States</i> , 94 Colum. L. Rev. 332 (1994)	1047
Ernest A. Young, <i>Protecting Member State Autonomy in the European Union: Some Cautionary Tales From American Federalism</i> , 77 N.Y.U. L. Rev. 1612 (2002)	1057
Matej Avbelj, <i>The Treaty of Lisbon: An Ongoing Search for Structural Equilibrium</i> , 16 Colum. J. Eur. L. 521 (2010)	1066
Questions and Comments	1070
Note on Federalism and Constitutionalism Beyond National Borders	1073
Frank Schorkopf, <i>International Decisions: Case Nos. 2 BvE 2/08, 2 BvE 5/08, 2 BvR 1010/08, 2 BvR 1022/08, 2 BvR 1259/08, and 2 BvR 182/09. 123 BVerfGE 267</i> (2009), 104 Am. J. Int'l L. 259 (2010)	1074
Questions and Comments	1077
B. Federalism and the Protection or Accommodation of Minorities: Canada, Belgium, Ethiopia, and the U.S.	1080
1. Canada	1081
Barry L. Strayer, <i>The Canadian Constitution and Diversity</i> , in <i>Forging Unity Out of Diversity: The Approaches of Eight Nations</i> (Robert A. Goldwin, Art Kaufman, & William A. Schambra eds., 1989)	1083
Ford v. Quebec (Attorney General)	1095
James Tully, <i>Strange Multiplicity: Constitutionalism in an Age of Diversity</i> (1995)	1107
Questions and Comments	1110
2. Belgium	1113
Robert Mnookin & Alain Verbeke, <i>Persistent Nonviolent Conflict With No Reconciliation: The Flemish and Walloons in Belgium</i> , 72 Law & Contemp. Prob. 151 (2009)	1113
Alexander Murphy, <i>Belgium's Regional Divergence: Along the Road to Federation</i> , in <i>Federalism: The Multiethnic Challenge</i> 73–100 (Graham Smith ed. 1995)	1130
Questions and Comments	1137
Note on Northern Ireland	1142
Note on Devolution in the United Kingdom	1143

3.	Ethiopia	1146
	Assefa Fiseha, <i>Federalism and the Adjudication of Constitutional Issues: The Ethiopian Experience</i> , 52 <i>Neth. Int'l L. Rev.</i> 1 (2005)	1151
	Questions and Comments.....	1155
	Note on the United States	1156
4.	Tolerance, Federalism and Liberalism	1158
	Mark Tushnet, <i>Federalism and Liberalism</i> , 4 <i>Cardozo J. Int'l & Comp. L.</i> 329 (1996)	1158
	Questions and Comments.....	1167
	Martha Minow, <i>Putting Up and Putting Down: Tolerance Reconsidered</i> , in <i>Comparative Constitutional Federalism, Europe and America</i> (Mark Tushnet ed. 1990).....	1169
C.	Federalism, the Assumption of State Boundaries, and the Limits of Law?.....	1179
	Reference re Secession of Quebec	1179
	Questions and Comments.....	1192
	Note on Conventions.....	1197
	Note on Democratic Constitutionalism and Multi-National Democracies.....	1199
	Questions and Comments.....	1204
	Chapter X. Pluralism, Rights, and Democracy	1207
A.	The United States and Race: Selected Constitutional Texts and Cases	1208
	<i>Grutter v. Bollinger</i>	1209
	Questions and Comments.....	1236
	Note on Affirmative Action in Education and Employment: <i>Bakke and Adarand</i>	1238
	<i>Regents of University of California v. Bakke</i>	1239
	<i>Adarand Constructors, Inc. v. Pena</i>	1250
	Note on the Use of Race in Drawing Voting Districts	1257
	Questions and Comments.....	1258
B.	Pluralism and Democracy: The Positive State and Affirmative Action in India.....	1259
1.	Background Readings on India: Caste, History and the Constitution.....	1260
	Ashwini Deshpande, <i>Affirmative Action in India</i> (2013)	1260
	Fali Sam Nariman, <i>The Indian Constitution: An Experiment in Unity Amid Diversity</i> , in <i>Forging Unity Out of Diversity: The Approaches of Eight Nations</i> (Robert A. Goldwin, Art Kaufman, & William A. Schambra eds., 1989).....	1261
	Sankaran Krishna, <i>Constitutionalism, Democracy, and Political Culture in India</i> , in <i>Political Culture and Constitutionalism</i> (Daniel P. Franklin & Michael J. Baun eds., 1994)	1276
	Questions and Comments.....	1283

2.	Indian Constitution, Selected Provisions on Equality.....	1285
3.	Compensatory Discrimination in India	1287
	Marc Galanter, <i>Law and Society in Modern India</i> (1989)	1287
	State of Kerala v. N.M. Thomas	1299
	Marc Galanter, <i>Law and Society in Modern India</i> (1989)	1318
	Marc Galanter, <i>Competing Equalities: Law and the</i> <i>Backward Classes in India</i> (1984)	1326
	Thomas Sowell, <i>Preferential Policies: An International</i> <i>Perspective</i> (1990)	1329
	Questions and Comments	1336
	Bhikku Parekh, <i>India's Diversity</i> , in <i>Dissent</i> 145 (Summer	
	1996)	1340
	Questions and Comments	1344
	Note on Citizenship	1347
C.	Pluralism, Group-Based Rights and Gender Equality	1349
1.	Constitutional Choices From a U.S. Perspective	1351
	Kathleen M. Sullivan, <i>Constitutionalizing Gender Equality</i> , 90 Calif. L. Rev. 735 (2002)	1351
	Questions and Comments	1358
2.	Gender Equality and Positive Measures	1359
a.	Employment	1359
	Marschall v. Land Nordrhein-Westfalen	1359
	Re Georg Badeck	1360
b.	Electoral Parity	1363
	Decision 82–146 DC of 18 November 1982	1363
	Questions and Comments	1365
c.	Other Gender-Based Preferences	1367
	President of the Republic of South Africa v. Hugo	1367
	Questions and Comments	1374
3.	Violence, Subordination and Duties to Protect	1374
	Martha I. Morgan, <i>Taking Machismo to Court: The Gender</i> <i>Jurisprudence of the Colombian Constitutional Court</i> , 30 U. Miami Inter-Am. L. Rev. 253 (1999)	1375
	Vishaka & Others v. State of Rajasthan & Others	1376
	United States v. Morrison	1378
	Questions and Comments	1379
4.	Gender, Religion, and Identity	1381
a.	Religious Identity and Gender Equality in India	1381
	Martha C. Nussbaum, <i>International Human Rights</i> <i>Law in Practice: India: Implementing Sex Equality</i> <i>Through Law</i> , 2 Chi. J. Int'l L. 35 (2001)	1381
	Mohd. Ahmed Khan v. Shah Bano Begum & Others	1382
	Questions and Comments	1385
b.	Gender Equality and Sexual Orientation	1387
	Vriend v. Alberta	1388
	Lawrence v. Texas	1391
	Comments and Questions	1394
	Note on Women, Constitution-Making, and	
	Participation	1397

Chapter XI. Religious Pluralism and Constitutional Law	1401
A. Introduction.....	1402
1. Constitutional Provisions	1403
Questions and Comments.....	1405
2. State Support or Supervision: Examples.....	1406
a. Israel	1406
Asher Maoz, <i>Religious Human Rights in the State of Israel</i> , in <i>Religious Human Rights in Global Perspective: Legal Perspectives</i> (Johan D. van der Vyver & John Witte, Jr., eds., 1996)	1406
b. Greece.....	1410
c. Germany	1410
d. United States.....	1411
3. An Analytic Framework	1412
W. Cole Durham, <i>Perspectives on Religious Liberty: A Comparative Framework</i> , in <i>Religious Human Rights in Global Perspective: Legal Perspectives</i> (Johan D. van der Vyver & John Witte, Jr., eds. 1996)	1412
Questions and Comments.....	1421
B. Problems of “Establishment”	1422
1. Religion and the Schools.....	1422
German School Prayer Case.....	1422
Questions and Comments.....	1426
German Classroom Crucifix Case II	1427
Questions and Comments.....	1437
2. Other Public Endorsement of (Arguably) Religious Practices.....	1441
a. Japan: Constitutional Texts and Cases	1441
Kakunaga v. Sekiguchi	1443
b. United States: Constitutional Text and Cases.....	1454
Lynch v. Donnelly.....	1455
Questions and Comments.....	1460
C. Problems of Religious Liberty and Cultural Preservation	1464
Wisconsin v. Yoder.....	1465
Questions and Comments.....	1474
A Bill titled ‘Provincial of the Teaching Sisters of the Holy Cross of the Third Order of Saint Francis in Menzingen of Sri Lanka (Incorporation)’	1477
Communication No. 1249/2004: Sri Lanka 18 November 2005	1481
Questions and Comments.....	1482
Makau Wa Mutua, <i>Limitations on Religious Rights: Problematizing Religious Freedom in the African Context</i> , in <i>Religious Human Rights in Global Perspective: Legal Perspectives</i> (Johan D. van der Vyver & John Witte, Jr., eds., 1996).....	1484
Questions and Comments.....	1486
Note: The Head-Covering Issue	1489

Chapter XII. Freedoms of Expression and Association	1495
A. Regulating Speech to Prevent Subversion or Other Forms of General Social Disorder.....	1496
1. Introduction to <i>Brandenburg v. Ohio</i>	1497
<i>Brandenburg v. Ohio</i>	1500
Questions and Comments.....	1502
2. Introduction to the <i>Wunsiedel</i> Case.....	1505
Order of the First Senate of 4 November 2009	1505
Questions and Comments.....	1521
B. A European Perspective on Free Speech/Free Press Freedoms.....	1525
Roger Errera, <i>The Freedom of the Press: The United States, France, and Other European Countries</i> , in <i>Constitutionalism and Rights: The Influence of the United States Constitution Abroad</i> (Louis Henkin & Albert J. Rosenthal, eds. 1990)	1525
Note: United States Doctrine on Some Issues Discussed by Professor Errera	1537
Questions and Comments.....	1537
C. Free Speech and Hate Speech, with Notes on Commercial Speech and Campaign Speech.....	1539
1. Canada.....	1539
Kent Greenawalt, <i>Free Speech in the United States and Canada</i> , 55 <i>Law & Contemp. Probs.</i> 5 (1992)	1540
<i>R. v. Keegstra</i>	1547
Questions and Comments.....	1578
Kathleen Mahoney, <i>The Canadian Constitutional Approach to Freedom of Expression in Hate Propaganda and Pornography</i> , 55 <i>Law & Contemp. Probs.</i> 77 (1992)	1583
Questions and Comments.....	1589
2. The United States	1590
<i>R.A.V. v. City of St. Paul</i>	1590
Questions and Comments.....	1605
Michel Rosenfeld, <i>Hate Speech in Constitutional Jurisprudence: A Comparative Analysis</i> , 24 <i>Cardozo L. Rev.</i> 1523 (2003).....	1611
Questions and Comments.....	1622
Note on Commercial Speech.....	1625
Note on Campaign Finance and Freedoms of Speech and Expression.....	1631
Note on Ultra Vires Review and Statutory Interpretation as Techniques for Protecting Free Expression	1633
D. Defamation and the Constitutional Protection of Expression	1635
1. The United States	1635
<i>New York Times Co. v. Sullivan</i>	1635
2. Great Britain, Australia, and New Zealand: The Common Law Tradition.....	1649
Questions and Comments.....	1652
3. Germany: The <i>Lüth</i> and <i>Böll</i> Cases.....	1653
The <i>Lüth</i> Case (1958).....	1654
The <i>Böll</i> Case (1980)	1660

Questions and Comments.....	1662
Chapter XIII. Constitutions and the Positive State	1669
A. State Action, Nongovernment Conduct and Rights.....	1669
Retail, Wholesale & Department Store Union, Local 580 v. Dolphin Delivery Ltd.	1670
Notes on the State Action Problem.....	1674
B. Social Welfare Rights: An Introduction.....	1691
1. Introduction: Selected Constitutional Provisions	1692
a. Irish Constitution (1937) (Selected Provisions).....	1693
b. Italian Constitution (1948) (Selected Provisions)	1693
Questions and Comments	1695
2. Judicial Enforcement of Social Welfare Rights.....	1697
a. Substantive Approaches to Enforcement of Social Welfare Rights.....	1698
Asahi v. Japan (1967).....	1698
Dandridge v. Williams	1701
Questions and Comments	1703
Minister of Health v. Treatment Action Campaign	1705
Questions and Comments	1715
b. Procedural Approaches to Social Welfare Rights.....	1718
Government of the Republic of South Africa v. Grootboom.....	1718
Questions and Comments	1731
Questions and Comments	1740
Mark Tushnet, <i>State Action, Social Welfare Rights, and the Judicial Role: Some Comparative Observations</i> , 3 Chi. J. Int'l L. 435 (2002)	1740
Richard A. Epstein, <i>Classical Liberalism Meets the New Constitutional Order: A Comment on Mark Tushnet</i> , 3 Chi. J. Int'l L. 455 (2002)	1745
3. The Debate Over Including Social Welfare Rights in Eastern European Constitutions: Hungary in 1995 as a Case Study.....	1747
Hungarian Benefits Case	1748
Questions and Comments.....	1758
András Sajó, <i>How the Rule of Law Killed Hungarian Welfare Reform</i> , East European Constitutional Review, vol. 5, no. 1 (Winter 1996), p. 31.....	1759
Kim Lane Scheppele, <i>Constitutional Courts in the Field of Power Politics: A Realpolitik Defense of Social Rights</i> , 82 Tex. L. Rev. 1921 (2004)	1768
Questions and Comments.....	1775
4. General Considerations and Two Case Studies	1777
Cass R. Sunstein, <i>Against Positive Rights</i> , in Western Rights? Post-Communist Application (András Sajó ed., 1996).....	1777
Wiktor Osiatynski, <i>Social and Economic Rights in a New Constitution for Poland</i> , in Western Rights? Post-Communist Application (András Sajó ed., 1996)	1780

Frank B. Cross, <i>The Error of Positive Rights</i> , 48 UCLA L. Rev. 857 (2001)	1790
Octavio Luiz Motta Ferraz, <i>Social and Economic Rights: Harming the Poor Through Social Rights Litigation: Lessons from Brazil</i> , 59 Tex. L. Rev. 1643 (2011)	1790
César Rodríguez-Garavito, <i>Beyond the Courtroom: The Impact of Judicial Activism on Socioeconomic Rights in Latin America</i> , 89 Tex. L. Rev. 1669 (2011)	1796
Questions and Comments	1801
INDEX	1803