

# **Fundamentals of Permanent Establishments**

**Robert L Williams**



**Wolters Kluwer**  
Law & Business

# Table of Contents

<b>Abbreviations</b>	<b>xi</b>
<b>Foreword</b>	<b>xiii</b>
 <b>Chapter 1</b>	
<b>Historical Development of the Concept</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1 Origins in Domestic Law	2
1.2 First Treaty Appearance	3
1.3 First Period – Pre League of Nations	3
1.4 Second Period – League of Nations 1928 Model Treaty	6
1.5 Third Period – The 1943 Mexico Draft and the OECD 1963 Draft and 1977 Model	9
1.6 Fourth Period – The 1980 UN Model, Services PEs and E-Commerce	11
 <b>Chapter 2</b>	
<b>Elements of the Basic Definition: Fixed Place of Business</b>	<b>15</b>
2.1 Fixed Place of Business – The Assets PE	15
A. Character of a ‘Place of Business’	16
B. Geographic Fixation of the Place of Business – a Fixed Place	20
1. Basic Rule	20
2. Touring and Moving Target Rulings	22
C. Permanence of Business Operations – Minimum Duration, Recurrent and One Shot Ventures	24
1. Six Months Minimum Duration Cases	25
2. One Shot Ventures (Less Than 6 Months)	26
3. Recurrent Multi-Year Ventures	28
4. Beginning and Ending Dates	30
5. Deviations in State Practice	31
D. ‘At the Disposal’ of the NRE (Control of the POB by the NRE)	32
1. The OECD 1977 Commentary is Ambiguous	33
2. Use of Client Offices or Equipment	35

## *Table of Contents*

3. Home Office Cases	42
E. Whose Business is Conducted at the Place	44
1. Automated POB PEs	44
2. The Requirement that the Business of the NRE Be Conducted There	46
3. The Mere Leasing of Real or ICS Property Does Not Create a PE of the Lessor	47
4. Joint Venturers Who Are Not Partners or Dependent Agents	49
5. Attribution of Business of Subcontractors to Main Contractors	51
<b>2.2 'Prima Facie' Examples of a Fixed Place of Business</b>	<b>54</b>
A. An 'Office'	54
B. 'Place of Management'	57
1. Modes of Expression	58
2. A 'Place of Effective Management'	59
3. Management or Technical Expertise?	61
4. Ownership Distinguished	61
5. Requirement of Situs	62
6. Permanence	62
C. A 'Branch'	63
D. A 'Store or Other Sales Outlet'	65
E. 'Factory'	69
F. 'Workshop'	70
G. 'Warehouse'	71
1. American Warehouse Rulings	72
2. The UN Model Provision	73
3. US Treaties	74
H. Other Named Places	74
I. Agricultural and Timber Land	74
J. Rental Real Estate	76
K. Ships/Equipment/Containers/Race Horses	78
1. Substantial Equipment or Machinery Clauses	79
2. Computers and Servers	80
3. Logging and Other Equipment	81
4. The Race Horse Rulings	82
5. Net Leasing of Containers	85
6. Vending Machines, Servers and Other Automated Equipment	86
7. Semisubmersible Drilling Vessels	86
8. Other Ships	87
<b>2.3 Business Activity – What Is It?</b>	<b>87</b>

### **Chapter 3**

<b>Building Sites and Construction or Assembly Projects</b>	<b>89</b>
<b>3.1 Background</b>	<b>89</b>
<b>3.2 Building Sites</b>	<b>92</b>
<b>3.3 Construction Projects</b>	<b>92</b>
<b>3.4 Installation Projects</b>	<b>94</b>
<b>3.5 Assembly Project</b>	<b>94</b>
<b>3.6 Supervisory Activities</b>	<b>95</b>
<b>3.7 The Time Limit Exemption</b>	<b>99</b>
A. Stand-Alone Status of CAS PEs	99
B. Beginnings	102
C. Pre-design and Fabrication Outside the Source Country Does Not Count	103
D. Tacking of the Time Spent by Subcontractors	104
E. When Do Projects End? Interruptions and Post-Completion Work	108
<b>3.8 The Geographic Limits – Stand-Alone Projects vs Aggregation</b>	<b>109</b>
<b>3.9 Construction Projects Absent Treaty Provisions</b>	<b>113</b>

### **Chapter 4**

<b>Special Provisions for Mineral Extraction</b>	<b>115</b>
<b>4.1 ‘Mine’</b>	<b>115</b>
<b>4.2 ‘Oil or Gas Well’</b>	<b>116</b>
<b>4.3 ‘Quarry’</b>	<b>117</b>
<b>4.4 ‘Other Place of Extraction of Natural Resources’</b>	<b>117</b>
<b>4.5 Relation to Business Activity Requirement</b>	<b>118</b>
<b>4.6 Operations in Contiguous Waters</b>	<b>118</b>
A. Area of Operations	119
B. Subjects of the Provision	120
C. Stand-Alone vs Aggregated Offshore Drilling Projects	121
D. Bareboat Leasing and Renting	123

### **Chapter 5**

<b>Agency Permanent Establishments</b>	<b>125</b>
<b>5.1 Agency Permanent Establishments – The Parameters</b>	<b>125</b>
A. Exempt Preparatory and Auxiliary Activities	127
B. No Fixed Place of Business Needed	127
<b>5.2 Agency Distinguished from Principal to Principal Dealings</b>	<b>129</b>
A. Principals and Their Activities	131

## *Table of Contents*

<b>5.3</b>	<b>Dependent vs Independent Agents</b>	<b>133</b>
	A. Historical Evolution of the Concept	134
	B. Legal Independence	137
	C. Economic Independence	140
	D. The Clause 5 vs 6 Gap	143
<b>5.4</b>	<b>Authority to Conclude Contracts</b>	<b>144</b>
	A. General vs Specific Authority	145
	B. Authority in Respect of Conduct of the Business Proper	149
	C. Apparent and Implied Authority	150
	D. Regular Exercise of Authority	152
	E. Non Authorized Employees and Representatives	153
<b>5.5</b>	<b>Acting in the Ordinary Course of Their Business</b>	<b>154</b>
	A. Degree and Nature of Agent's Authority	155
	B. Acting in Ordinary Course	155
<b>5.6</b>	<b>Particular Agents</b>	<b>160</b>
	A. Managing Agents	160
	B. Brokers and General Commission Agents	160
	1. Securities Brokers	161
	2. General Commission Agents	162
	C. Purchasing Agents	164
	D. Insurance Agents	165
	E. Delivery Agents	167
<b>5.7</b>	<b>Commissionaires and the Relationship Between Independent Agents and Agency PEs</b>	<b>170</b>
	A. The Stand-Alone Status of the Independent Agent Exception	175
<b>5.8</b>	<b>Parent and Subsidiary</b>	<b>177</b>
 <b>Chapter 6</b>		
	<b>Preparatory and Auxiliary Activities and Places</b>	<b>183</b>
<b>6.1</b>	<b>'Storage'</b>	<b>186</b>
<b>6.2</b>	<b>'Display'</b>	<b>187</b>
<b>6.3</b>	<b>'Delivery'</b>	<b>188</b>
<b>6.4</b>	<b>'Goods or Merchandise'</b>	<b>189</b>
<b>6.5</b>	<b>'Maintenance of a Stock of Goods or Merchandise'</b>	<b>189</b>
<b>6.6</b>	<b>'Processing'</b>	<b>190</b>
<b>6.7</b>	<b>'Purchasing'</b>	<b>191</b>
<b>6.8</b>	<b>'Collecting Information'</b>	<b>192</b>
<b>6.9</b>	<b>'Preparatory' or 'Auxiliary' Activities</b>	<b>193</b>
<b>6.10</b>	<b>Representative offices</b>	<b>196</b>
<b>6.11</b>	<b>Combination of Activities</b>	<b>198</b>

## **Chapter 7**

<b>Permanent Establishments – Services and Secondments</b>	<b>201</b>
<b>7.1 An Introduction to Service PEs</b>	<b>201</b>
<b>7.2 The Services PE Provisions</b>	<b>202</b>
A. UN Model Provision	202
B. Optional OECD Commentary Provisions	202
<b>7.3 Criticism of Services PE Provisions</b>	<b>204</b>
<b>7.4 Prevalence of Service PE Provisions</b>	<b>207</b>
<b>7.5 Interpretation of the Services PE Provision</b>	<b>208</b>
A. The Meaning of ‘Services’	208
B. Services to be Rendered ‘in’ the Source State	209
C. The Time Test	212
D. Individuals Providing the Services – Secondment and Independent Contractor Issues	216
E. Same Project or Connected Projects	226

## **Chapter 8**

<b>Tax in the Cloud – The Permanent Establishment Concept and the Digital Economy</b>	<b>231</b>
<b>8.1 Background</b>	<b>231</b>
<b>8.2 Overview of Previous OECD Work on e-Commerce</b>	<b>234</b>
<b>8.3 Additional Guidance on e-Commerce</b>	<b>239</b>
A. OECD Guidance on e-Commerce	239
B. Case Law Guidance on e-Commerce	242
C. Implications for Cloud Computing	245
<b>8.4 The Way Forward</b>	<b>246</b>
A. Overview of Base Erosion and Profit Shifting (BEPS)	246
B. Addressing the Challenges of the Digital Economy	247
C. Summary of the Potential Options to Address the Broader Tax Challenges Raised by the Digital Economy	249

## **Chapter 9**

<b>PE Issues Arising from Centralized Tax Models</b>	<b>251</b>
<b>9.1 Introduction</b>	<b>251</b>
A. Centralized Operating Models	252
1. Manufacturing	254
2. Sales	254
3. Development	255
4. Shared Services	256
5. Service Companies	256

*Table of Contents*

6. Procurement Companies	256
B. Common Issues Associated with Centralized Models	256
1. Binding of the Principal by the Local Entity: Legal vs Economic Binding	257
2. Creation of Dependent Agents	258
3. Full Business Cycles	259
4. Auxiliary Activities	261
5. Services	263
C. Design Implications of Article 5	264
1. Generic Design Implications	264
2. Specific Design Implications: Manufacturing and Sales	268
3. Manufacturing	268
4. Sales	269
<b>9.2 Conclusions</b>	<b>270</b>
 <b>Chapter 10</b>	
<b>Permanent Establishment and Partnerships</b>	<b>271</b>
<b>10.1 Limited Partnerships</b>	<b>272</b>
A. Common Law Countries	272
B. Civil Law Countries	273
C. Partnerships and Trusts as Limited Partners (Tiering)	275
<b>10.2 Natural Resource Partnerships</b>	<b>277</b>
<b>10.3 Non-Trading Partnerships</b>	<b>278</b>
<b>10.4 What is a Partnership?</b>	<b>279</b>
 <b>Bibliography</b>	<b>285</b>
Double-Taxation Conventions	285
Books and Key Articles	286
 <b>Table of Cases</b>	<b>289</b>
 <b>Index</b>	<b>293</b>